



UNIVERSITÀ
DEGLI STUDI
FIRENZE

FLORE

Repository istituzionale dell'Università degli Studi di Firenze

Additions to Smollett's Journalism: Further Attributions for the Critical Review, 1757-1763

Questa è la Versione finale referata (Post print/Accepted manuscript) della seguente pubblicazione:

Original Citation:

Additions to Smollett's Journalism: Further Attributions for the Critical Review, 1757-1763 / V.L. Wainwright. - In: NOTES AND QUERIES. - ISSN 0029-3970. - STAMPA. - 59: 2 (2012:(2012), pp. 226-247. [10.1093notesj/gjs050]

Availability:

The webpage <https://hdl.handle.net/2158/606250> of the repository was last updated on

Published version:

DOI: 10.1093notesj/gjs050

Terms of use:

Open Access

La pubblicazione è resa disponibile sotto le norme e i termini della licenza di deposito, secondo quanto stabilito dalla Policy per l'accesso aperto dell'Università degli Studi di Firenze (<https://www.sba.unifi.it/upload/policy-oa-2016-1.pdf>)

Publisher copyright claim:

La data sopra indicata si riferisce all'ultimo aggiornamento della scheda del Repository FloRe - The above-mentioned date refers to the last update of the record in the Institutional Repository FloRe

(Article begins on next page)

repeated infatuations. In the play, Belmont has fallen in love and offered all manner of love tokens as inducement to marriage to Emily Southerne little realizing that she was his niece, under an assumed character, whom he had never met. The age of 'over threescore' shows that it is clear that this reference is to Belmont, and that he is assumed to be acting so impulsively or 'shamefully' because of the effects of his grand climacteric upon him. It is possible to say with confidence, then, that this is not a reference to the menopause, since the subject is both male and over sixty: approaching the grand climacteric, the time that 'phisitians accounted so remarkable'. In this Belmont's behaviour is similar to many similar contemporary stories about men around their grand climacteric who become enamoured with and sometimes marry much younger women. Joel Wilbush appositely remarks that because the term climacteric was applied to men and women equally, 'References to the climacteric in the older literature should, therefore, always be carefully checked before it is assumed that they deal with the female climacteric'.¹⁴ Indeed, I would go further and suggest that these references should be checked to ensure that even if the subject is a female in her climacteric age, that the topic is menopause and not another climacteric event, probably to be a reference to the fear of the grand climacteric age of sixty three. Further, given the social values of decorum that increased throughout the eighteenth century and women's silence on their menstrual patterns, it is impossible to imagine a woman on the stage in the 1760s commenting upon her menopause.

SARA READ

Loughborough University

doi:10.1093/notesj/gjs048

© The Author (2012). Published by Oxford University Press.
All rights reserved. For Permissions,
please email: journals.permissions@oup.com
Advance Access publication 30 March, 2012

**ADDITIONS TO SMOLLETT'S
JOURNALISM: FURTHER
ATTRIBUTIONS FOR *THE CRITICAL
REVIEW*, 1757–1763**

SMOLLETT's prodigious capacity for reviewing books covering a wide variety of topics pertaining to the arts and sciences can be discerned from the lists of his articles for 1756, which derive principally from Archibald Hamilton's records in his annotated copy of *The Critical Review*. For the first six months, a total of 44 articles has been given to the writer in Volume 1, with 39 for Volume 2.¹ By the time the last part of Volume 7 was published, Smollett was complaining to John Harvie that 'If I go on writing as I have proceeded for some years, my hand will be paralytic, and my brain dried to a snuff.'² For Volumes 6 and 7 the total of attributions, including those given here, brings Smollett's contributions up to 30 and 25 articles respectively. A similar workload was sustained for Volumes 8 and 11, with provisional totals of 35 and 38 articles for each volume. In a letter to John Moore, while denying that he wrote the review of Home's *Douglas*, Smollett remarks that 'I did not write one article in that whole Number'.³ Yet 22 reviews have now been attributed to him for that volume, which was compiled at the time Smollett was also 'involved in [his] History of England and different Provinces of the Universal History'.⁴

Surveying the articles attributed to Smollett here, we note that he continued to devote attention to authors whose work he had previously written about in other reviews (including John Hill, William Harris, Elizabeth Carter, William Hillary, John Newbery, Charles Johnstone, John Cleland, and Jonas Hanway), with further substantial articles on

¹ See James G. Basker's attributions in *Tobias Smollett: Critic and Journalist* (Newark, 1988), Appendix A, 220–3. For attributions to later volumes see, Valerie Wainwright, 'Smollett's Journalism: New Attributions for *The Critical Review*, 1757–1766', *N&Q*, lvii (2010), 524–45.

² *The Letters of Tobias Smollett*, ed. Lewis M. Knapp (Oxford, 1970), Letter 67, 85.

³ *The Letters*, Letter 41, 58–9.

⁴ *The Letters*, Letter 42, pp. 59–60. Martz attributed twelve reviews of the *Modern Part of an Universal History* to Smollett. See Louis L. Martz, 'Tobias Smollett and the Universal History', *MLN*, lvi (1941), 1–14.

¹⁴ 'What's in a Name?', p. 2. Somewhat confusingly Wilbrush uses the term 'climacteric' for menopause in his writing.

volumes 5 and 6 of Laurence Sterne's *Tristram Shandy* and on the continuation of David Hume's *History of England*. As in previous lists of attributions (those compiled by Basker and Wainwright), there are several articles on works by French authors on a variety of different topics: Charles Louis Liger, *A Treatise on the Gout*, CR 9, 283–88, Abbé Trublet, *Essais sur divers sujets de Littérature et de Morale*, CR 10, 473, Charles-François Tiphaigne de la Roche, *Giphantia*, CR 11, 109–11, Marmontel, *Les Charmes de l'Etude*, CR 12, 147–51, Montucla, *Histoire des Mathématiques*, CR 11, 141–53, and Mauduit, *Introduction aux Sections Conique*, CR 12, 71–72, Gaspard de Réal de Curban *La Science du Gouvernement*, CR 11, 323–27, and Duhamel du Monceau, *Des Semis et Plantations des Arbres*, CR 12, 70–71. There are grounds for thinking that Smollett also reviewed Jean-Jacques Rousseau's *Discourse upon the Inequality among Mankind*, CR 13, 107, which is discussed in the notes to CR 12, 147–51, and CR 13, 269–70.

A review of Smollett's own work, *The Continuation of the Complete History of England*, CR 3, 481–99, has previously been attributed to Smollett himself,⁵ and numerous and notable stylistic elements point to Smollett as the author of the review of a subsequent volume of this work, CR 12, 83–95.

A striking feature of Smollett's choice of topics to review emerges now with the considerable number of articles dedicated to mathematics and physics. He exclaimed upon the charms of science, claimed that 'creative power' was evinced in the best works, and often offered his own thoughts on or solutions to the problems discussed by an author (as in CR 12, 71–2). Less surprising is the attribution to him of reviews on historical subjects: Smollett continued to attack all works that criticized the conduct and character of Charles I. Although himself the author of satirical works, in a number of reviews he also attacked those satirists who had 'degraded human nature' by inspiring the reader with 'contempt, disgust and hatred of the species' (CR 6, 458–63; CR 11, 109; CR 12, 138). He even, it would now appear, ventured into the sphere of

architectural studies, roundly condemning *A Complete Body of Architecture*, by the well-established architect Isaac Ware (CR 4, 298–302, 426–32). Amongst the attributions listed here are yet more articles on Botany, Medicine, Voyages, Law, and Poetry, Plays, and Novels, plus the odd article on Religion.

The attributions proposed here are based mainly on recurring motifs and rhetorical devices, and distinctive examples of phraseology. Smollett rarely repeats himself exactly but provides variations on a theme or expression.⁶ Those articles which can be attributed with most confidence to Smollett (A), share expressions or idioms or devices with one or more of the following: his works of fiction, his poetry, his works of history, his letters, or articles in Volumes One and Two of *The Critical Review* (**), or reviews attributed to Smollett by Basker (B), or by Nangle for the *Monthly Review*. These appear in bold and italic: *run upon the scent*. Other articles (B) share significant and often colourful linguistic and rhetorical elements with those in category A. Such elements are marked in bold: **a diploma and a tie-wig**. While others (C), can be attributed to Smollett on the basis of comments to be found in the articles, some of which belong to category A. Expressions that are italicized occur in notable rhetorical displays, usually extended schemes of repetition. [W] refers to previous attributions to Smollett for *The Critical Review* given in Valerie Wainwright, 'Smollett's Journalism: New Attributions for *The Critical Review*, 1757–1766', *N&Q*, lviii (2010), 524–45.

Abbreviations of Smollett's works

FCF: *The Adventures of Ferdinand Count Fathom*; PP: *The Adventures of Peregrine Pickle*; RR: *The Adventures of Roderick Random*; HC: *The Expedition of Humphrey Clinker* (Penguin Books, 1967); SLG: *The Adventures of Sir Launcelot Greaves*.

Chronological listing

(A) CR 4, 27–35, William Wilkie, *The Epigoniad, a Poem*.

... *dragging its slow length along* through nine tedious books.

⁵ Wainwright, 'Smollett's Journalism', 525–6.

⁶ Wainwright, 'Smollett's Journalism', 524–45.

**CR 1, 'Preface' [B], which the work drags heavily along, like a huge mortified excrescence; CR 4, 471 [B], drags its slow length along.

- (B) CR 4, 298–302, 426–32, Isaac Ware, *A complete Body of Architecture, adorned with Plans and Elevations from original Designs*.

... those who delight in noise and parade, puffing in public papers, and impudent prefaces?

— **But true genius and modesty are inseparable companions—**

... the infallible Isaac Ware, a gentleman of English growth, but of the most happy genius, and the most fertile invention; of the truest taste, and the most profound understanding ...

... and having cleared away the rubbish from the works of Vitruvius ... a child of our author's own **begetting**.

CR 8, 208, and not the affected diffidence expressed in a preface, is the true characteristic of modesty; CR 8, 462, Modesty is the inseparable companion on true merit; CR 10, 388, But diffidence is the inseparable attendant on merit; CR 12, 15 [W], having cleared away the rubbish; CR 7, 432, Ridicule is a child begot upon Sensibility.

- (A) CR 4, 412–26, John Hill (ed.), *The Naval History of Britain, from the earliest Periods of which there are Accounts in History, to the Conclusion of the Year 1756. Compiled from the Papers of Captain George Berkeley*.

Nothing can be more vague, **flimsy, superficial**, and inane, than the nine first chapters ... *We know not whether most to admire* the futility or the assurance of the author ... But the work under our consideration, is **frothy**, superficial, incorrect, and unentertaining ... The composition of our historian's own weaving is cold, **spongy**, and unequal.

CR 5, 284, one of the most superficial, flimsy, whiffling performances; CR 6, 251 [W], the

flimsy talents, and superficial pen; CR 11, 323, not one of those spongy, flimsy productions; CR 13, 69, We know not whether most to censure the impertinence, or commend the excellencies of this strange, incongruous, whimsical performance; CR 13, 181 [W], We know not which most to admire, the poet or the friend; **CR 1, 321 [B], we know not whether most to admire; CR 9, 189 [B], we know not which most to admire, the indecency or the ignorance; CR 3, 24 [B], slimy, frothy, green and stenchy; CR 11, 198, seldom contain any thing but a little frothy declamation.

Smollett reviewed medical treatises where the terms frothy and spongy occur, as in CR 3, 24 [B], slimy, frothy, green and stenchy; CR 3, 542 [B], frothy phlegm; CR 8, 41, the fungous excrescences became so large and spongy, as to be.

- (A/C) CR 5, 283–92, R. Wallace, *Characteristics of the present political State of Great Britain*

We cannot assent ... We cannot subscribe ... We cannot believe ... We cannot allow ...

... one of the most **superficial, flimsy, whiffling** performances, that ever were countenanced by the public.

Letters, 75, 95: embark in a whiffling Lottery of Public Praise; CR 4, 412, Nothing can be more vague, flimsy, superficial, and inane; CR 6, 251 [W], the flimsy talents and superficial pen.

In *Roderick Random*, ch, 35, Smollett introduces a Captain Whiffle.

To oppose an argument of the author, the reviewer quotes several pages from Smollett's *History of England*, which he clearly knows very well.

- (A/C) CR 5, 320–6, William Harris, *An Historical and Critical Account of the Life and Writings of Charles I.*

... a **bespattered** character ... Mr Harris is as **the being of a summer's day** ... the author may in person conduct ... *ad vicum vendentem thus et odores*.

** CR 1, 96 [B], They revile, bespatter, and fasten upon each other; CR 7, 430 [W], the being of a summer's day; CR 8, 169 [W], beings of; CR 13, 450 [W], but as the being of a day; CR 11, 480 [W], *ad vicum vendentem thus et odores*.

Smollett reviewed Harris's *Life of Cromwell*, CR 12, 381–7 [W], and refers to that review here: 'in a former publication our author endeavoured to vilify and blacken the memory of the unfortunate Charles I, by a crude compilation from the inveterate enemies of that monarch; and now...'

(B) CR 6, 149–58, Elizabeth Carter, *All the Works of Epictetus, which are now extant, consisting of his Discourses preserved by Arrian, in four Books, the Enchiridion, and Fragments. Translated from the original Greek, with an Introduction and Notes by the Translator*.

Mrs Carter seems indeed to abound **as much in piety and goodness** as in knowledge and learning, and to be as good a christian as she is a scholar.

At the conclusion of the introduction, Mrs Carter speaks of her own performance with that **modesty and diffidence which always accompanies real merit**.

CR 13, 183 [W], Mrs Carter's verses, addressed to her father, shew as much the goodness of her heart as the fineness of her understanding; CR 4, 300, But true genius and modesty are inseparable companions; CR 8, 462, Modesty is the inseparable companion on true merit, and presumption on ignorance. Knowledge begets diffidence; CR 10, 388, But diffidence is the inseparable attendant on merit.

(A/C) CR 6, 223–6, Hugh Hamilton, *De Sectionibus Conicis Tractatus Geometricus*.

...that *sublime* part of geometry... which, before his time was **rugged** and difficult.

Professor Simson of Glasgow was the first modern, if we mistake not...

CR 11, 141, this sublime science; this sublime theory; CR 6, 441 [B], as a contrast to the

rugged path of argument; CR 6, 439 [B], the rugged path of didactics; CR 11, 53, the steeper ascents of rugged science.

The reviewer refers to his article on this work in CR 12, 71–2. Smollett refers to Robert Simson's *Essays* in a review of *The Philosophical Transactions*, **CR 2, 13–14 [B], and in a review of Homer's *Iliad*, which was printed at Glasgow in 1759. CR 3, 551 [B].

For Smollett's relations with Simson see Basker, *Tobias Smollett*, 236.

(A) CR 6, 254–8, Christian Uvedale (John Hill), *The Construction of the Nerves, and the Causes of Nervous Disorders practically explained... with plain Directions*.

The desire we have of **cherishing this faint bloom** of a diffidence we never before discovered in the Dr. obliges us...

**CR 1, 'Preface' [B], They have cherished with commendation the very faintest blooms of genius; **CR 2, 442 [B], that of our neighbours has been cherished like a delicate tree producing golden fruit; CR 7, 255, The first efforts of genius cannot be too much cherished. Modest worth is of so delicate a nature, that, like a tender plant, it must carefully be shaded from every rude blast.

(A/C) CR 6, 292–307, *The Case of the Royal Martyr considered with Candour: 1, George Coade, A Letter to a Clergyman, 2, Thomas Birch, An Enquiry into the Share which King Charles I had in the Transactions of the Earl of Glamorgan*.

...he will not without reluctance... run the least risque of incurring the imputation of envy and **ill-nature**... with a species of **mal-evilence** peculiar to themselves, raked into the ashes of the unfortunate monarch, who, in spite of such **virtue** as very seldom adorns a throne... Authors who have **run upon the scent** of obsolete scandal, with an appetite truly canine... like famished wolves in winter, prowling in church-yards and cemeteries, and tearing up the buried corpse from its grave... This invidious principle, cooperating with bigotry, prejudice

and ignorance, produces a total infatuation, impenetrable to all the efforts of sense, reason, and reflection... and all the *ill-natured* suggestions of prejudice and party-zeal... so as to furnish his antagonist **with a handle** to say... a vulgar, *insolent*, and illiterate set of *fanatics*, which overturned the hierarchy... such frantic zealots...

**CR 1, 42 [B], their own futility and ill-nature; **CR 2, 189, [B], some ill-natured wag; CR 13, 395 [B], possibly ill-natured and partial; CR 15, 313–14 [W], when he foams with ill-nature; disgraced with ill-nature; CR 6, 239 [W], like a staunch, experienced hound, has run upon the scent without flinching; PP, ch. 103, a babbler, tho' he cannot run upon the scent; *Complete History*, III, 232, Charles in his private character, exhibited a shining example of virtue, piety and moderation; 266, the malevolence of such a faction; 269, fanaticism and religious phrenzy; *Complete History*, III, 291, the insolence of the faction; *Letters*, 25, give the world a handle to believe; CR 12, 322 [B], afford a handle to the caviller; CR 4, 1–7 [W], any thing serves him as a handle.

There is reference to this work in CR 6, 484, here attributed to Smollett: *A Catalogue of the Royal and Noble Authors of England*, by Horace Walpole: 'had he likewise taken notice of another performance called "The Case of the Royal Martyr considered with candour"... he would have found all the charges contained in the other, fully and fairly refuted'.

(A) CR 6, 458–63, *Human Nature Surveyed by Philosophy and Revelation. In Two Essays*.

Amidst the present scarcity of books in pure and speculative science... The prejudices, the caprice... have *degraded human nature* below the brute creation... will inspire us with *contempt, disgust, and hatred of the species*... The man who, **like a jaundiced patient**, beholds... **tinctured with misanthropy and propensity to satire**, that disgraces the understanding... who had rather shew their penetration **in discovering the weakness**, than their good sense in improving the power, and advantages of humanity... **there seems an affectation in him of peculiarity**

which obscures his reasoning, and blunts the edge of his satire.

CR 11, 141, amidst the present dearth of scientific productions; CR 11, 109, rendering us dissatisfied with a condition... General satyrists are usually tinctured with a degree of misanthropy; they dislike the species for the faults of individuals... prying into the infirmities of human nature; CR 12, 138 [B], that tends to degrade human nature... render us dissatisfied with the species; CR 15, 57[W], They are become like unto a dropsical patient; CR 10, 154, He may aptly be compared to a lienteric patient; CR 13, 6, an affectation of critical peculiarity.

See note to CR 12, 147, for the use of 'an affectation of critical peculiarity' and 'an affectation of singularity'.

(A) CR 6, 463–75, Robert Dodsley, *Cleone: A Tragedy*.

... we may trace many instances both of **the pathos and the bathos**... If that be the case, what a fool the Stagyrite must have been... Nay, that silly *old woman* Aristotle, in his definition of a tragedy...

CR 8, 276, we have the *Pathos* and *Bathos* of storm painting; *Letters*, 95, 121, who is an old sordid Scoundrel, and an old woman into the Bargain; CR 4, 411[W], Nor is this the only passage that appears to be written by an old woman; CR 4, 469 [B], some thing more than the *ipsa dixit [sic]* of an old woman; CR 6, 241 [W], who... was himself an old woman; CR 7, 155 [B], though every old woman that reads her prayers can tell, that; CR 11, 410 [B], among the old women in Westminster.

The review terminates with the words: 'for, as often the head may sit in judgment against it, the heart will never fail to bring a verdict in its favour', while in the next review, CR 6, 475, *A Poetical Translation of the Elegies of Tibullus*, by James Grainger, attributed to Smollett by Basker, the reviewer writes 'he wrote not from the head, but from the heart'.

(C) CR 6, 483–90, Horace Walpole, *A Catalogue of the Royal and Noble Authors of England*

The article contains references to 'one H—s [Harris], a late puritanical scandal-monger',

the review of whose work on Charles I is here attributed to Smollett; CR 5, 320–26. There is also a reference made to ‘a book lately published by Mr Goodall’ on Mary Queen of Scots, to which Smollett refers in his review of Maitland’s, *The History and Antiquities of Scotland*, previously attributed to Smollett; CR 3, 193–209, 284–300 [W]. The reviewer remarks that: Goodall, ‘in our opinion, has proved the forgery of the letters in the casket’. The reviewer notes here that ‘it would have been more for the honour of his candour, had he [Walpole] likewise taken notice of another performance called ‘The Case of the Royal Martyr considered with Candour Etc’, in which performance he would have found all the charges contained in the other [*An Inquiry into the Share which King Charles I had in the Transactions of the Earl of Glamorgan*], fully and fairly refuted’. This suggests that Smollett also reviewed *The Case of the Royal Martyr considered with Candour*: CR 6, 292–307.

- (A) CR 6, 490–4, R. Drake, *An Essay on the Nature and Manner of Treating the Gout*.

That is, **gentle reader**... **Believe it, or no, reader**, we do assure thee... by **irrefragable arguments, and** indisputable facts... **Why, really Sir**, this, we must own... **You know, Sir**, you have professed... but from **the ipse dixit** of the proprietor.

Alas! that so humane...! *What piety! What goodness of heart! What generous patriotism... What a narrow escape... What infinite obligations... an essay*, obvious in intention, obscure in meaning; *an essay* which plainly discovers the narrow limits... *an essay* the scourge of common sense, and the essence of folly and effrontery...

CR 6, 478 [B], Reader, beware of your teeth... Please to take notice, reader; CR 6, 88 [W], if thou expectest, gentle reader; CR 6, 143 [W], Pray, gentle reader; CR 6, 244 [W], Thus, gentle reader, have we for thy sake; CR 6, 331[W], Pray, gentle reader, observe it; CR 8, 284–9 [W], think of that, reader; CR 9, 73, Gentle reader; CR 13, 140 [W], What think you, gentle readers... Would you believe it, readers; CR 7, 40 [B], irrefragable argument

and undoubted evidence; CR 7, 151 [B], Now, Sir, may we not apply; CR 4, 469 [B], some thing more than the *ipse dixit* [sic] of an old woman; CR 7, 156 [B], if you thought the *ipse dixit* of Mr Johnson sufficient; CR 10, 388, *ipse dixit*; Mr Umfreville says so.

- (A) CR 7, 14–22, Francis Maseres, *A Dissertation on the Use of the Negative Sign in Algebra*

Fronti nulla fides is an apophthegm equally applicable to books and to men... had favoured us with a **crabbed, dry**, and barren disquisition... our author is **rather a judicious than** neat mathematician.

CR 11, 2, *Fronti nulla fides*; CR 13, 1–2, rendered dry and crabbed, a subject; CR 14, 426 [W], crabbed theological jargon; CR 7, 1 [B], rather a valuable collection of materials than an elegant history; CR 7, 271 [W], rather a writer of genius than of erudition; CR 12, 390 [B], rather constitute the agreeable essayist than.

- (A/C) CR 7, 60–4, John Landen, *A Discourse concerning Residual Analysis*

... we constantly have a scanty harvest in science and true knowledge, while the **fungous** crop of romance, novel, and amusement, is without measure.

The term fungous is used in a medical context in Smollett’s review of *The Philosophical Transactions*, CR 4, 131 [B], forgive those fungous excrescences become so large and spongy.

There is a reference to Landen’s work in the review of Israel Lyons’s *Treatise on Fluxions*, here attributed to Smollett.

- (A/C) CR 7, 255–9, Israel Lyons, *A Treatise of Fluxions*.

The first efforts of genius cannot be too much cherished. Modest worth is of so delicate a nature, that, like a tender plant, it must carefully be shaded from every rude blast... unfold its tender blossoms.

**CR 1, ‘Preface [B], they have cherished with commendation, the very faintest bloom of genius... warmed into flavour; **CR 2,442 [B], that of our neighbours has been cherished like

a delicate tree producing golden fruit; CR 6, 254, The desire we have of cherishing this faint bloom of a diffidence we never before discovered in the Dr. obliges us; CR 8, 464, Let us therefore cherish every endeavour of the learned to reflect the least glimmering of light on its origin and rise.

The reviewer is evidently the same who wrote on John Landon's *Residual Analysis*, CR 7, 60–4, discussing a solution he suggests 'that the curious reader might compare it with Mr Landen's solution by the *Residual Analysis*, given in our Review for January; 257.

(A) CR 7, 520–9, William Hillary, *Observations on the Changes of Air... Barbados*.

As in every other liberal profession, so in physic, **good sense** is the most essential qualification in a practioner: more especially if he be seized with **the rage of commencing author**... where the size of **the peruke, the gravity of visage**, and the *profundity* of erudition help only to encrease the absurdity of the character, if unsupported by **good sense**, the most valuable of all possessions... we often catch him **tripping in** points of science...

**CR 2, 386 [B], rage of reflecting; CR 4, 469 [B], the rage of writing; CR 12, 358, the rage of publication; CR 12, 390 [B], the rage of philosophizing; CR 10, 204, Every man who has got a smattering in chemistry, a diploma, and a tie-wig, communicates his own importance to the world, by writing a treatise; CR 10, 455, It is not a tie-wig, a full-trimmed suit of black, a diploma, and a face replete with solemnity and self-importance, that constitute the physician; good sense, reading, and observation, are the foundation of medical sagacity; CR 7, 155 [B], Mr Johnson, the dictionary writer, has been caught tripping more than once; CR 8, 432 [W], have we caught you tripping?.

In the review of William Hillary's *The Nature, Properties and Laws of Motion of Fire*, CR 8, 432—here attributed to Smollett—the reviewer notes that: 'It is but a few months since we warmly recommended to our medical readers, a sensible performance by Dr Hillary on the epidemical diseases of the West-India Islands'.

(A/C) CR 8, 1–10, *The Genuine Remains in Verse and Prose of Mr Samuel Butler, author of Hudibras. With notes by R. Thyer*.

... into those **piddling** walks of pamphlet and polemical reading...

When we consider... But **when we view him**... When we see him... when he displays an equal knowledge... when he adapts reading to reasoning... we are apt to bewail...

PP. ch. 97, unless it happened to be some piddling affair; SLG, 57, such a peddling [piddling] thief as thee; CR 4, 334 [B], a poor piddler; Such a piddler; CR 8, 86, a piddling reader, it is certain; CR 3, 5–6 [B], when we consider Mr *Lisle*... when we view him... we cannot conceive.

The review contains references to previous articles in *The Critical Review*, CR 1, 42, and CR 3, 124, relating to T. Birch, *The History of the Royal Society of London*, both attributed to Smollett by Basker.

(A) CR 8, 84–6, Thomas Marriott, *The Twentieth Epistle of Horace to his Book, modernized by the Author of Female Conduct*.

... the great man with whom we are at present unhappily **embroiled**... but who can be calm when he calls us Bavius? yes, dear reader, he actually calls us all Bavius! Ah, little did we think, that while we censured the writer of *Female Conduct*, we were only raising the indignation of the author who took the two Gregories... and yet, **Oh ingratitude!**... **A piddling** reader, it is certain, might object...

CR 8, 154, That we may not, therefore, embroil ourselves; CR 8, 288 [W], thou hast—O shame!; CR 8, 432, O, Shameful ingratitude; PP. Ch. 97, unless it happened to be some piddling affair; CR 4, 334 [B], a poor piddler; SLG, 57, such a peddling [piddling] thief as thee; CR 8, 1–2, piddling walk of pamphlet and polemical reading.

Friedman lists this article as a possible work by Goldsmith, but remarks that 'since there is no clear internal evidence of his authorship, the ascription cannot be considered certain',

Arthur Friedman, *The Collected Works of Oliver Goldsmith* (Oxford, 1966), I, 185.

- (A) CR 8, 154–6, J. Wilkinson, *The Seaman's Preservation: or, Safety in Shipwreck*.

That we may not, therefore, **embroil** ourselves farther with a person of his **formidable** talents, *we shall* pass...original **flowers of expression**...

CR 8, 28 [B], That we may not again awake this formidable Targeteer's dormant indignation, we shall surpris; CR 8, 84, the great man with whom we are at present unhappily embroiled; CR 4, 469 [B], the following flower of composition; CR 8, 201 [W], rectitude or ingenuity of his expression...the following flowers; *Letters*, 15, those peculiar flowers of elocution which you poured forth.

As in other reviews, Smollett enlivens this one with lengthy and comic narratives: here the first relates the tale of 'Pesce Cola', the second provides an account of Francisco de la Vega.

- (A) CR 8, 276–84, Rev. John Lindsay, *A voyage to the Coast of Africa in 1758*.

We shall not dwell on *his flowers of expression*...Here again we have the *Pathos* and *Bathos* of storm painting.

CR 4, 469 [B], the following flower of composition; CR 8, 201 [W], rectitude or ingenuity of his expression...the following flowers; CR 8, 155, original flowers of expression; CR 6, 463, we may trace many instances both of the *pathos* and the *bathos*.

- (A/C) CR 8, 253–4, *The News-Readers Pocket book or a Military Dictionary*.

With the help of this small *Vade mecum*...by our ingenious and philanthropical Mr John Newbery, at the Bible and Sun in St Paul's church-yard...How will a **haberdasher of small ware**, or a dealer in chandlery, shine...how will your minor politicians stare...

CR 5, 369, useful vade mecum; CR 8, 391–2, may prove a useful vade mecum; CR 6, 213 [W], we would recommend to our philanthropical friend at the Bible in St Paul's churchyard; CR 11, 259, our good friend,

Mr Newbery; CR 13, 66, make the reader laugh and stare; CR 3,383 [B], haberdashers of small ware in writing.

As Basker notes, Smollett was indeed a friend of John Newbery.

- (A) CR 8, 373–9, The Magdalen Charity, *The Histories of some of the Penitents in the Magdalen House, as supposed to be related by themselves*.

...the book is almost desitute of that **naivetè**, **simplicity**, or nature, which, when present never fails to act as a charm...who **steps forth** upon the theatre of narration.

The design of it is *to caution...to snatch...to confirm those that waver...to encourage* and animate the innocent...*to awaken those that are fallen...and point out* to those...secure from all the storms of infamy and indigence...The stories are certainly *related with spirit...fraught with...enriched with-interpersed with* a variety of moral reflections...*whose bodies* are the haunts...*whose minds* are the repositories...*whose conversation* is nothing but a vile repetition of vulgar obscenity.

PP. ch. LXXXIX, a certain *naivetè* that was very pleasing; CR 6, 389 [W], our author commends for *Naivetè*, that is simplicity; CR 12, 150, endearing *naivetè*; CR 6, 231[B], hath stepped forth as.

RR, 44,II, started with...glowed with-gaped with...smiled with...trembled with-wept with;

CR 3,482 [W], patched with...swelled with...encumbered with...stiffened with.

- (A) CR 8, 418–19, *An Answer addressed to that heterogeneous Letter addressed to Dr Wessels*.

At present he would seem to be **an abortion** escaped from his cell...how crude and unformed must this literary brat have popt into light...this **puny bantling** has shewn his face...

Oh, thou disgrace to thy learned fire, is this thy logic?...*thou declarest...thou acknowledgest* thyself...and here, *O* matchless effrontery, *thou assertest*...to be **starving in a full periwig**...To do thee justice, we will

acknowledge, however, that there is some humour in that assemblage of medical figures *thou hast produced* at a consultation...

**CR 1, 98 [B], like the imperfect rudiments of nature in abortion; CR 6, 479 [B], supposititious bantling; CR 11, 394 [W], spurious bantling; CR 11, 449 [B], deformed bantlings; CR 12 236 [W], poetical bantling CR 3, 8 [B], starve in a tie wig.

CR 8, 288 [W], but thou, Will Verral, art intirely foreign and fantastic...thou hast even presumed...thou hast—O shame! dishonoured...thou hast, without remorse, plunged...thou hast embowelled...what dost thou deserve...Thou hast dared to mangle.

(A) CR 8, 432–47, William Hillary, *The Nature, Properties and Laws of Motion of Fire*.

It is but a few months since we warmly recommended... would not only pardon a liberty *taken with so much caution*... Instead of this, **oh, shameful ingratitude!** we find him bestowing hard names upon the critics, setting *Priscian* and purity of diction at defiance...to the dignity of **the heaven-born being**...only **the rage of** advancing something uncommon... Thus, we see our author *plunged into* a maze of error... and like a pretty miss, who has told her mamma a fib... *flounders on in mere despair*.

CR 8, 288 [W], O, shame; CR 8, 84–6, Oh ingratitude; CR 8, 28 [B], which we presumed to take up, survey, and manage with reverence and caution; **CR 1, 247 [B], hardly clear of Priscian's pate; CR 15, 17 [B], Priscian's pericranium; CR 7, 426–35[W], the being of a summer's day; CR 8, 169 [W], the beings of a season; CR 13, 459[W], are but as the being of a day; **CR 2, 386 [B], rage of reflecting; CR 4, 469 [B], the rage of writing; CR 8, 287 [W], such is thy rage for innovation; CR 12, 358, the rage of publication; CR 12, 390 [B], the rage of philosophizing; **CR 2, 104 [B], he plunges into a strange subterraneous fermentation; CR 9, 390, labyrinths...into which he plunges; CR 4, 150 [B], *and flounder on in meer despair*; CR 4, 470 [B], and flounder thus in seas of ignorance and obscurity.

(A) CR 8, 462–9, William Blackstone, *The Great Charter and Charter of the Forest*.

Modesty is the **inseparable companion** on true merit, and presumption on ignorance. Knowledge begets diffidence, as... *Let us therefore cherish* every endeavour of the learned to reflect the least glimmering of light on its origin and rise.

CR 4, 300, But true genius and modesty are inseparable companions; CR 6,153, Mrs Carter speaks of her own performance with that modesty and diffidence which always accompanies real merit; Diffidence is the inseparable attendant on merit CR 10, 388, But diffidence is the inseparable attendant on merit; **CR 1, 'Preface' [B], they have cherished with commendation; **CR 2, 442 [B], that of our neighbours has been cherished like a delicate tree producing golden fruit; CR 6, 254, The desire we have of cherishing this faint bloom of a diffidence we never before discovered in the Dr. obliges us; CR 7, 255, The first efforts of genius cannot be too much cherished.

(B/C) CR 8, 486–7, *The World Displayed, or a curious Collection of Voyages and Travels selected from the writers of all Nations*.

It is with pleasure we embrace every occasion of recommending our worthy friend, Mr J. Newbery, in St Paul's church-yard; to the attention of the publick...

CR 6, 213 [W], our philanthropical friend at the Bible in St Paul's Church yard; CR 8, 253, our ingenious and philanthropic friend, Mr John Newbery, at the Bible and Sun in St Paul's Church-yard; CR 11, 259, our good friend Mr Newbery. See note to CR 8, 253–4.

(A) CR 9, 65–7, *Sam Bourn, A Series of Discourses on the Principles and Evidences of Natural Religion*.

Does the **phlegmatic alderman** of some petty borough express his approbation of a discourse, immediately the curate swells with the thoughts of commencing author... *scrap's torn from*... and garnished with...by no means calculated to raise his fame as a **scholar, an orator, or a philosopher**.

CR 9, 289, should it enter the brain of a phlegmatic alderman; **CR 1, 98 [B], shreds, rags and remnants, pilfered from...torn away without art; CR 9, 275 [W], scraps and remnants torn from; CR 8, 391 [W], a scholar, an officer, and a gentleman; CR 11, 53, as a scholar, a philosopher, or a poet.

(B) CR 9, 276–83, James Ferguson, *Lectures in Select Subjects in Mechanics, Hydrostatics, Pneumatics, and Optics*.

There is something so **bewitching** in experimental philosophy, that...Whoever considers with due attention **the stupendous structure** Newton has erected...cannot but confess, that in fancy and **creative power**, he has rivalled Homer himself...

CR 5, 381 [B], There is a creative power in genius; CR 8, 366 [W], materials, to be fashioned into form by the hand of the artist...but the creative powers of Newton alone could build them into the stupendous monument we behold of this genius; CR 11, 65, the most bewitching art; CR 11, 144, to this bewitching science; CR 12, 164 [B] this stupendous undertaking.

(B/C) CR 9, 283–8, M. Charles Louis Liger, *A Treatise on the Gout*.

After **clearing the ground, and pulling every thing down** that obstructed his view, or impeded his design, the enterprising Frenchman **lays a new foundation** for the gout...or rather is it not the profound Mrs G—hs, whose indefatigable application to the business of criticism, has somewhat impaired her faculties, and brought her prematurely to the dotage of literature.

CR 13, 452 [W], although we think Mr Jones rather premature in his endeavours to pull down one fabric of science before he had collected the sufficient materials, and adjusted his plan for erecting another. At present he can scarce be said to have cleared the ground, and laid the foundation-stone.

Smollett's reviews occasionally contain hostile references to Mrs Griffiths, the wife of the proprietor of the rival *Monthly Review*: CR 4, 469 [B], To the Old Gentlewoman who Directs the Monthly Review; CR 8, 83 [B],

Pray Mr R—h G—s, or Madame G—, how dare you assume.

(A) CR 9, 289–96, John Gordon, *A New Estimate of Manners and Principles: Being a Comparison between Ancient and Modern Times in the three great Articles of Knowledge, Happiness, and Virtue; both with Respect to Mankind at large, and to this Kingdom in particular*. Parts 1 & II.

Should it enter into the brain of a **phlegmatic alderman** to open Pindar...this new estimator of manners, who seems fraught with too much conceit and academical sufficiency **to think with the rest of mankind**...our author goes farther, and proves irrefragably, that the ancients were but **pigmies** in history, poetry, oratory, ethics, war, and what not, to the moderns...in which, like Longinus, **he is himself the great sublime he draws**.

CR 9, 66, Does the phlegmatic alderman of some petty borough; **CR 2, 472 [B], a pigmy aspiring; CR 13, 445 [W], a conceited pigmy; CR 12, 151, he is himself the great sublime he draws; CR 12, 178, notions diametrically opposed to those of the rest of mankind.

(A) CR 9, 386–90, *An Essay on the Ancient and Modern State of Ireland*.

...through all his **extravagations**...when, **making a sudden turning**...through all the labyrinths of criticism...**into which he plunges** over head and ears, without dread or fear, **we shall take our leave**, by quoting...And never again to peruse such nonsensical bombast, is really the south pole of our desire, the **needle** which alone **can guide** us with temper **through the shoals, the quicksands**, and the hidden **rocks**, which every where obstruct our course in the boundless ocean of reviewing.

HC, 131, the extravagations of the multitude; CR 14, 190 [W], the extravagations of genius; CR 8, 82 [B], makes a sudden turning; **CR 2, 104 [B], he plunges into a strange subterraneous fermentation; **CR 1, 244 [B], Before we take our leave of him; CR 12, 160[W], and we shall take our leave of him with recommending; CR 13, 148 [W], we will therefore take our

leave of him; *Continuation of a Complete History*, I, 5, This is the guiding star by which he hath hitherto steered his dangerous course; the star whose chearing radiance has conducted him safe through the rocks of prejudice and the tides of faction; CR 10, 386, the guiding star amidst the shoals and rocks of inquests; PP.ch. CXII, with a stock of experience that would steer him clear of all those quicksands among which he had been formerly wrecked.

(B/C) CR 9, 419, Charles Johnstone, *Chrysal; or the Adventures of a Guinea*.

With a solid judgment and some genius, the author would be more regarded, **had he viewed nature in a more favourable light**...but we are shocked with the enormity of crimes, so monstrous and disgraceful to the human species.

CR 11, 115, he would, in our opinion, be a more amiable man...had he viewed human nature through a more favourable medium.

The reviewer is clearly the same one who wrote about the author's next production, *The Reverie; or a Flight to the Paradise of Fools*, CR 14, 440: 'In the account we gave of Chrysal, we hinted our disapprobation of the unfair prospect which he exhibited of human nature but we are sorry to observe, that instead of profiting by our advice, he has indulged more in this fantastic humour, and even cherished prejudice...to render mankind dissatisfied with the species, is to commit a real injury to society.'

(A) CR 10, 49–56, *The Parliamentary or Constitutional History of England*, vol. XXII

No period of the English History is more interesting than the eve of the restoration: *so many* changes in the government, *so many* contending interests, **such a variety of jarring schemes and projects, so much hypocrisy, cant, fanaticism**, and cunning...an *infatuated people*, all conspire...and mark it as the most extraordinary that occurs **in the annals of human nature**.

Continuation of the Complete History, I, 361, divided by jarring interests; CR 10, 162 [B],

the variety of dissonant and jarring opinions; *Complete History of England*, III, 387–88, the strangest compound of villany and virtue...that we find upon record in the annals of mankind...an army of fanatics and hypocrites; CR7, 521, such is the infatuation of mankind; CR 8, 162 [B], an infatuated populace.

(B/C) CR 10, 118–21, George Wallace, *A System of the Principles of the Laws of Scotland*.

... the law improved from a **dry, barren, and crabbed study**, to a fertile, rational and engaging science.

CR 7, 15, a crabbed, dry, and barren disquisition.

The reviewer would appear to be the same who reviewed *The Frederician Code*, CR 13, 1–12. See note to that review.

(B) CR 10, 153–4, *The Farmer's Complete Guide, through all the Articles of his Profession*

The treatise before us affords strong suspicions, that the art of agriculture, like every other art, is professed by hireling scribblers, who compose volumes of a *certain size*, for a *certain price*, of *uncertain merit*, that will produce a *certain profit* to the bookseller, proportioned to his knack at puffing, advertising etc. etc...

He may aptly be compared to a **lienteric patient**, who discharges whatever is taken into the body, crude, indigested, and scarce altered from its original state, owing to the vitiated and weakened **concoctive powers**.

CR 15, 57 [W], thy concoctive powers are too languid for the load of nourishment...thou art become like unto a dropsical patient; CR 6, 456, like a jaundiced patient.

(A/C) CR 6, 457, John Bevis, *An Experimental Enquiry concerning the Contents, Qualities, and Medicinal Virtues, of the Mineral Waters, lately discovered at Bagnigge Wells, near London*.

Every man who has got a smattering in chemistry, **a diploma, and a tie-wig**,

communicates his own importance to the world, by writing a treatise on the medicinal qualities of some obscure well, which he celebrates as superior to the Bath, Spa, and Bristol waters, and, indeed, to all the waters hitherto known... a critical examination of some silly inscription upon an old stone over the wells, and other matters equally important, with which he gratifies his own vanity in the display of much erudition and florid elocution.

PP.ch. XIII, and not one of them appeared without a ridiculous tye-perriwig; CR 3, 8 [B], starve in a tie-wig; CR 7, 520–21, where the size of the peruke, the gravity of visage; CR 10, 455, It is not a tye-wig, a full-trimmed suit of black, or a diploma.

Smollett makes sarcastic references to studies of inscriptions, which ‘will greatly tend to the illustration of history and the improvement of science’, in his reviews of *The Philosophical Transactions*, **CR 1, 536 [B], and **CR 2, 29 [B]: ‘We wish them all the success that the importance of the inquiry deserves, and hope that they will, in the course of their researches, discover the names of the good nurses who attended those soldiers in their last moments: a circumstance that would conduce alike to the elucidation of history and the satisfaction of the public’.

(A) CR 10, 386–8, Edward Umfreville, *Lex Coronatorio: or the Office and Duty of Coroners*.

... those gentleman, who seemed to have no **guiding star to direct their own course, amidst the shoals and rocks of** inquests... **This indeed is** talking with freedom... **But diffidence is the inseparable attendant on merit:** even the learned Mr Umfreville professes... the general plan of this **stupendous monument** of human knowledge and genius... they actually do differ, **ipse dixit**; Mr Umfreville says so, that’s enough... as we profess the **short line of our understanding** unable to fathom.

Continuation of the Complete History, I, 5, This is the guiding star, by which he hath hitherto steered his dangerous course; the star whose chearing radiance has conducted him safe

through the rocks of prejudice and the tides of faction; CR 9, 390, the *needle* which alone can guide us... the shoals, the quicksands, and the hidden rocks, which every where obstruct; CR 14, 435 [W], This is talking as a citizen; CR 4, 300, But true genius and modesty are inseparable companions; CR 8, 462, Modesty is the inseparable companion on true merit; CR 10, 388, But diffidence is the inseparable attendant on merit; CR 8, 366 [W], into that stupendous monument; CR 4, 469[B], some thing more than the *ipsa dixit* [sic] of an old woman; CR 6, 491, but from the *ipse dixit* of the proprietor; CR 7, 156 [B], if you thought the *ipse dixit* of Mr Johnson sufficient; PP, ch.CXI, that is a question which the deep sea-line of my understanding is not long enough to sound.

(A) CR 10, 455–60, John Cleland, *Institutes of Health*

It is not **a tye-wig**, a full-trimmed suit of black, **a diploma**, and **a face replete with solemnity** and self-importance, that constitute the physician; **good sense**, reading, and observation, are the **foundation of medical sagacity**, though the former may be deemed necessary signs to distinguish this magazine of health.

PP. ch. XIII, and not one of them appeared without a ridiculous tye-perriwig; CR 3, 8[B], starve in a tie-wig; CR 7, 520–21, As in every other liberal profession, so in physic, *good sense* is the most essential qualification in a practitioner... where the size of the peruke, the gravity of visage and the *profundity* of erudition, help only to encrease the absurdity of the character, if unsupported by good sense, the most valuable of all possessions; CR 10, 204, Every man who has got a smattering in chemistry, a diploma, and a tie-wig, communicates his own importance to the world, by writing a treatise on the medicinal qualities of some obscure well.

Smollett had reviewed other works by Cleland. See Basker, *Tobias Smollett*, 242–3, 258.

(A) CR 10, 473, Abbé Trublet, *Essais sur divers sujets de Littérature et de Morale*

... the author, **instead of seeming faint and exhausted by his long course, has acquired**

fresh vigour, and an accelerated rapidity of motion.

CR 12, 178 [B], instead of being exhausted by the tediousness of their labours, they acquire fresh vigour in their course; CR 11, 186, and after running a long course, appear vigorous, fresh, and unexhausted; CR 11, 324, that he will reach the goal unspent, unexhausted, and vigorous.

- (A) CR 11, 2–4, ‘An Enquiry into the Nature of Criticism, with regard to the Progress of Literature’

True criticism, aims at nothing else but the **diminishing the number of useless volumes**; first written by conceit, and afterwards purchased by ignorance... A little wit, and a great deal of *ill-nature*, will furnish the satyr-ist, but not the critic.

... *unawed by fear, uninfluenced by envy, and unmoved by passion.*

... abuse of title pages is come to such a pass that **fronti nulla fides... Sunt bona, sunt quaedam mediocria, sunt mala plura...**

... being *personally no man's enemy, no man's dependent, the votary of no sect, the tool of no faction...*

**CR 1, 42 [B], their own futility and ill-nature; **CR 2, 189 [B], some ill-natured wag; CR 11, 75 [B], an ill-natured; CR 12, 178, the ill-nature and impertinence of the author; CR 13, 395 [B], possibly ill-natured and partial; CR 15, 313 [W], foams with ill-nature; spirit disgraced with ill-nature; CR 12, 363, diminishing the number of useless volumes; CR 7, 14 *Fronti nulla fides*. The quotation cited in the ‘Preface’ to the ‘Monthly Catalogue’, CR 1, 480, entitled ‘To the Public’, which is probably by Smollett in his capacity as editor, begins, ‘Sunt bona, sunt quaedam mediocria, sunt mala plura. Mart.’. *Letters*, 108, 142, no Length of Time, no vicissitude of Life, no interruption of Correspondence shall ever be able to erase.

- (A) CR 11, 29–36, Henry Brooke, *The Earl of Essex: A Tragedy*

The author of the performance now before us, *hath*, in our opinion, *proceeded... He*

hath preserved... He hath moreover followed... He hath mended the diction...

... **retrenched superfluity**, rejected ridiculous rant, rhapsody, simile, and bathos... he has avoided that string of inflated epithets, **which float like blown bladders on the surface of sense**; that continued pleonasm or **tumidity**... rendering the whole dialogue **emphysematous** and disgusting.

CR 8, 288 [W], Thou hast even presumed... thou hast... thou hast... thou hast embowelled... thou hast dared; *Monthly Review*, 15, 657, retrenching superfluities; CR 13, 59, retrench his superfluities; CR 11, 476 [W], like a devoted cat, equipped with a number of blown bladders... a kind of emphysematous tumour; CR 11, 324, which float like air bubbles on the surface of a heated imagination; CR 12, 205 [W], strained, tumid, or unnatural.

- (A/C) CR 11, 53–62, Roger Joseph Boscovich, *De Solis ac Lunae Defectibus*, Book V

There could not be a more arduous undertaking than to couch the **sublime truths** of the Newtonian doctrine in numbers, equally flowing and harmonious. The subject indeed is truly great and poetical... nature has not divided by an impervious barrier, the flowery Parnassian lawns, from the steeper ascents of *rugged science*. **We are at a loss whether most to admire** the learned jesuit as a **scholar, a philosopher, or a poet**.

CR 6, 223, that sublime part of geometry; CR 11, 147, this sublime science... this sublime theory; CR 6, 226, which before his time was rugged and difficult; CR 6, 439 [B], the rugged path of didactics; CR 6, 441 [B], as a contrast to the rugged path of argument; CR 8, 391 [W], a scholar, an officer, and a gentleman CR 9, 67, a scholar, an orator, or a philosopher; CR 11, 396, like a scholar, a physician, and a philosopher; **CR 1, 321 [B], we know not whether most to admire; CR 9, 189 [B], we know not which most to admire, the indecency or the ignorance; CR 13, 180 [W], we know not which most to admire, the poet or the friend; CR 11, 99 [B], to the gentleman, the scholar, and the lawyer; CR 11, 122 [B], written with

the accuracy of a scholar, the candour of a gentleman, and the moderation of a Christian.

The work is referred to in a review of *The Philosophical Transactions*, CR 12, 25 [W]: ‘we find little more than . . . and indeed in his own notes to his elegant poem, De Solis ac Lunae Defectibus, vid. Critical Review for January 1761’, and another reference is made later: ‘for the reasons already specified in VIII article for Critical Review for the month of January last’. Other references to this poem occur in CR 11, 297, Ferguson’s *A plain Method of determining the Parallax of Venus*.

- (A) CR 11, 109–15, Charles-François Tiphaigne de la Roche, *Giphantia*

General satyrists are usually **tinctured with a degree of misanthropy**; they dislike the species for the faults of individuals . . . prying into the **infirmities of human nature** . . . it breeds conceit, pride, obstinacy, and peevishness in the mind of the owner. Though it is founded on good sense, it destroys . . . without dreading **some retribution** . . . Where is the advantage of **rendering us dissatisfied with a condition** which we are incapable of amending? but he would, in our opinion, be a more amiable man—**had he viewed human nature through a more favourable medium**.

CR 6, 459, tinctured with a misanthropy and propensity to satire, that disgraces the understanding; contempt, disgust and hatred of the species . . . rather shew their penetration in discovering the weakness, than their good sense; CR 9, 419, we are shocked with the enormity of crimes, so monstrous and disgraceful to the human species. The picture of the jesuits is strong, but as it exceeds what the utmost villainy can effect, the satyrist loses his aim; CR 12, 138 [B], genuine humour, manly sense and animated satire. We cannot, however, upon the whole, approve any design that tends to degrade human nature, arraign the justice of Providence, render us dissatisfied with our existence, and to ridicule the moral and physical oeconomy established in the world by the author of our being; CR 14, 440, few are willing to confess without retaliation . . . dissatisfied with the species; CR 9, 419, the author

would be more regarded, had he viewed nature in a more favourable light.

- (A) CR 11, 141–53, M. Montucla, *Histoire des Mathematiques*.

. . . to this **betwitching science** . . . How different from the lucubrations of the profound *academicians* and *fellows* of the present age upon corals, **butterflies**, **cockle-shells**, toad-stools, and hermaphrodites, the monsters, **the minutae and excrescences of nature** . . . Descartes **the most creative** and whimsical **genius** of his age . . . this **sublime science** . . . **his sublime theory** . . . **amidst the present dearth** of scientific productions.

CR 9, 276, There is something so bewitching in experimental philosophy, that we cannot be surprised; **CR 1, 410 [B], or engaged in delineating reptiles and classing cockle-shells; **CR 2, 481 [B], and his mates be distinguished by cockle shells; CR 4 137 [B], what a pity it is, that the world was not favoured with a complete catalogue of all the shells; CR 7, 530 [B], and trifling collector of shells and butterflies; CR 8, 367 [W], a virtuoso indefatigably laborious in collecting shells, insects, and the minutae of nature, which he examines, and classes with the utmost gravity; CR 9, 277, in fancy and creative power, he [Newton], has rivalled Homer himself; CR 6,223, that sublime part of geometry; CR 11, 53, the sublime truths of the Newtonian doctrine; CR 6, 456, Amidst the present scarcity of books in pure and speculative science.

This review is a continuation from CR 10, 468, where the reviewer, probably Smollett, remarks: ‘Here we imagine, we shall be able to shew him defective, as a mathematician, and historian, misled by attachment, and biassed by prejudice; this, however, we shall defer to our next Number.’

- (A/C) CR 11, 169–85, *The Modern Part of an Universal History*, vol. XXVII

. . . detractors of his fame, and **nibbling critics**, whose baleful breath would blight that glory which ought to be sacredly transmitted to the latest prosperity.

‘Reproof’, lines 124–25, shoals of smaller fry/
That nibble round, pity and defy; CR 3, 402–12

[W], nibblers in criticism; CR 11, 75 [B], to the confusion of all such nibblers CR 12, 138 [B], other nibblers at his reputation.

Martz attributed twelve reviews of the *Modern Part of an Universal History* to Smollett. See Louis L. Martz, 'Tobias Smollett and the *Universal History*', *MLN*, lvi (1941), 1–14.

(A) CR 11, 186–98, Frances Sheridan, *Memoirs of Miss Sidney Bidulph*

...and after running a long *course*, *appear vigorous, fresh, and unexhausted*.

We cannot but wish she may continue to exert those talents, *so honourable* to herself, *so useful, so entertaining* to society, and particularly, *so beneficial* to the republic of letters.

CR 12, 178 [B], instead of being exhausted by the tediousness of their labours, they acquire fresh vigour in their course; CR 10, 473, instead of seeming faint and exhausted by his long course, has acquired fresh vigour, and an accelerated rapidity of motion; CR 11, 324, that he will reach the goal unspent, unexhausted, and vigorous.

CR 13, 65, so nervous...so clear...so original and energetic...so strikingly marked...so conspicuous; CR 20, 24 [W], so instructive...so just...so useful.

(A) CR 11, 198–200, Charles Bulkley, *Sermons on Public Occasions*

Sermons on *public* occasions seldom contain any thing but a little *frothy* declamation...every *puny* whipster in divinity thumbs his concordance...looks over his political creed...comes out with a flaming sermon...which, like a cracker just let off, *bounces a little* time from hand to hand, and then is seen or heard of no more, unless you chance to meet with it at the pastry-cooks, or see it fluttering in the wind for a penny at the philobiblian's.

This is talking like a cool, dispassionate, sensible preacher.

CR 3, 24 [B], slimy, frothy, green and stenchy; CR 4, 420, frothy, superficial; CR 11, 1 [B], such puny stings; CR 11, 411 [B], such

a puny antagonist; CR 4, 161 [B], bounces and crackles; CR 16, 289 [W], bounce a little; CR 10, 386, This indeed is talking with freedom; CR 14, 435 [W], This is talking as a citizen.

(C) CR 11, 265–73, Hugh Smith, *Essays physiological and practical on the Nature and Circulation of the Blood and the Effects and Uses of Blood-letting*.

In this article, the writer refers to comments expressed in earlier reviews which have been attributed to Smollett by Basker:

'In the Reviews for December and January last, we had occasion to examine certain notions advanced upon this subject by Dr Battie [CR 11, 25–9] and the ingenious author of the *Theory and Practice of Chirurgical Pharmacy* [CR 10, 440–50]; we took the liberty of dissenting from both, and of offering an opinion, which appeared to us more consistent with observation and the laws of animal œconomy. This opinion, however, we are not ashamed to retract, upon perusing the theory laid down by Dr Smith, which indeed is no more than a composition of the doctrines advanced by Dr Whytt and Dr Haller.' 270.

(C) CR 11, 297–9, James Ferguson, *A Plain Method of determining the Parallax of Venus by her Transits over the Sun*.

The reviewer refers back to the views he had expressed in a previous article, here attributed to Smollett, CR 11, 53, *De Solis ac Lunae Defectibus*, Book V: 'As to the fact we join issue with our author, and have given our reasons in a preceding Number of the Review; but we think the difficulty arises from other causes than those assigned by Mr Ferguson, though his arguments prove likewise strong objections'; 299.

(A) CR 11, 323–7, M. Gaspard de Réal de Curban, *La Science du Gouvernement: Ouvrage de Morale, de Droit, et de Politique*.

This is not one of those **spongeous**, flimsy productions of the brain, recommended by a specious title page, a **flippant fluency**, and plausible false reflections, **which float like** air bubbles on the **surface of a** heated

imagination... but the agility and address with which he has cleared the most difficult paths, afford the utmost reason to hope that he *will reach the goal unspent, unexhausted, and vigorous.*

CR 4, 420, is cold, spongy, and unequal; CR 10, 385 [B], the stile is rapid and fluent, though sometimes flippant and unchaste; CR 11, 30, which float like blown bladders on the surface of sense; CR 11, 446 [W], what ever chances to float in his imagination; CR 12, 178 [B], instead of being exhausted by the tediousness of their labours, they acquire fresh vigour in their course; CR 10, 473, instead of seeming faint and exhausted by his long course, has acquired fresh vigour, and an accelerated rapidity of motion; CR 11, 186, and after running a long course, appear vigorous, fresh, and unexhausted.

(B/C) CR 11, 415, Richard Gardiner, *Memoirs of the Siege of Quebec. From the Journal of a French Officer.*

The military author of this performance is mistaken, if he imagines that the spirit and elegance of writing consist in being **tumid** and inflated. A lofty, **swoln, puffy** stile is generally supposed to cloak no meaning... We have on a former occasion applauded captain Gardiner's genius; and we now censure him with the more freedom because he errs voluntarily, and not from any deficiency of natural or acquired talents.

CR 12, 205 [W], without seeming strained, tumid, or unnatural; CR 11, 30, continued pleonasm or tumidity; CR 9, 113 [W], disappointed with swoln promises; CR 15, 57 [W], like unto a dropsical patient, tumid, swoln, and puffy.

The writer alludes to the review of *An Account of the Expedition to the West Indies*, CR 8, 386–9 [W].

(C) CR 12, 70–1, M. Duhamel du Monceau, *Des Semis et Plantations des Arbres, et de leur Culture.*

The reviewer refers to two earlier works by the author and to a work by John Hill, the review of which was attributed by Basker to Smollett: 'The latter work [by Duhamel] may faithfully be called the philosophy of plants,

and we have reason to believe[sic] it furnished the principal materials for a late *Vegetable System* [by John Hill, CR 8, 271–6], which we saw ushered into the world with all the pomp and confidence of an original undertaking; though this circumstance escaped us at the time that work made its first appearance'.

(C) CR 12, 71–2, M. Mauduit, *Introduction aux Sections Conique pour servir de suite aux Elemens de Geometrie de M. Rivard.*

In this article, the writer refers to an earlier work, the review of which is here attributed to Smollett, CR 6, 224: 'Here he confirms, by elegant and natural descriptions, what we some time since asserted in opposition to a late ingenious writer, that all the other conic sections may be as easily and conveniently described on a plane, as the triangle and circle.† Crit. Rev: Vol VI, p. 224, in the Review of Mr Hamilton's geometrical treatise on conic sections'.

(A/C) CR 12, 142–5, *A Complete History of the War in India, from the Year 1749 to 1761.*

... an impudent performance, plundered, without sense of shame... in a manner that insults common sense, irrefragably proves the vitiated taste of the public, and the utility of the Critical Review *to detect imposture, and pull of the mask from ignorance, hypocrisy, and presumption.*

**CR 1, 287 [B], Every author who writes without talents, is a grievance, if not an impostor... and every critic has a right to detect the imposition; **CR 2, 'Preface' [B], they [the Critical reviewers] desire to be at perpetual war with pride, insolence, and presumption.

The reviewer notes that 'all the transactions from the year 1749... are servilely copied from the Modern Universal History', a work with which Smollett was closely associated. Moreover, the reviewer continues by referring to a work, the review of which has been attributed to Smollett, CR 11, 348–54 [W]: 'notwithstanding, the author might have consulted Colonel Lawrence's journal in Mr Owen Cambridge's late publication, which is the best, the latest, and indeed the only authentic

account of the campaigns on the coast of Coromandel'; 144.

- (A) CR 12, 147–51, M. Marmontel, *Les Charmes de l'Etude: Epître aux Poètes*.

...we think Mr Marmontel's poetical merit greatly diminished by an **affectation of critical peculiarity**... We must certainly then impute it to *an affectation of singularity*, which every day corrupts and poisons the best disposed minds, and the finest understandings... a poet resembling Gay in simplicity, innocence, and **that endearing naïveté**, which rendered him the delight of all his acquaintance... he is elevated with the subject, and *is himself the great sublime he draws*.

H.C. 197, strangely misled by an affectation of singularity; **CR 1, 343 [B], notwithstanding that affectation of singularity, that runs thro' the whole performance; CR 5, 135 [B], partly from an affectation of singularity; see also CR 4, 386 [B], CR 6, 502 [B]; CR 8, 373, destitute of that *naïveté*, simplicity, or nature which when present nevers fails to act as a charm; CR 9, 289, in which like Longinus, *he is himself the great sublime he draws*.

According to the reviewer, this work reveals both 'an affectation of critical peculiarity' and 'an affectation of singularity'. The latter reproach occurs frequently in Smollett's articles: **CR 1, 343[B]; it is used against Voltaire, CR 4, 386[B], and against Helvétius, CR 6, 502 [B]. This defect is also mentioned in the review of Rousseau's *Discourse upon the Inequality among Mankind*; CR 13, 107: 'infatuated by caprice and the affectation of peculiarity'. Other reviews of works by Rousseau have been attributed to Smollett, and hence it may well be that the review of the *Discourse on Equality* is also by him: CR 11, 65–6 [W], CR 12, 203–11 [W], CR 14, 250–70, 336–46, 426–40 [W]; CR 15, 21–34 [W].

- (A) CR 12, 178–82, *Thoughts on Continental Connections by Marriage. In a Letter to a Friend*.

The first reflection which occurs on the perusal of this motley production, squeezed from the dregs of exhausted genius, respects

the ill-nature and impertinence of the author... the froward, fanatic, headstrong, rebellious spirit of the nation... **that strange infatuation of republican principles**, which had poisoned the minds of the people-charged with such a variety of new-coined words... this curious author hath thought proper *to enrich the English language*... talents which he sacrifices to affectation, caprice, and a desire of instructing his countrymen... in notions diametrically opposite to those of **the rest of mankind**.

**CR 1, 42 [B], their own futility and ill-nature; CR 11, 2, a great deal of ill-nature will furnish the satyrist; CR 13, 395 [B], possibly ill-natured and partial; CR 15, 310–14 [W], he foams with ill-nature; CR 10, 49, an infatuated people; CR 9, 31, this infatuated and wretched people; CR 2, 36 [B], this author's genius in improving and enriching his mother-tongue; CR 9, 289, to think with the rest of mankind.

- (A) CR 12, 267–78, James Wilson, *Mathematical Tracts of the late Benjamin Robins*.

... leaving it a moot point whether his other friend, Dr Pemberton, had not been the literary *hussar*, and Mr Robins only the receiver of the plunder... **Say you so**, Mr Bougainville! Cast your eyes on... who, though a man of genius, was to him but a *pigmy* in geometry.

**CR 1, 227[B], are a kind of ferocious hussars; CR 6, 245 [W], like a hussar, plundered the gardens; CR 8, 285 [W], Did you so, master William; **CR 2, 474 [B], nothing can be more ludicrous than a pigmy; CR 13, 446 [W], a conceited pigmy.

The detailed commentary on 'Dr Wilson's Remarks on some Passages of the *Critical Review*, for October 1761', CR 13, 274–83, which includes an appreciation of the work of Smollett's friend Dr Simson, was most probably written by Smollett, as it finishes with the expression, 'and now we take our leave of the remarker': **CR 1, 244 [B], before we take our leave of this author; CR 4, 7 [W]. And thus we take our leave of Mr H.—; CR 13, 148 [W], we will therefore take our leave of him.

- (A) CR 12, 283–95, Tobias Smollett, *Continuation of the Complete History of England*. Vol.1

Malignity is ever inventive, and dullness may be impelled to active resentment; *the insect* to which nature hath designed *a sting, will buz and defile* with its *filthy* slime . . . to vent that poison which would burst the heart in empty hisses; and we expect to behold *swarms* of those caterpillars preying upon every leaf, until they are reduced to their former torpidity by the chilling blast of contempt. The same gentleman who hath been accused of damning works *which he never saw*, will now be charged with bestowing that self-applause which *he never uttered* . . . where all the powers of imagination were required **to keep the attention awake** . . . so artfully interwoven his reflections *with the texture of the narrative*, that . . . the following reflection breathes the true spirit of **candour, good sense, and** public spirit.

There are clear echoes of the same sentiments in Letter 67 (*Letters*, 85): ‘I have been abused, reviled, and calumniated for satires I never saw; I have been censured for absurdities of which I could not possibly be guilty’; RR, 2:1: ‘I have been found guilty of robbing orchards I never entered, of killing cats I never hurted, of stealing gingerbread I never touched, and of abusing old women I never saw’; CR 11, ‘Preface’ [B], he has been insulted in public abuse, and traduced in private calumny by obscure authors whom he did not know, for criticisms he had not written on performances he never saw . . . Like insects of a summer’s day, they have buzzed and stung, and stunk, and expired; but like other vermin . . . such puny stings; **CR 2, 43 [B], a species of vermin . . . rise in the summer from the filthy bogs and marshes, fly, stink, sting, and perish . . . this venomous insect buzzes about; CR 11, 409 [B], to hum and buz, and sting, like a gad-fly; CR 13, 136 [B], to defile and disfigure our names; CR 13, 346 [B], when we reflect upon the swarms of illiterate retailers of physic, who buz round this metropolis; CR 3, 402 [W], keep our attention perpetually awake; CR 13, 61, and keep awake the attention; CR

15, 11 [W], so as to keep the reader’s attention awake; CR 12, 390 [B], every occurrence breaks the texture of the narrative; CR 13, 61, the writer’s candour, penetration, and good sense.

- (A/C) CR 12, 357–63, William Hillary, *An Inquiry into the Means of Improving Medical Knowledge, by examining all those Methods which have hindered, or increased its Improvement in all past Ages. To which is added, an Explanation of the Motion and Action of Fire, etc.*

In this article, the reviewer discusses two earlier reviews of works by the same author here attributed to Smollett.

When we meet with an idle performance, written by a well-meaning, good-natured man, it is with difficulty we can adhere to that candour which we owe to the public, and to our own reputation . . . he published a treatise on the indigenous diseases of the West India islands, in which he discovered a considerable portion of medical sagacity; and we recommended the performance with the warmest expressions of applause [CR 7, 520–29] . . . but sure enough, he soon began to dictate in philosophy as he had done in physic, and a treatise appeared on the nature and propensities of fire, which we found ourselves under the necessity of treating a little roughly [CR 8, 432]. Still, however, his doctrine had the merit of novelty, and we therefore spoke of it as a work that discovered genius, though, in our opinion, contradictory to the established axioms of natural philosophy. We are sorry to observe, that the doctor has now been seduced, by *the rage of publication*, to **deck himself with borrowed plumage** . . . Dr Hillary has taken the histories of physic written by **the learned** Dr Daniel Le Clerc, and the elegant Dr Friend . . . is **strangely mangled** in the delivery . . . but the duty which we owe the public obliges us to exert our utmost endeavours **to diminish the number of useless volumes** with which it is deluged.

**CR 2, 386 [B], rage of reflecting; CR 4, 469 [B], the rage of writing; CR 7, 520, seized with the rage of commencing author; CR 12, 390

[B], the rage of philosophizing; CR 15, 57 [W], even as the vain crow that decked herself in the gorgeous plumes of the peacock; CR 11, 141, the profound Leibnitz, the learned Barrow; **CR 2, 38 [B], it is miserably mangled and misplaced; CR 3,384[B], a miserable mangled translation; CR 8, 273[B], who have mangled the memory; CR 11, 2, diminishing the number of useless volumes.

(B/C) CR 13, 1–12, Jean-Henri-Samuel Formey, *The Frederician Code, or a Body of Law for the Dominions of the King of Prussia*.

Vice, when supported by power, is not to be controuled by laws, or chained down with the feeble shackles of wax and parchement...form such a **vast chaos of jargon**, absurdity, and contradiction...with crushing **this race of vermin, that existed only upon the sores and corruption of society**... rendered **dry and crabbed, a subject**...

CR 14, 440, general satirists are universally detested and despised as vermin who breed in the sores of society; CR 7,14, crabbed, dry, and barren disquisition; CR 14, 426 [W], crabbed theological jargon.

For this review, Smollett has borrowed ideas expressed in the review of George Wallace's, *A System of the Principles of the Laws of Scotland*, CR 10, 118–121, here given to Smollett. In that review Wallace is quoted: 'In the same manner...these are the seeds out of which the system grows, and contain in embryo all conclusions deducible from them'. In his review of *The Frederician Code*, Smollett notes that: 'The plan on which the Frederician Code is founded, may be deemed extremely scientific. A few original principles are laid down as the seeds out of which the system vegetates'. In CR 10, 119, Wallace is quoted: 'I have had occasion to make use both of the analytical and of the synthetical method...' Wallace refers approvingly to the method of Verulam. In his review of *The Frederician Code*, Smollett observes that: 'A kind of analytical reasoning is applied to ascertain the truth of principles; and, on the contrary, the conclusions are traced by the method of synthesis, agreeable to the rule

given by the great lord Verulum in all scientific investigations'.

Other echoes are to be found: the reviewer notes of Wallace's work that: '**the mind is charmed** with the **harmony** between the parts; conclusions are formed with **facility**...' In the review of *The Frederician Code* Smollett notes: 'The effect which this symmetry of parts produces on the mind is very extraordinary... We are insensibly and deeply engaged in the subject by the simplicity, and **the facility** with which conclusions arise from the principles. The dependence and **the harmony** of the parts strike forcibly; and the **reader is charmed** to find that all the mysteries of a profound science... in a single perusal'.

Whereas in the review of Wallace's work, the reviewer claimed that 'the law [is] improved from a **dry, barren and crabbed** study, to a fertile, rational, and engaging science', he now observes [CR 13, 6] that: 'Something in this way was proposed by an ingenious young gentleman of our own country, a few years since; but the logical manner and expression which he used **rendered dry and crabbed**, a subject otherwise flowing easy, curious, interesting, and familiar, in the method treated here'.

(B) CR 13, 53–8, J. Delap, *Hecuba, a Tragedy*.

... so **poor and contemptible** a figure...and prejudice the Greeks (**which, by the bye, is** a suspicion ridiculous enough in *Ulysses*)... *Kingly spousals* is, we think, a **vile phrase**, and so is *youngling*.

CR 13, 138–48 [W], at Naples, he saw (he tells us) that tremendous fiery mountain *Visuuous* (which, by the bye, is a mountain we never yet heard of.); CR 13, 356: for a poor and more contemptible performance, we do not remember; CR 13, 249 [W], this poor and contemptible translation (or rather burlesque) of him; CR 13, 358, *Apt to slips and failures*, is, as Polonius says, a vile phrase, a very vile phrase indeed, and certainly not English; **CR 1, 234[B], The royal banner (*which by the bye, he could not unfold in the service of Venice*) and; CR 13, 509 [B], which (by the bye) we do not believe.

- (A) CR 13, 58–65, David Hume, *The History of England, from the Invasion of Julius Caesar to the Accession of Henry VII.*

They pretended to hold the Frenchman in the light of a mere painful compiler of materials, who had dug from the **mine the ore** which they were to purify and refine...**retrench his superfluities**...elegant **uniformity of texture**...the **unruffled rapid** narrative...

He compares circumstances *so* accurately, pierces with *so* keen a glance...*so* collective, just and striking a point of view... The parts are well combined; they **glide gently into each other**, like the lights and shades in painting...it therefore requires all the powers of genius to sustain the subject, **and keep awake the attention**, through so long a narrative of transactions...

...the diction is *so* nervous, the disposition *so* clear, the reflections *so* original and energetic, the characters *so* strikingly marked, without being overcharged; and the writer's **candour**, penetration, and **good sense** *so* conspicuous that we...

CR 7, 206 [W], and separated the precious metal from the crude ore in which it is buried; *Monthly Review*, 15, 657, 'Plan of a complete History of England', retrench his superfluities; CR 6, 100 [B], retrenching the superfluities; CR 12, 390 [B], that unruffled rapidity which forms one of the great beauties of history; CR 3, 402 [W], by gliding, as it were, insensibly into each other; CR 3, 402 [W], keep our attention perpetually awake; CR 12, 289, to keep the attention awake; CR 15, 11–13 [W], so as to keep the reader's attention awake; CR 12, 292, candour, good sense, and public spirit.

Basker attributed the earlier reviews of Hume's *History of England* or *History of Great Britain*, to Smollett: CR 2, 385–404, CR 7, 289–303. Here the reviewer refers to these volumes: 'In the two preceding publications of this history, he evinced himself the friend only of virtue...he boldly attacked vice, and unmasked hypocrisy...nor was his praise distributed with less impartiality: even Cromwell's self was allowed just tribute'.

- (A) CR 13, 66–9, Laurence Sterne, *The Life and Opinions of Tristram Shandy*, Vols V & VI.

Here we find *the same* unconnected rhapsody, *the same* rambling digression...

The rest of the book is filled with fine things to make the reader laugh and stare, and wonder *with a foolish face of praise*...

Rabelais dealt in *the same* kind of *haberdashery*. *His wit* was as bright, *his satire* as keen, and *his humour* as powerful... He had *his* extravagant rhapsodies, *his* abrupt transitions, *his* flux of matter, *his* familiar apostrophes, *his* disquisitions on arts and sciences...*his* Hebrew...*his* decent allusions...and *his* cleanly comments on intemperate exonerations.

... sounds uttered by the winding of a jack, *the filing of a saw*, and the grinding of a pair of scizzars... *We know not whether most* to censure the impertinence, or commend the excellencies of this strange, incongruous, whimsical performance.

CR 8, 44 [B], Here the reader will find the same revolution of dull annals, the same recapitulation of unimportant and uninteresting incidents, the same diffusion and languor of style; PP, ch. 102, listen *with a foolish face of praise*; CR 3, 384 [B], haberdashers of small ware in writing; CR 8 254 [B], a haberdasher of small ware; **CR 1, 174 [B], imitate the filing of a saw; CR 4, 94 [B], as dissonant as the filing of a saw; **CR 1, 321 [B], we know not whether most to admire; CR 9, 189 [B], we know not which most to admire, the indecency or the ignorance; CR 11, 53, We are at a loss whether most to admire; CR 13, 180 [W], we know not which most to admire, the poet or the friend.

- (C) CR 13, 269–70, John Gordon, *A New Estimate of Manners and Principles, ... Of Happiness, in which some Principles of Mr Rousseau are examined*. Part III.

... some of them are pertinent, though, upon the whole, the author appears to Rousseau as a dwarf climbing up the knees of a colossus'.

CR 7, 156 [B], like a puny dwarf mounted on the shoulders of a giant.

The reviewer of Part 3 refers to the review of Parts 1 & 2, CR 9, 289–96, here given to Smollett, and discusses the author's point of view, as well as his criticisms of some 'Principles of Mr Rousseau' in the *Discourse on Inequality*, 'of which we lately gave an account'. It seems probable therefore that Smollett also reviewed Rousseau's *Discourse*. See note to CR 12, 147–51.

(B) CR 13, 356–8, Richard Stainsby, *A Sermon preached at St Clement Danes, on Sunday 17th of January 1762. Occasioned by the Death of... Rev. Dr Thomas Hayter.*

...for a poor and more contemptible performance, we do not remember... *Apt to slips and failures*, is, as Polonius says, a **vile phrase**, a very vile phrase indeed, and certainly not English... 'We present not, (says Mr Stainsby) this mournful *accident* before you, (meaning the bishop's death) to excite your *curiosity* (what *curiosity* can there be in a man's dying?) or draw forth your tears. In some respects it is a *mixture* (a *mixture* of what? **good dear unintelligible writer** inform us)... and **would you believe it, readers**, the king has actually done what Mr *Stainsby* promised.

CR 13, 141 [W], Would you believe it readers, that... How happened it, dear chevalier, that; CR 6, 490, That is gentle reader... Believe it nor no, reader; CR 13, 58, so poor and contemptible a figure... *Kingly spousals* is, we think, a vile phrase, and so is *younging*, CR 13, 249 [W], this poor and contemptible translation (or rather burlesque) of him; CR 7, 145, 151[B], Unless you can prove to the contrary, good, wise Dr Grainger; Do you then really think, good, wise, modest Dr James Grainger, that...

Smollett adopts the same technique of the interpolated parenthesis in CR 13, 138–48 [W], at Naples, he saw (he tells us) that tremendous fiery mountain *Visuvous* (which, by the bye, is a mountain we never yet heard of,) he saw... those very elephants (surprising, that a man should see an elephant!)... (a gentleman

whose name we not not remember)... (singular enough indeed!).

(B/C) CR 14, 206–11, Jonas Hanway, *Serious Considerations on the salutary Design of the Act of Parliament for a regular, uniform Register of the Parish-Poor Infants in all the Parishes within the Bills of Mortality. In two Letters.*

While other politicians are planning schemes for the destruction of the human species, and contending for power and pre-eminence, **the benevolent Mr Hanway** is wholly occupied in pursuing the dictates of a heart overflowing with tenderness for his fellow-creatures, and **love for his country**... whether he assumes the character of the historian, the journalist, the projector, the philosopher, or the legislator. In all these different capacities we have had occasion to bestow our applause on Mr Hanway, and to esteem those labours which others have regarded as the absurd effects of enthusiasm... Our author has a method of writing peculiar to himself, which we cannot commend, at the same time that it engages our esteem for his person. It is **too rhapsodical** to be coercive and frequently too sublime to be altogether intelligible... demonstrative of the author's benevolence and **public spirit**.

Smollett had already reviewed other works by Hanway, and in this review refers to Hanway's great personal qualities and the flaws of his style. References to Hanway in reviews by Smollett include the following comments: CR 4, 3 [W], he thinks it expedient to treat us with a rhapsody; CR 8, 200 [W], the author's patriotic spirit; CR 10, 44 [W], the benevolent author of this performance; CR 11, 442–44 [W], that unbounded benevolence which marks every line of the performance in review... it gives the writer the air of a mere rhapsodist... universal good will and philanthropy seem alone the spurs to his industry, while vanity, ambition, and avarice, are the secret springs of action in other men... in a manner that reflects credit on his humanity and public spirit... a humane benevolent mind.

(A) CR 14, 385–90, John Fielding, *The Universal Mentor: containing Essays on the most important Subjects in Life*.

... an ill-digested collection of apophthegms and stories... **strung together** without taste or judgment... it is obtruded so abruptly, **head and shoulders** on the reader, as must convey an unfavourable opinion of the author's powers of conviction.

**CR 1, 83 [B], which by the bye, is thrust in by the head and shoulders; **CR 1, 234 [B], famous soliloquy is introduced by the head and shoulders; CR 7, 154 [B], But your lugging in Mr Francis by the head and shoulders; CR 13, 42 [W], strung together like the beads.

(A/C) CR 14, 440–5, Charles Johnstone, *The Reverie, or a Flight to the Paradise of Fools*.

A man of virtue ought besides to reflect, that to render mankind **dissatisfied with the species**, is to commit a real injury to society... these **ill-natured** writings... as **vermin who breed in the sores of society**, or hypocrites who insinuate their own purity, by aspersing and defiling the rest of mankind... and **the affectation of being thought singular**.

CR 6, 456, contempt, disgust, and hatred of the species; CR 11, 109, where is the advantage of rendering us dissatisfied with the species; CR 12, 138 [B], render us dissatisfied with the species; **CR 1, 42 [B], their own futility and ill-nature; CR 11, 2, a great deal of ill-nature will furnish the satyrist; CR 13, 395 [B], possibly ill-natured and partial; CR 15, 310–14 [W], he foams with ill-nature; CR 13, 1–12, this race of vermin, that existed only upon the sores and corruption of society; HC, 197, strangely misled by an affectation of singularity.

The reviewer is the same as that of the author's earlier work, Chrysal [CR 9,419], 'In the account of Chrysal, we hinted our disapprobation of the unfair prospect which he exhibited of human nature but we are sorry to observe, that instead of profiting by our advice, he has indulged more in this fantastic humour, and even cherished prejudice.' 440.

(A/C) CR 15, 407, Edward Burnaby Greene, *The Tower: A poetical Epistle to John Wilkes, Esq.*

This rhapsody seems to come from the pen of the paraphrastical imitator of Juvenal's satires (see our last, p. 310)... The author, however, in this performance, not having the great satirist for his **polar star**, runs adrift, and partly splitting upon the shelves of wit, partly foundering in the depths of dulness, at every bounce, he discharges his pop-guns as signals of distress, at the government, lord Bute, and the Scots.

The review of *The Satires of Juvenal paraphrastically imitated* has been attributed to Smollett, CR 15, 310–14 [W]. For the same kind of marine imagery see: *Continuation of the Complete History*, vol. 1, 5, This is the guiding star; CR 9, 389–90; CR 10, 386–88, who seemed to have no guiding star to direct their own course.

VALERIE WAINWRIGHT

University of Florence

doi:10.1093/notesj/gjs050

© The Author (2012). Published by Oxford University Press.

All rights reserved. For Permissions, please email: journals.permissions@oup.com
Advance Access publication 24 April, 2012

ATTRIBUTIONS OF AUTHORSHIP IN THE GENTLEMAN'S MAGAZINE, 1788–89: A SUPPLEMENT TO THE UNION LIST

THE following list consists of 89 new or corrected attributions of authorship of anonymous, pseudonymous, or incompletely signed letters, articles, obituaries, drawings, or staff notes appearing in the *Gentleman's Magazine* (hereafter *GM*) during the years 1788–89, when the magazine was under the joint editorial direction of David Henry (the *GM*'s second conductor) and John Nichols (his partner and eventual successor as third conductor upon Henry's retirement in 1791). It thus constitutes a further installment in my efforts to add supplementary finds to my *Attributions of Authorship in the Gentleman's Magazine, 1731–1868: An Electronic Union List* (hereafter