Contents

Linguistic Research

Defence Practice in the 18th and Early 19th Century Courtroom Discourse:
   Pickpocketing Cases at the Old Bailey
   Elisabetta Cecconi
   1587

A Demographic Analysis of Proverbs in Rotimi’s Historical Tragedies
   Omolara Kikelomo Owoye, Samuel Ayodele Dada
   1599

L2 Fluency and Willingness to Communicate: The Impact of Short-Term Study Abroad versus At-Home Study
   Melanie Lynn D’Amico
   1608

Variation and Change in Danish Nominal Morphology
   Michael Ejstrup
   1626

Analogical Levelling as Optimization in Greek Nominal Inflection:
   A Cross-Dialectal Case Study
   Dimitra Melissaropoulou
   1636

Reflecting Non-Verbal Cues in the Context of Crisis: The Fist and the Open Palm in Zimbabwe’s Political Crisis
   Umali Saidi
   1655

Teaching Theory & Practice

Code-Switching as a Strategy Use in an EFL Classroom in Taiwan
   WENG Pei-shi
   1669

Translation Research

The Study of Pragmatics in the Interpretation From Chinese Into English
   ZOU Jian-ling
   1676

Culture Research

The Unspoken Rules: Relation Management in the Brazilian Culture Within a Context of Conciliation Hearings
   Carolina Scali Abritta
   1682
Defence Practice in the 18th and Early 19th Century Courtroom Discourse: Pickpocketing Cases at the Old Bailey

Elisabetta Cecconi
University of Florence, Florence, Italy

In this paper, the author will investigate forms of defence employed by prisoners in pickpocketing cases presented at the Old Bailey from 1740 to 1820. The purpose is to show how defence patterns changed in courtroom discourse across the 18th and the early 19th century. In particular, the author is going to see: (1) How defendants managed their defence and to what extent their discourse practice affected the final verdict; and (2) How the prisoner’s role changed as a result of the introduction of the defence counsel and the development of the adversarial system. By drawing upon Bennett and Feldman’s (1981) classification of defence strategies in modern courtroom, the author will account for the techniques of defence used by defendants and lawyers inspecting similarities and differences. The results will reveal that male and female prisoners generally opted for the reconstruction strategy while lawyers privileged challenge and redefinition. In addition, defendants made a larger use of (negative) polar questions during cross-examination while lawyers mostly relied on declaratives, which exert a stronger control on the answer. In both cases, the defence strategies adopted did not significantly bias the outcome of the trial suggesting that other factors influenced the decision of the jury.

Keywords: pickpocketing cases, Old Bailey, courtroom discourse, forms of defence, 18th and 19th century

Introduction

The issue of legal justice has always been object of discussion among intellectuals and men of justice, in particular in the 17th century when the lack of legal assistance for defendants tended to exasperate the power imbalance between prosecution, which was permitted to have counsels and defence which was not. Contemporaries generally praised their legal system claiming that defendants did not need any assistance to prove their innocence and that in any case the judge was there to help them present their evidence in the best possible way. In A Treatise of the Pleas of the Crown published in 1721, Hawkins wrote that “any defendant of common understanding may as properly defend himself/herself as if he/she were the best lawyer” (p. 400). Indeed, “It requires no manner of skill to make a plain and honest Defence”. This principle ruled out the necessity of a defence counsel in criminal and felony cases. Indeed, judges agreed that if a defendant were innocent they ought to be able to demonstrate it for the jury by the quality and character of their reply to the prosecutor’s evidence.

For most of the 18th century, criminal defence was a sort of do-it-yourself altercation between the victim of
the crime acting as prosecutor and the citizen accused under the judge’s supervision. This procedure ascribed the prisoner an active role in the trial. For example, they were authorized to ask questions of the witness and prosecutor and could provide their defence in full at the end of the evidence phase. It does not follow, however, that prisoners were always capable of taking full advantage of their speaking rights. In several cases, in fact, they were brought to the bar without any preparation as to how to organise their defence and procure witnesses. Contemporary reports document that “They were often taken up to the court from the cells in an entirely bewildered state and returned shortly afterwards unaware of what had happened to them” (Hostettler, 2006, p. 156). It was even calculated that in the 19th century at the Old Bailey, the average time for each trial never exceeded eight and half minutes, suggesting that the defendant’s speaking time was all in all rather limited. Hostettler (2006, p. 156) reported that the chairman of one Old Bailey Session tried 16 prisoners in an hour on one occasion and eight prisoners in 20 minutes in another.

Even so, it is a fact that early modern prisoners were allocated at least one turn during the trial to make their defence clear to the judges. They were asked what they had to say about the evidence brought against them or if they had any questions to put to the Crown witnesses. This opened up a set of behavioural options for the defendant who could either venture into a defence or withdraw into silence. In either case, an investigation of their discourse behaviour helps our understanding the relationship existing between prisoner’s attitude and trial outcome in the 18th- and 19th-century courtroom. Some of the questions which the author will try to answer in the present paper are: What was the most frequent defence practice?; What was the most effective one?; Can silence be considered an effective form of defence? In order to deal with these issues, the author will restrict her inquiry to forms of defence employed by male and female prisoners in pickpocketing cases presented at the Old Bailey in the period from 1740 to 1820. The trials selected for analysis are all taken from the Old Bailey Proceedings available on-line. The author’s purpose is twofold: to identify common defence patterns in her database and see if they have changed in courtroom discourse across the 18th and the early 19th century. In particular, the author is going to examine: (1) How defendants managed their defence and to what extent their discourse practice affected the verdict; and (2) How their role changed as a result of the introduction of the defence counsel at the end of the 18th century.

Considerations About the Average Number of Verdicts for Property Offences in the Period 1660-1800

Beattie’s study on the verdicts reached in the Surrey courts in the period of the author’s concern can help establish a sort of normative trend within which the author’s findings can be inserted. In the period from 1660 to 1800, property offences (including robbery, burglary, certain forms of housebreaking, horse theft, and picking pockets) registered a higher number of guilty than not guilty verdicts (46.9 against 36.4) and a quite interesting percentage of partial verdict (16.7) suggesting that juries often tended to be lenient and find the offender guilty of a reduced crime. Indeed in several cases, jurors were reluctant to punish these offences, which were all capital, with death penalty and opted for some forms of mitigation. For pickpocketing cases, Beattie noticed that after 1660, they were no longer universally considered as deserving of hanging. His observation is confirmed by a quantitative investigation of the forms of punishment ascribed to pickpocketing cases presented at the Old Bailey from 1740 to 1820. A quick computer search of the on-line proceedings shows that only 4.1% of cases were
punished with death whereas in 82.8% of trials the offenders were punished with transportation and in the remaining 6% with imprisonment.

Beattie’s quantitative findings of verdicts in relation to property cases in Surrey are consistent with the author’s own findings for the category of pickpocketing cases at the Old Bailey (see Tables 1-2).

Table 1
*Trial Jury Verdicts in Property Cases in Surrey, 1660-1800 (Re-adapted From Beattie, 1986, p. 425)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verdicts No.</th>
<th>Not guilty</th>
<th>Guilty</th>
<th>Partial verdict</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Property cases</td>
<td>1,197</td>
<td>36.4%</td>
<td>46.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2
*Trial Jury Verdicts in Pickpocketing Cases at the Old Bailey, 1740-1820*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verdicts No.</th>
<th>Not guilty</th>
<th>Guilty</th>
<th>Partial verdict</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pickpocketing</td>
<td>1,669</td>
<td>34.0%</td>
<td>50.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Beattie investigated the rationale behind the jurors’ decision and identified two main persuasive forms of evidence which could lead to a guilty verdict: direct evidence, i.e., the identification of the accused by the victim and by eye-witnesses under oath, and circumstantial evidence, i.e., an accusation of guilt that the defendant was not able to explain. Acquittals, on the other hand, generally resulted from weak evidence and when it became clear in court that the defendants were victim of false charges. Finally, the considerable number of partial verdicts for pickpocketing cases was often determined by the jurors’ consideration of the punishments that would follow. In many cases, in order to reduce the harsh penalties connected to the crime, jurors could find the offender guilty of stealing but not privately from the person. At this point, it remains to be established if and to what extent the defence provided by the prisoner and—later on—by the counsel may have affected the final verdict in some way.

**Prisoners’ Defence System From 1740 to 1760**

In the first part of the analysis, the author will focus on the decades from 1740 to 1760. The trials selected for analysis are 165 and amount to 119,061 words. The prisoners’ discourse behaviour is investigated in relation to the gender variable. Table 3 shows the relative frequency of turn-taking, turn-length, and questions used by male and female defendants.

Table 3
*Distribution of Turn-Taking, Turn-Length and Questions in Female and Male Trials (1740-1760)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Turn-Taking</th>
<th>Female defendants (%)</th>
<th>Male defendants (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>More than 4 turns per trial</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>6.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-3 turns per trial</td>
<td>22.7</td>
<td>16.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No turns</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>23.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questions asked in cross-examination</td>
<td>30.3</td>
<td>36.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statements</td>
<td>69.6</td>
<td>63.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turn length: 1 to 4 lines (6-83 words approx.)</td>
<td>83.1</td>
<td>77.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turn length: 5 to 14 lines (84-290 words approx.)</td>
<td>16.8</td>
<td>22.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The findings show that women are more active than men as they take a higher percentage of turns per trial. Quite interestingly, men are those who mostly opt for silence during the trial, providing no defence at all. As Langbein (1978) claimed “The Old Bailey Session Papers report countless instances in which guilt was only nominally contested—where the accused is expressly said to make no reply or defences; or where no defence is mentioned in face of strong evidence” (p. 279). This passive behaviour however does not seem to be particularly detrimental to their cause as in 70.5% of the trials without a defence, the prisoner’s silence is followed by a not guilty verdict. Beattie (1986) too noticed that “Prisoners who could not respond immediately and speak off the cuff were not necessarily convicted” (p. 352). Table 4 suggests that speaking is not necessarily advantageous to the defendant and that jurors may have based their verdicts on different grounds.

Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Turn-Taking and Verdicts in Male Trials (1740-1760)</th>
<th>Guilty male (%)</th>
<th>Not guilty male (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No turns</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>41.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 turn (prisoner’s defence at the end)</td>
<td>58.1</td>
<td>37.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-3 turns</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 or more turns</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As we can see, the percentage of not guilty male defendants decreases in relation to the increase in the number of turns taken per trial. Similar results are found in women’s trials with only one exception represented by trials with four or more turns taken. In those cases, in fact, loquaciousness proved advantageous to the female prisoner who was found not guilty in 17.3% of the times against the 8% of guilty verdicts (see Table 5).

Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Turn-Taking and Verdicts in Female Trials (1740-1760)</th>
<th>Guilty female (%)</th>
<th>Not guilty female (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No turns</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>15.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 turn</td>
<td>55.1</td>
<td>44.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-3 turns</td>
<td>26.5</td>
<td>19.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 or more turns</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>17.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Regarding turn-length, results show that men hold the floor for longer, as they take a higher number of turns comprised between 5 and 14 lines. Men are also those who ask more questions, suggesting that they more often take advantage of cross-examining witnesses in comparison with women. The number of statements generally provided at the end of the trial in the monologic defence does not show considerable difference between female and male defendants. A curious point which is worth making is that from 1750 onwards the use of questions drastically declines and defendants—both men and women—limit themselves to provide a monologic defence at the end of the evidence phase. Their speech-contribution is systematically introduced by the recorder’s descriptor: *prisoner’s defence* or the prisoner’s surname + defence.

**Bennett and Feldman’s Classification of Defence Strategies**

Although defendants may not always have been conscious of the strategies used to construct their defence,
there seems to be similarities between their discourse behaviour and the systematic techniques adopted by
defence counsels in contemporary trials. For this reason, the author will apply Bennett and Feldman’s
classification of defence strategies in the Anglo-American courtroom to her analysis of the defence system in the
18th- and 19th-century trials. Bennett and Feldman (1981) identified three main defence techniques adopted by
lawyers: challenge, redefinition, and reconstruction.

CHALLENGE: The challenge strategy usually involves some attempt to demonstrate that the key definitions of story
elements are poorly supported by evidence or testimony; that the nature of the evidence permits definitions other than the
ones the prosecution has assigned to it; or that the prosecution case has some obvious gaps or inconsistencies in it. This
strategy… is generally developed through cross-examination. (Bennett & Feldman, 1981, p. 98)

REDEFINITION: Its success depends on the defence’s ability to find a story element that is ambiguous enough to
support another definition and, at the same time, central enough to the story to affect the meaning of the central action.
Many redefinition strategies do not succeed either because the redefined element was not ambiguous or because the
redefined element is quite peripheral in the story (Bennett & Feldman, 1981, p. 100)

RECONSTRUCTION: The reconstruction strategy usually involves placing the central action in the context of a new
story to show that it merits a different interpretation. A common defence in murder cases, for example is to show that
the defendant acted in self-defence. (Bennett & Feldman, 1981, p. 104)

In the author’s database, reconstruction appears as the most common strategy used both by men and women.
Redefinition is a more sophisticated technique and is generally more common among defence counsels who
usually identify a story element and ascribe it to a different meaning so as to cast doubts on the prosecutor’s story.
Challenges come second in the prisoner’s defence. They are articulated in the form of questions or direct
statements functioning as accusations. Denials—which obviously do not appear in Bennett and Feldman’s
classification of defence counsels’ strategies—come third. Though less common than reconstruction and
challenge, they are used as a defence technique and mostly by women. Here are some examples: “I never saw him
before”; “I never set eyes on him before”; “I am as innocent as the child in its mother’s womb”; “I was not there”;
“I never went with him, nor saw his watch”; “I never saw the watch before, by the great God in heaven”; “I never
saw that man in my life”.

Reconstruction in Pickpocketing Cases (1740-1820)
The use of the reconstruction technique subsumes the activation of masterplots, sorts of powerful mind frames,
which create an image of the world in which good and evil are clearly identifiable, and in which blame can be easily
attributed (Abbott, 2002; Cecconi, 2010). Male and female defendants rely on different masterplots to construct
their defence. Table 6 shows a list of the most frequent masterplots used by female and male defendants.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequent Masterplots Used by Male and Female Defendants (1740-1760)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Women</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Money/watch found on the bed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Money/watch given in return for sexual favours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Accused because she refused to lie on the bed with the prosecutor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The women’s masterplots reveal that their crime is almost always inserted in a context of sexual favours and
prostitution, whereas in men’s case pickpocketing is related to their being vagabonds and takes place in the streets.
Both female and male defendants cast the prosecutor within the reality paradigm of the unreliable witness, representing him as being drowsy or “very much in liquor” at the time of the presumed pickpocketing. Examples 1-3 are three extracts featuring forms of reconstruction where the female defendant activates the following masterplots: (1) “money given in return for sexual favours”; (2) “watch/money found and not stolen”; and (3) “accusation due to her refusal to lye with the prosecutor”. The third masterplot is consistent with the acknowledgement that jurors acquitted defendants when it was made clear that they were victims of false charges arising from malice or greed (Beattie, 1986, p. 417).

Example (1) Prisoner’s defence

As I was going through St. James’s-park I met with this man and another; they asked me where I was going: I answered, Home. They wanted me to take them with me: I said I could not. Then they asked me if I could take them some where else: I said no, I could not. Then this young man said, if I would let him go and lie with me, he would give me some money. He shew’d me some silver, and desired me to lie down on the grass: I said, no, I would not. He said if I would lie down he would give me some more: then I lay down, and he lay with me. When he had done he called for the other man to come and lie with me: He came, but I would not let him; then he pulled me down, and I call’d out. After that the man that is here said I had rob’d him; but he gave it me to lie with me. (Mary Dodd, 1756, guilty)

Example (2) Prisoner’s defence

The prosecutor pick’d me up, and he drop’d this watch upon the bed; I found it three hours after he was gone out of the room. (Martha Maddox, 1758, guilty)

Example (3) Prisoner’s defence

I was coming near the Fountain-tavern, this man, the prosecutor, was very drunk, he came by, and said to me, will you go and drink any thing? I said, no, you have had enough already, friend; he took hold of me and pulled me about, I had but a little way to go; I staid a little, he knocked at a door. I went and turned the corner to go home, he came and began to pull and use me very ill, (this drunken man did,) he said it is not late yet, it is not above eleven o’clock, and pulled out his watch, that was the way I came to know he had one. I went down Burleigh-street, in the middle of it, I stopped at a pawnbroker’s door there on purpose to get rid of him, he came there and knocked several times; I went on, and when I was got about two or three doors from him, he said I had robbed him of his watch; then I said, it can’t be lost, it must be either in this street or the other; and when he had told the watchman he had lost his watch, I said, go down to Burleigh-street or Exeter-street and you’ll find it, because I saw it in his hand. (Mary Brown, 1755, not guilty)

Challenge in Pickpocketing Cases (1740-1820)

Challenges are usually articulated through questions in cross-examination and men more than women rely on them to construct their defence. In most cases up to 1750, challenges are combined with reconstructions occurring at the end of the trial. Below is an example of challenging questions adopted by a male defendant in the attempt to discredit the prosecutor, showing inconsistencies in his accusation (see Example 4).

Example (4)

Prisoner: Ask him, whether he was sober at this time?
Swift: I was; that declares itself, otherwise I could not have missed the Watch so soon.
Prisoner: Ask him, if he did not say, he could not tell which of the Men took his Watch?
Swift: No, I always said he was the Person; I saw his Hand go down to my Pocket, and when he drew it out, I felt him.

---

1 Reality paradigm in an umbrella term coined by Archer (2002) in order to refer to the many and varied “particularised” mental perspectives of reality or mind frames which lawyers—and in this case defendants—construct to support their own conceptualization of events. In this sense, the concept is similar to Abbott’s notion of “masterplot”.
PICKPOCKETING CASES AT THE OLD BAILEY

Prisoner: By what Circumstances is he sure that I am the Man?
Swift: The Man that put his Hand down to my Pocket, was the Person I pursued.
Thomas Thompson: I was with the Prosecutor when this happened, and saw the 2 Men come along; I gave Way to them: The Prisoner ran against Swift, and he immediately said, the Villain is gone with my Watch; I followed him through an Alley, and half Way up another, he fell over two or three Steps, and then I laid hold on him; he cry’d out he was robbed of his Hat and Wig, which were lost in the Fall; the Watch was found lying not a Yard and half from the Prisoner. I am sure the Man that came up to the Prosecutor is the same Person I took; for there was nobody between him and me all the Pursuit.
Prisoner: Ask him whether it is probable that I could throw the Watch away, when he followed me so close?
Thompson: By the Force of the Fall, the Watch might fly out of his Hand. (Henry Davis, 1740, guilty)

As we can see from this extract, defendants construct their challenge through coercive questions, especially polar and negative polar interrogatives which should compel the interlocutor to provide the desired response. Here is a list of the questions types used by defendants from 1740 to 1760 from the most to the least frequent: (1) negative polar (32.4%); (2) polar (31.1%); (3) wh-questions (28.5%); (4) how(possible)-questions (5.1%); (5) declarative questions (1.2%); and (6) no tag questions (which will appear in 1819 in prisoner’s defence).

The frequency list above resembles that used by defendants of a higher social status in the 17th-century treason trials (Ceconi, 2012). In both cases, however, the conducivity of the questions rarely achieves its perlocutionary effect, given the prisoner’s subordinate position in the courtroom (Archer, 2005; Ceconi, 2012). Indeed, if on the one hand, defendants have the power to ask questions, on the other hand they lack the institutionally sanctioned position of authority which would allow them to coerce witnesses and shape their testimony as they liked (Ceconi, 2012, p. 141).

Apart from polar interrogatives, which are traditional “controlling” questions, also how(possible)-questions and wh-questions—when asked by defendants—acquire a challenging force as they presuppose that the answer provided will be detrimental to the addressee and therefore advantageous to the prisoner.

By and large the analysis of the 165 trials presented at the Old Bailey confirms Beattie’s claim that in the 18th-century courtroom, the verdict was primarily influenced by the plausibility of the prosecutor’s evidence and the consistency of the eye-witnesses’ reports rather than by the loquaciousness or argumentative skills of the defendant: “It would appear from the printed assize reports in Surrey that it was the lack of direct identification of the accused or of persuasive circumstantial evidence that led to most acquittals” (Beattie, 1986, p. 417).

Indeed, most of the cases in which both female and male prisoners were found not guilty occur when the prosecutor could not swear to the prisoner, or did not search him/her immediately, or was in liquor or could not say whether the prisoner took the goods out of his pocket, or finally when the constable did not find anything on him/her at the time of his/her taking. All in all, the prisoner’s defence skills (be them in the form of reconstruction or challenge) did not seem to do much against the force of the evidence reported by the prosecution.

Introduction of Defence Counsel (1754-1820)

The 18th century saw the introduction of the defence counsel for cases of ordinary felony. Their appearance was described as “the most remarkable change that took place in English criminal procedure from the time of its happening down to present time” (Stephen, 1883, p. 424). As Langbein (1999, p. 360) made it clear that the change occurred in the judicial practice and was not supported by any act of legislation which could help our understanding of the rationale behind the individual judges’ decision. It is clear however that by the 1730s
prisoners were employing counsels for examining and cross-examining witnesses and it is even very likely that the practice began at the Old Bailey where the largest number of criminal and felony cases were tried (Beattie, 1986, p. 359). Beattie reported that in 1788, 72 defendants out of a total of 580 were defended by a counsel. Assuming that the figure is sufficiently accurate, he (1986) came to the conclusion that “One in eight prisoners charged with property offenses had the help of an attorney in Court… by the late 18th century” (pp. 360-361).

In pickpocketing cases, the first trial featuring the defence counsel is dated 1754, i.e., two decades after the earliest record of defence counsel found by Langbein and Beattie. From 1754 to 1760, only 2.3% of the Old Bailey trials for pickpocketing register the presence of a defence counsel engaged in cross-examination. From that time onwards, their presence increases up to the 1860 when in almost 60% of the trials the defence is taken up by the counsel with the consequent eclipse of the defendant from the trial scene.

In this second part of the analysis, the author will focus on the role of defence counsels and see how their appearance influences the defendant’s discourse behaviour in the trial. To this purpose, she will select 130 trials dated from 1754 to 1820. Since the area in which defense counsel had the greatest influence and freedom was in the cross-examination of prosecution witnesses, the author will concentrate on cross-examination strategies.

**Question Types**

The defence counsel’s cross-examination is based on questions asked with the purpose of either challenging the prosecutor’s story or redefining its elements to suggest a different interpretation. Reconstruction is not as common among the counsels as it is among defendants. A comparison between the relative frequency of questions asked by defence counsels and by defendants reveals some interesting differences (see Table 7).

Table 7

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comparison Between the Distribution of Question Types Used by Defence Counsels and Defendants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Defence counsels (1754-1820)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declarative questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Polar questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wh-questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative polar questions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How(possible)-questions/tag questions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7 shows a difference in the types of coercive questions used. Indeed, defence counsels mostly opt for declarative questions which exert a higher amount of control and conducivity over the addressee. Ostensibly asked as means of verifying the information, declarative questions have the underlying force of statements thus forcing the addressee to the expected answer. From 1806 onwards, declarative questions are no longer transcribed with the question mark. This may be the result of a common editorial choice made by the recorders; nonetheless, in some cases, declaratives assume a stronger assertive tone so much so that the proposition is presented as an acknowledged fact that can be only confirmed rather than as a piece of information to be verified. The prosecutor, however, often finds the force to contradict the counsel, as Example 5 shows.

Example (5)

Cross examined by Mr Curwood […]
Q: When you said you have lost your pocket-book the prisoner said here it is.
A: No, he turned round, threw it down and ran away. (Thomas Pater, 1816, guilty)
In the author’s dataset, defendants do not utilize declaratives when mounting their defence. Their discourse behaviour is similar to that of defence counsels only in their use of polar and wh-questions, which come respectively second and third in the two-frequency lists. Unlike defence counsels, prisoners mostly rely on negative polar questions as strongest forms of control on the prosecutor’s answer. This was also the case in the 17th-century treason trials with defendants of a higher social status (gentlemen, professionals, members of the clergy, or the army), who “generally opted for wh-questions and (negative) polar questions whereas prosodic and tag questions remained the exclusive province of professionals” (Cecconi, 2012, p. 117). Apart from the fact that negative polars are considered as less conducive than declaratives (Woodbury, 1984), it is worth bearing in mind that “The various question types are less likely to exhibit the same amount of control when asked by less powerful participants” (Archer, 2005, p. 79). The example from Henry Davis’ trial (No. 4) is a case in point. In court, the illocutionary force of the prisoner’s questions is rarely accompanied by the desired perlocutionary effect, despite his/her emulation of the professionals’ expertise (Cecconi, 2012, p. 14).

**Challenge and Redefinition**

Defence counsels generally organise the defence through challenges and redefinitions. Challenges are articulated in the form of declarative questions (mostly in the negative form) which are intended to undermine the credibility of the prosecutor’s narrative. Here are some of the most frequent challenges (see Examples 6-9).

Example (6)

Q: You didn’t see the hand in the pocket
A: Yes, but whose it was I cannot say. (John Cook, 1819, not guilty)

Example (7)

Q: You can’t say you didn’t miss it.
A: No, I am sure I had it in the box. (William Henry Clark, 1819, guilty)

Example (8)

Q: You do not swear to him
A: No but I have no doubts of him. (Michael Jacobs, 1820, guilty)

Example (9)

Q: You never saw him before that night
A: No.
Q: What kind of hat did he wear?
A: A round hat
Q: You said it was very dark?
A: Yes.
Q: You never saw the man before, and yet you mean to say the prisoner at the bar is the man?
A: Yes. (John Lewis, 1804, guilty)

The masterplots activated in the redefinition strategy are the same as those used by defendants. Among them the most common are: (1) the prosecutor was in liquor; and (2) a case of mistaken identity (i.e., someone else might have stolen the belongings).
Another frequent masterplot used only by professionals in their redefinition is that the scene of the crime was too crowded or too dark to be sure about the person (see Example 10).

Example (10)

Q: About five in the afternoon, at these sort of fairs, there is a very great crowd?
A: I cannot say I never was there before
Q: Whether your watch was taken from you or you lost it, you cannot say?
A: I cannot.
Q: There was, in point of fact, a great crowd?
A: There was. (Thomas Houghton, 1801, guilty)

The outcome of the above trials suggests that the defence counsels’ cross-examining techniques—despite their stronger conducivity and their institutionally sanctioned recognition—were not as effective as we might expect. Indeed, a quantitative investigation of the Old Bailey Proceedings Corpus shows that in the period comprised between 1754 and 1820, only 25% of defendants supported by a defence counsel received a not guilty verdict, the remaining 74% were found guilty of the crime despite their reliance on the professional’s expertise.

How Has the Role of Defendants Changed From the 18th to the 19th Century?

In the period from 1760 to 1820, the prisoner’s defence becomes less elaborated: in only 7.6% of the trials the defence is more than 80 words (4 lines), whereas in 70% of the trials the average length is comprised between 6 and 40 words (about 2 lines). Most of the defendant’s speech-contributions are denials, such as “I know nothing of it”; “I was not near him”; and “I am innocent”. The trust in the defence counsel’s job, however, continues to be rather limited as in only 10% of the trials the prisoners leave their defence entirely to them. This confirms Langbein’s (1978) claim that in the 1730s, “Defense counsel did not instantly supplant, but rather simply afforded the accused, who continued to perform as examiner, cross-examiner and concluding orator in his own cause” (p. 312). Table 8 quantitatively shows how the appearance of defence counsel was—at the beginning—very limited and only progressively increased up to 1840s when, as a result of The Prisoners’ Counsel Act of 1836, defence counsels dominated the trial scene.

Table 8

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Prisoner’s defence only (%)</th>
<th>Defence counsel’s cross-examination + prisoner’s defence (%)</th>
<th>Defence counsel only (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1754-1800</td>
<td>84.3</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1801-1820</td>
<td>82.7</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>9.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1821-1840</td>
<td>66.2</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>17.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1841-1860</td>
<td>43.5</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>51.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Trials featuring the prisoner as only orator progressively decrease from 1754 to 1860 in relation to the increase in the number of trials with defence counsels as the only actors. One interesting finding is represented by the percentage of trials combining defence counsel’s cross-examination and the prisoner’s monologic defence at the end of the evidence phase in the form of either reconstruction or denial. This cooperation which mediates the entrance of defence counsels in the courtroom drastically decreases in the period from 1841 to 1860, as a result of
PICKPOCKETING CASES AT THE OLD BAILEY

the introduction of the Prisoners’ Counsel Act (1836) which permitted people accused of felony to make their full defence by counsel. Indeed, in the same period, the percentage of trials managed by defence counsels with no defendant’s intervention amounts to 51.3%, opening up new horizons for the defence counsels’ profession.

Conclusions

The paper has intended to show the defence practice used in pickpocketing cases presented at the Old Bailey from 1740 to 1820 from both a synchronic and diachronic viewpoint. For most of the 18th century, defence was basically managed by prisoners. Despite some gender-based differences in the turn-taking system, they generally opted for the reconstruction technique followed by challenges and denials, the latter being especially common among female defendants. The analysis has shown that men and women reconstruct their evidence using different representational frames or “masterplots” (Abbott, 2002), which correspond to their different socio-cultural positioning. Indeed, women’s crime is always conceptualised within the context of sexual favours, e.g., money/watch found (not stolen) near the bed; money/watch given in return for sex. Men’s pickpocketing, on the other hand, is related to their being vagabonds and takes place in the streets rather than indoors. A quantitative investigation of the cases in which the accused provides a defence (i.e., takes at least three turns) reveals that the defence coming from a prisoner has little or no effect in securing acquittals. By means of illustration, trials with a not guilty verdict feature 18% of defence whereas those with a guilty verdict present 20% of defence instances. Results also show that silence is more often accompanied by acquittals than we might expect. Indeed, 25% of silences (absence of defence) are followed by a verdict of innocence whereas trials with a guilty verdict stand out for the prisoners’ self-defence, featuring only 10% of silence from the accused. By and large the analysis of the author’s dataset confirms that the verdict was primarily influenced by the plausibility of the prosecutor’s evidence or the consistency of the eye-witnesses’ reports rather than by the defence skills of the accused.

From 1754, defence counsels make their appearance in pickpocketing cases. In the period from 1760 to 1820, the prisoner’s defence becomes less elaborated. Most of the defendant’s speech-contributions are no longer reconstructions but mere denials and there is also a drastic decrease in questions from 1750s onwards. The trust in the defence counsel’s job is still rather limited. The techniques used by defence counsels are primarily challenges and redefinitions articulated through interrogatives. Unlike defendants who mostly opt for (negative) polar questions (63.5%) with only 1.2% of declaratives, lawyers favour declarative questions which reinforce their control on the answer. Interestingly, however, their stronger self-confidence and expertise do not seem to do much against the persuasive force of consistent testimonies. Indeed, only in 25% of the trials (1754-1820) defence counsels manage to obtain acquittals for their clients. In this sense, it might be interesting to examine the increased effectiveness of lawyers’ cross-examination strategies in the course of the 19th century on the basis of the number of acquittals or partial verdicts obtained. After all the 19th century saw the professionalization of the discourse of guilt through patterns of mystification and reality construction consistently used by lawyers of either side to win their cause.

2 Before the Prisoners’ Counsel Act of 1836, felony defendants did not have the formal right of being represented by a counsel although, as we have seen, from mid-18th century such had been routinely indulged upon judges’ discretion, where defendants could afford them.
References
A Demographic Analysis of Proverbs in Rotimi’s Historical Tragedies

Omolara Kikelomo Owoeye, Samuel Ayodele Dada
Ekiti State University, Ado-Ekiti, Nigeria

This paper appraises the use of proverbs by the characters in Ola Rotimi’s monarchical tragedies: The Gods Are Not to Blame (1971b), Kurunmi (1971a), and Ovonramwen Nogbaisi (1974). In an analysis of selected proverbs from the three texts, the study pays special attention to the status, age, gender, and nationality of the characters who make proverbial sayings an integral part of their speeches. The findings of the paper include the fact that proverb, apart from being the stock in trade of old people, is also used by the young when status places upon them the responsibilities demanded of elders. We also discover that proverbs are not limited to Africa only, every tribe and culture has its own proverbs and some proverbs are universal.

Keywords: proverbs, demographic analysis, Nigerian Drama, Ola Rotimi

Introduction

Ola Rotimi is noted for the representation of monarchical tragedies in his dramatic works and three of these are prominent and peculiar. His style is highly Aristotelian, creating royal tragic heroes who repeatedly fall as a result of particular personal flaws as well as from societal and supernatural influence. Two of these plays, Kurunmi (1971a) and Ovonramwen Nogbaisi (1974), are Rotimi’s original creations, while the third, The Gods Are Not to Blame (1971b), is an adaptation of the classical Greek tragedy, Oedipus Rex (1974) by Sophocles. In all the three plays, the protagonists are kings who are imbued with infectiously energetic personalities, an ebullient nature and a strong linguistic habit that is worthy of closer critical attention.

One distinguishing feature of Rotimi’s original and adapted historical tragedies is the manner in which he allows the linguistic codes of the plays’ spatial settings to impact heavily on the speeches of the major characters throughout the plays. For Kurunmi and The Gods Are Not to Blame, Yoruba speech patterns and rhetorical attributes are decipherable in the utterances of the characters even though they all speak in the English language. The English language used in Ovonramwen Nogbaisi displays a Benin linguistic background and this is not surprising since Benin is the locale and the nativity of the characters except for the British expatriate officials. The trend noticeable in the linguistic habits of Rotimi’s lead characters is an authorial personal trait for, though the three plays are tragedies of great monarchies, and each is unique in its own way. Kurunmi originates from Yoruba history, Ovonramwen Nogbaisi from Benin, while the The Gods Are Not to Blame is traceable to classical mythology in Greece. Yet in all the three plays, kings Odewale, Kurunmi, and Ovonramwen exhibit speech habits that are analogous to one another most especially in their use of proverbs.
Characteristic features of the statements of these kings and some other characters in the plays include code switching, code mixing, use of indigenous words, transliteration, and the use of proverbs. Rotimi’s drama is noted for its use of proverbs and quite a number of studies have been carried out on this aspect of his work. However, none has adequately treated such demographic issues as status, gender, vocation, and age in respect of the speakers. Adedimeji’s (2003) research for instance focuses on the semantic and pragmatic analysis of the proverbs, while Monye’s (1995) approach is more general in outlook and focuses on only one of the plays. Besides, most essays on this topic have used only one play at a time, leaving a dangerous gap by the refusal to do comparative study of proverbs in the plays and detect the trend which we intend to focus on here.

The present analysis focuses on demographic factors such as age, gender, status, religious orientation, and racial, ethnic, or cultural backgrounds. Thus the proverbs isolated for the study here were based on those observable demographic traits as listed above.

On age, researchers have confirmed few things affect a person’s outlook more than his/her age. Each generation has more or less common values and experiences that set it apart from other generations (Lucas 1998, p. 104). By status here, we mean a person’s social standing in a society. Gender here has to do with social distinctions between the sexes which may be more prominent in one culture than the other.

Cultural background presupposes the fact that in spite of similarities existing between people of different cultural backgrounds, people of different ethnicity still have different customs and beliefs that bear upon their speeches.

On religion, Lucas (1998) said “… Religious views are among the most emotionally charged and passionately defended of all human concerns” (p. 109). Speech variation will reflect a wide range of faiths, as well as atheists and agnostics. Religious and cultural diversity will feature in one’s speech, especially in the use of proverbs.

Age, status, gender, religion, and racial, ethnic, or cultural backgrounds are just a few of the variables to consider in a demographic analysis. A whole range of these features characteristic of any given society includes: occupation, economic position/status, education, intelligence, and place of residence. We here have chosen only those factors which directly affect the choice and use of proverbs in the plays and in the larger traditional African society.

Proverbs

Proverbs and their use in everyday speech and other linguistic engagements are an integral part of the oral tradition of Yoruba people, from where Ola Rotimi hails. These words, believed to be the stock in trade of old people, are wise sayings that deal with every aspect of life. It has been a difficult venture trying to put all that proverbs entail into one single all-encompassing definition. Mieder (1993) noticed this difficulty and comments:

The reason for not being able to formulate a universal proverb definition lies primarily in the central ingredient that must be part of any proverb definition-traditionality. The term traditionality includes both aspects of age and currency that a statement must have to be considered a proverb. But while we can describe the structure, style, form and so on, of proverbs in great detail, we cannot determine whether a statement has a certain age or currency among the population by the text itself. It will always take external research work to establish the traditionality of a text and this means that even the most precise definition will always be incomplete. (p. 6)

Indeed many of the extant definitions of proverbs take care of one aspect of the concept or the other. Proverbs are not learned nor premeditated as such; they come naturally with age, especially to the African.
Charles Okwelume’s (2004, p. ix) assertion that “Proverbs give the spoken or written African word the richness and maturity that time gives to palm wine, which is appreciated in typical African society” is a confirmation of the claim that age and traditionality are a crucial part of proverbs of Africa. Although no concession is reached on the ideal definition of proverbs and there seems to be no perfect description of a proverb, some definitions or descriptions of the act exist and even Mieder (1993), after his explanation above later defines proverb as: “A short generally known sentence of the folk which contains wisdom, truth, morals and traditional views in a metaphorically fixed and memorisable form which is handed down from generation to generation” (p. 24).

Norrick’s (1985, p. 78) own definition also treads the path of traditionality which is later charted by others after. To him (1985), “Proverb is a traditional, conversational, didactic genre with general meaning, a potential free conversational turn preferably with figurative meaning” (p. 78).

However, Norrick conflates other issues with traditionality, which is not included in Mieder’s. These include the subject of didactism that is a part of the intentions of most speakers of proverbs. The real intention in using proverbs actually consists in the aim to pass a moral message across and make the message clearer, more vivid or more easily understood.

Yusuf and Methangwane’s (2003, p. 408) definition expand the perspective of Norrick above. In their (2003) words, proverbs are “relatively short expressions, which are usually associated with wisdom and are used to perform a variety of social functions” (p. 408). Such functions often include the teaching of morals as earlier mentioned but proverbs also help to shroud some parts of one’s speech in secrecy, leaving only the “initiated” to decode the hidden message in the words. Okwelume (2004) also said proverbs were used by an elder to “advise, warn and to convey truism particularly if he intends that some of those present should not understand the kernel of his sayings” (p. i).

Okpewho (2004, p. 226) negotiated the definition of a proverb from the structural angle; his approach was more literary than thematic. He (2004) said:

A proverb is a piece of folk wisdom expressed with terseness and charm. The “terseness” implies certain economy in the choice of words and a sharpness of focus, while the “charm” conveys the touch of literary or poetic beauty in the expression. (p. 226)

In actual fact, proverbs, apart from encapsulating people’s philosophies and experiences, come in short lines that make their structure akin to that of poetic compositions. Egbe (2000) equally examined proverbs as an aspect of creativity in language. It can be deduced from his perspective that though proverbs are derived from the shared experiences of a people, there is room for creativity in their selection and use.

Finnegan (1970) identified some functions of proverbs in different parts of Africa. Among the Yoruba where most of the proverbs chosen for this study are used, proverbs are used to strengthen relationship, enrich speech, and broker peace particularly at the end of judicial arbitration. They are spoken by elders and when the young use proverbs in the presence of elders without deference to them, it may be construed as disrespect or self-conceit.

In all, we agree that proverbs are wise sayings used mostly by elders to shed light on issues under discussion at certain points in time. The use of imagery and other illustrations in proverbs makes them help meaning as they become more elucidative to the listener. The use of proverbs by individuals can often be a right index of their age and experience since proverbs are not taught but are acquired as individuals grow in life.
DEMOGRAPHIC ANALYSIS OF PROVERBS IN ROTIMI’S HISTORICAL TRAGEDIES

Methodology

This study is descriptive and the method used for collecting data is an informal one. Proverbs are selected from Rotimi’s three tragic plays: Kurunmi, Ovonranwen Nogbaisi, and The Gods Are Not to Blame. Selections are made randomly from the proverbs spoken by the three kings since theirs form a major part of the compendia of proverbs in the three texts. Other proverbs spoken by characters of lesser status than kings and those of the female gender are also selected for study so as to capture the demographic variables enlisted for study here. In all, 30 proverbs are used for the study. Seventeen are spoken by kings, five each by kings Odewale, Kurunmi, and Ovonramwen, and two by the late King Adetusa in the flashback. Seven of the proverbs are spoken by chiefs, one by a woman, one by an expatriate, three by young people, and one by an elder. The proverbs are not only studied along the lines of demographic concerns such as age, status, gender, and nationality; the contents of the poems are also considered vis-à-vis the philosophical, ideational, contextual, and referential implications of their usage.

In the light of the many proverbs in each of the plays selected for study, only proverbs typical of the type/class of demographic variables (age, status, gender, religious orientation, and racial, ethnic, or cultural backgrounds) under review in the present study are excerpted as data here, Inherent in status in Yoruba land is age, so much so that a king by virtue of this status irrespective of age is considered as the father of all in the community. Thus age and status are sometimes grouped together in this analysis. Moreover this natural instinct between age and culture in Yoruba is evident in the quality and quantity of proverbs uttered by kings in these plays.

Data

Proverbs by the Royalty

All the proverbs spoken by kings in the plays reflect directly the kings’ socio-political realities especially with regards to the threats on their domains. To this end we find the following proverbs relevant.

King Ovonramwen’s Proverbs From Ovonramwen Nogbaisi

(1) Because the moon is dim, the eyes of little stars cast a free glitter. (p. 6)
(2) The hawk does not pick on the chick in sport. (p. 21)
(3) If fire can consume the tortoise with the iron-coat, why not the fowl with the feathered gown? (p. 60)
(4) One does not try the monkey’s tricks on the bush-pigeon. (p. 63)
(5) To love someone who does not really love you is like shaking the giant iroko tree to make tiny dew-drops… fall. (p. 44)

The first proverb here is uttered when Ovonramwen or ders the execution of two chiefs who violates his instructions with impunity. He intends that their judgment would serve as a deterrent to others and that is the implication of his word in the proverb. Suspicion is the theme of the second proverb spoken by Ovonramwen in the sample above. In this instance, king Ovonramwen is not the suspicious one but Ologbosere, a chief. When it becomes obvious to Ovonramwen that Ologbosere does not trust the king’s latest move, the king shows Ologbosere that he can palpate Ologbosere’s thoughts by uttering this proverb. Ologbosere ordinarily would think the king would suspect him of perfidy. The king’s choice of Ologbosere as son in-law is a surprise that may really elicit this kind of response. The third proverb is propelled by historical antecedents. Ovonramwen explains to the whiteman that his fears are orchestrated by the scary news of what the whiteman did to King Jaja
of Opobo and Nana of Itshekiri. Considering their status, therefore, he stands no chance before the whiteman.

**King Kurunmi’s Proverbs From Kurunmi**

1. When an Elder sees a mudskipper, he must not afterwards say it was a crocodile. (p. 42)
2. It is a foolish daughter who thinks she knows so much that she can teach her own mother how to bear children. (p. 64)
3. The bull-frog that rivals the size of the elephant will burst. (p. 29)
4. The young palm tree grows tall rapidly, and it is proud, thinking, hoping that one day it will scratch the face of the sky. Have its elders before it touched the sky? (pp. 35-36).
5. The Gabon riper dies its children take up its habit, poison and all. The plantain dies, its saplings take its place, broad leaves and all. The fire dies, its ashes bear its memory with a memory of white fluff. (p. 15)

These proverbs spoken by the monarch clearly reveal the turbulence that pervades his reign throughout the period covered by the play. Examples 1 and 2 for instance are rendered when the youth in Kurunmi’s kingdom rebel and insist that they would not follow him to the war, because he is too dictatorial. He uses the first proverb to express the sincerity of his intention, but in the second one, he asserts the place of his experience, strength, position, and age. The third and fourth proverbs are used in describing the change in tradition that causes external attack for Kurunmi.

**King Odewale’s Proverbs From The Gods Are Not to Blame**

1. He who pelts another with pebbles must have pebbles in return. (p. 7)
2. The hyena flirts with the hen, the hen is happy, not knowing that her death has come. (p. 30)
3. All lizards lie prostrate: how can a man tell which lizard suffers from bellyache? (p. 23)
4. Two rams cannot drink from the same bucket at the same time! They will lock horns. (p. 34)
5. A bush does not sway this way or that way, unless there is wind. (p. 60)

The peculiar nature of King Odewale’ as a king in a land where he is a stranger in some of the proverbs cited above. The second proverb shows Odewale’s feeling of insecurity and his suspicion of the genuineness love of the people of Kutuje claim they have for him. It is the same suspicion of the sincerity of the Kutuje Chiefs and indigenes that propels the use of the third proverb. Example 4 is uttered to reveal the competition between him and his stepson, Aderopo who is almost an agemate of the King.

**King Adetusa’s Proverbs From The Gods Are Not to Blame**

1. No termite ever boasts of devouring rock! (p. 48)
2. Venom of viper does nothing to the back of a crocodile. (p. 48)

Although King Adetusa appears on stage briefly only in the flashback scene, he still utters these two proverbs to show that a royalty’s penchant for speaking proverbs is consistent. Because the scene is one of serious tussle between him and Odewale over a piece of land and they are both flexing muscles, we find him therefore, not surprisingly, using these proverbs to indicate the superiority of his power and immunity to harm.

**Proverbs by Chiefs**

Yoruba chiefs are also high up in the society with old age as part of their qualifications. It is customary in African settings for kings to have chiefs who form a part of their council and take part in political deliberations and decisions. Their roles are mainly advisory and this is revealed in their choice of proverbs which are either persuasive or placatory. This can be seen in some of the proverbs which we have selected here:
DEMOGRAPHIC ANALYSIS OF PROVERBS IN ROTIMI’S HISTORICAL TRAGEDIES

(1) Cactus is bitter to him who has tasted it.—Ogunmola (Rotimi, 1971a, p. 7)
(2) It takes another monkey to see the ugly buttocks of a fellow monkey.—Osundina (Rotimi, 1971a, p. 47)
(3) A single finger cannot remove a louse from the head.—Uzazakpo (Rotimi, 1974, p. 13)
(4) … restless pit!—Okavbiogbe (Rotimi, 1974, p. 21)
(5) A single finger cannot remove a louse from the head.—Uzazakpo (Rotimi, 1974, p. 13)
(6) If a provoked houseboy cannot match his master strength with strength, he maims the master’s favourite goat! (Rotimi, 1974, p. 5)
(7) The lion liver is vain wish for dogs.—Royal bard (Rotimi, 1971b, p. 37)

In all the troubled domains of the kings in the three plays under study, the chiefs often occupy very sensitive positions in which they must convince the king of their loyalty and at the same time take a fair position that will not offend their own conscience and the townspeople. Proverbs 1 and 2 are uttered when the Ibadan Chiefs deliberate whether or not to ally with Oyo against Ijaiye in the coming war between the two cities. Uzazakpo in Ovonramwen Nogbaisi speaks the third proverb above while advocating for unity among the Benin in their attempt to crush external aggression.

Gender Based Proverb—Woman

In all three plays, we find a woman uses a proverb only once in The Gods Are Not to Blame. The proverb by Queen Ojuola says: “The horns cannot be too heavy for the cow that must bear them”.

Her aim in speaking this proverb is to persuade her son Aderopo to divulge the message of the Ifa Priest to the king in council without fear or favour. The use of animal and nature in this proverb is to also clarify the fact that there can be no objection on a duty placed on one’s shoulders by nature. This approach in persuading Aderopo to relay the message of the Ifa Priest contrasts sharply with that of the kings and his chiefs who react with impatience to Aderopo’s brooding silence. In fact, king Odewale has resorted to the use of threat before this intervention by Queen Ojuola. It is interesting to note that Aderopo speaks up immediately after this intervention by the queen’s mother thus her persuasive intention in using this proverb is achieved.

The Non-African Proverb

Although proverbs are being examined here in the African context of usage, one of the proverbs in the plays is spoken by an expatriate who needs to create a vivid imagery so that his position might be clearer to the colonial subjects. While explaining to Ovonramwen that his declaration of war on Benin is not an arbitrary display of power without premise, the British Consul-General of the Protectorate of Benin Moor says: “There can be no smoke without fire”.

This particular proverb contains nothing to restrict it to any culture or continent of the world since the concept of smoke and fire is a universal one. However, Odewale’s proverb that “A bush does not sway this way or that way unless there is wind” seems a more African equivalent of the same proverb. In both proverbs, what seems eminent is the projection of the subject of cause and effect in human occurrences world over.

Young People’s Proverbs

Whereas young people are not often in the habit of using proverbs, there are certain situations that propel them to utter some, once in a while. We have the following example: “When five little hyenas combine strength they crush the father of lions!”—Epo, a young warrior (Rotimi, 1971a, p. 38).

This proverb is actually spoken in defiance of Kurunmi’s acclaimed prowess in military matters. Some
young warriors are aggrieved by Kurunmi’s handling of some matters of state import and rebel against his dictatorial tendencies. When they confront him, he defies their age and inexperience, comparing them to hyenas attacking a lion. Then they retort with this proverb to show him that their combined strength would be risky for him to face alone. Perhaps for the vivid imagery created by this proverb, Kurunmi eventually sees reasons with them and accedes to their request.

Apart from these clear cut examples of proverbs by young people, there are other users of proverbs in the plays whose ages cannot be not easily determined although inferences can be made. Proverbs by Second Citizen and Third Citizen in *The Gods are Not to Blame* are a part of this.

(1) When the head of a household dies, the house becomes an empty shell.—Second Citizen (Rotimi, 1971b, p. 9)

(2) When the chameleon brings forth a child, is not that child expected to dance?—Third citizen (Rotimi, 1971b)

These two characters are mere townspeople who speak out of the crowd when they converge at the king’s palace to complain of the plague ravaging the town. The proverbs question the king’s role since the plague starts and what he has done to relieve the people’s sufferings. The inference that the speakers may be young people is made by the manner of their speaking in such circumstances. Elders in an African setting would rather not address the king in that type of situation but in a forum where they can bare their minds without disrespect to his supremacy, but young people, seizing the opportunity to be at the king’s presence quickly and almost anonymously speak their minds.

Other Elders

Other categories of aged people exist in African societies who are neither chiefs nor kings. However, it is generally believed that age and/or vocation confer a modicum of wisdom, experience, and respect on them and people relate with them with reverence. The Ifa Priest in *Ovonramwen Nogbaisi* is one of such. Being an aged and experienced priest, he is often sought by all and sundry especially in time of turbulence and turmoil. Ovonramwen sends for him when his kingdom is threatened by internal and external enemies and during that visit he says:

```
When the little child boasts
that he can kill a riddle,
he lies:
he can only solve a riddle.
When the elder swears he is about
to kill a riddle,
he too lies,
for he will only
solve a riddle. (Rotimi, 1974, p. 15)
```

This proverb is Ifa Priest’s own way of explaining to king Ovonramwen that there is a limit to his understanding even though he is a priest. This illustration becomes necessary, because Ovonramwen begins to quiz him as soon as he tells Ovonramwen that he foresees disaster and catastrophe in Benin. It then becomes necessary for the Ifa Priest to let Ovonramwen know that sometimes Ifa’s revelations are like a riddle, not only to the uninitiated (the young child in the proverb) but also to the priest of Ifa himself (the elder in the proverb).
Findings and Discussion

Proverbs are generally believed to be the stock-in-trade of elders in the society. While this claim is true to some extent, this study discovers that elders in this case may not really mean those who have advanced in age. There are those who have the responsibilities and position of elders thrust on them by status and they discharge those duties as such. People relate with them venerably in deference to their status irrespective of their age. Young kings and chiefs fall into this category and king Odewale in *The Gods Are Not to Blame* is one of such. Although his exact age is not given, his vigour and valorous deeds characterize many young men of his time. He marries his mother at a time when she is still young enough to bear him four children, thus it may not be wrong to infer that he himself is a relatively young man. In spite of his age, Odewale’s actions and attitudes are elderly and these include the use of proverbs in his speeches. However, Odewale’s case appears to be an exception, since both Ovonramwen and Kurunmi are obviously elderly men by virtue of the fact that they have elderly children who are either married or are marriageable age. He spoke five proverbs out of the 30 proverbs under study. Other kings spoke a total of 17 out of the 30 which makes over 50% of the proverbs in the data.

The three kings in the plays studied—Kurunmi, Odewale, and Ovonramwen—all have insecurity to battle with both internally and externally. Of all the three, Odewale is one whose insecurity is most profound and fundamental by virtue of the fact that he is not an indigene of the town of Kutuje where he reigns as king. Thus his proverbs are all centred on kinds and types and tribes, and he uses animals to illustrate this a lot. The point we are making, therefore, is that proverbs are circumstantially conditioned. In the three instances, we find proverbs which do not necessarily belong to the region/people but proverbs that respond to the exigencies of kingship and reigning in the midst of turbulence.

One further interesting discovery of this paper is the fact that the use of proverbs is not typical of Africa after all. It transcends the boundaries of tribes and cultures. In *Ovonramwen Nogbaisi*, Moor, a white man, uses a proverb which turns out to be applicable and relevant in African and non-African settings. Thus while we agree that proverbs are rooted in a people’s philosophy, religion, and cosmological space, the point should also be conceded that some proverbs are universal. Moor’s proverb that “There can be no smoke without fire” can be relevant in all cultures and societies of the world regardless of the language of expression. However, the ratio of African to non-African proverbs in such a play where there is a considerably large number of expatriates reveals that Africans are more interested/versed in the use of proverbs than others. This fact is also corroborated by the reality that the two expatriates in *Kurunmi*, Rev and Mrs. Mann, use no proverb throughout, whereas the field Marshall hardly addresses them without using a proverb in his speech.

The scanty use of proverbs by other characters apart from the three kings in the three plays may be a deliberate design of the playwright but this alludes to other issues in the play and in the larger society. For instance, we find that, of all the numerous proverbs in the three plays, only one is spoken by a woman: This should come as no surprise since male dominance has always been an issue to grapple with in Rotimi’s drama. None of the three women in Kurunmi for instance makes more than a statement each, and it is not surprising if the statements contain no proverbs—Kurunmi is a dictator who has no time to spare for issues of feminine interest. His wife has no relevance in the way he runs the empire and she appears on stage only twice. The first time she asks a question and the second time she only listens to her husband without uttering a word, since he does not expect her to say anything either. It is thus expected that such a one would not use any proverb in such extremely domineering situations. Thus the ratio of male proverb to female is 29:1 which is less than 2% of the proverbs under study.
Ovonramwen’s ruling cabinet consists of no female member either. Since it is only his chiefs and himself who are made relevant in running the affairs of state, one cannot expect any of the women (they are mainly singers and dancers) to use proverbs. In the three plays, Queen Ojuola is the most prominent woman and that is from the source play where her classical equivalent, Jocasta takes prominent part in what happens in the king’s court. The frequency of her appearance on stage paves way for a variety of utterances from her which eventually includes a proverb.

Conclusions

In conclusion, we surmise that proverbs, as deduced from their use in these three plays, make for maturity, pragmatism, and effectiveness in speech through their euphemistic approach. In other words, proverbs, by their euphemistic nature, make for politeness in speech in cases where a direct statement may sound offensive or may be utterly rude. Ovonramwen’s last message to Queen Victoria that “The big pot of hen has been toppled, now mother hen and her children may rejoice” might have sounded more caustic, if it had been given directly yet it still stings Roupell and achieves the desired effect. The linguistic effect of proverbs reaches farther into the human mind than ordinary speeches as seen in the success of Queen Ojuola’s attempt at persuading her son to speak his mind before the king and his council of chiefs. They also show the maturity and experience of the speaker in many instances, because their use calls for a measure of patience and decorum in the speaker. Proverbs are hardly used for aesthetic purposes only; they are intended to improve the overall comprehension of what is said.

References


L2 Fluency and Willingness to Communicate: The Impact of Short-Term Study Abroad versus At-Home Study*

Melanie Lynn D’Amico
Indiana State University, Terre Haute, USA

This study explores the effects of short-term Spanish study in SA (study abroad) and AH (at-home) contexts on oral fluency and WTC (Willingness to Communicate). Previous fluency research has been positive for longer-term SA programs; it is the aim of this research to add to these findings by exploring a short-term program. Few investigations of WTC have sought a possible interaction with L2 (second language) acquisition; however, a belief persists that learners who are more willing to use the L2 show more improvement linguistically. The findings of this study provide the field with empirical research about the connection between the two. Participants were 23 intermediate level students (9 in SA, 14 in AH). All were L1 (first language) English speakers and were not bilingual. Data were collected using pre- and post-program interviews, pre- and post-program WTC in Spanish questionnaires, a WTC in English questionnaire, and weekly language contact questionnaires. Results positively favor the SA context, showing that the SA learners improved their fluency significantly more than the AH learners. Similarly, WTC significantly increased over time for the SA learners but not for the AH learners. Results do not reveal a correlation between WTC and fluency scores, indicating that there may not be a relationship between these two factors.

Keywords: SA (study abroad), AH (at-home), fluency, WTC (Willingness to Communicate), short-term, learning context

Introduction

As university students prepare themselves to enter the workforce, many recognize the need to be globally-aware in both the public and private sectors. These students appreciate the value of being linguistically competent in an L2 (second language) and see this knowledge as a key asset to finding employment (Open Doors, 2009). In order to achieve these goals, students are looking toward SA (study abroad) to experience the unique opportunity of immersing themselves in another culture and language. In a recent trend, many students choose to participate in shorter programs rather than the traditional semester-long program. In the 2009-2010 educational year, 56.6% of SA students participated in a short-term program as compared to 39.4% that chose a semester-long stay.

*Acknowledgements: The author wishes to acknowledge the assistance, guidance, and support of Dr. Gillian Lord, Dr. Theresa Antes, Dr. David Pharies, Dr. Paula Golombek, and Dr. Diana Boxer throughout this project. The author also wishes to thank the students who participated in this research.

Melanie Lynn D’Amico, Ph.D., assistant professor of Spanish and Linguistics, Department of Languages, Literatures, & Linguistics, Indiana State University.
L2 FLUENCY AND WILLINGNESS TO COMMUNICATE

As SA programs change to meet current students’ needs, it is important to evaluate how SA impacts learning within these new programs allowing for a greater understanding of the gains students may make. Along with short-term SA programs, similar AH (at-home) programs have also gained in popularity as students feel the pressure to complete their degrees faster. These programs, generally offered in the summer or between regular semesters, provide a fast-paced version of a full semester course. As with short-term SA, the question remains as to how much of an impact such intense instructional periods have on learners’ linguistic abilities.

Many L2 learners believe SA will provide the best opportunity to improve communication skills allowing them to become more fluent speakers. This is a logical conclusion, given that SA allows for a great amount of learner and NS (native speaker) interaction. Following the Input and Interaction Hypothesis, it is believed that through that interaction, learners will receive valuable linguistic information allowing them to progress in their language abilities (Gass, 1997). Furthermore, when considering the Output Hypothesis of Swain (2000), this interaction not only serves to provide information but also pushes learners to analyze their own language through production. Going beyond comprehending the input they receive, learners must be able to manipulate that input and work within the language system to be able to produce comprehensible output. Nonetheless, within research of communication skills, the question of how often learners take advantage of the interaction opportunities that surround them arises. How willing are learners to use their L2 when given the chance? These questions are important to ask when assessing communication and learning context, because it allows us, as researchers, to better understand learners’ experiences. If a learner is unwilling to communicate, how much of an impact can a learning context (SA or AH) have? These questions motivated the current study which seeks to explore the intricate relationship between short-term study, learning context, fluency, and WTC (Willingness to Communicate).

Literature Review

SA and Fluency

Following the idea that SA greatly impacts oral fluency, several studies have investigated SA to explore the ways in which that experience may influence learners’ speaking abilities. Within these projects, researchers have defined fluency by temporal, phonetic, and acoustic features, such as rate of speech, number of silent pauses, number of filled pauses (non-word sounds, i.e., “um”), speech drawls (lengthening of a sound), or mean length of fluent runs (a run of fluency speech free from dysfluencies). This definition is frequently applied to L2 speakers, and many aspects of this meaning are often employed in judging L2 proficiency. Looking at fluency from this point of view allows researchers to collect data in order to quantify fluency based on a pre-determined set of features, a method that has been used frequently.

Results from research exploring SA and L2 fluency have been largely positive demonstrating that after participating in SA, learners were able to significantly increase their speech rate and mean length of their fluent runs while at the same time significantly decreasing silent and filled pauses (Lennon, 1990; Freed, 1995; Freed, So, & Lazar, 2003; Isabelli-García, 2003; Freed, Segalowitz, & Dewey, 2004; Segalowitz & Freed, 2004; Segalowitz et al., 2004; O’Brien, Segalowitz, Freed, & Collentine, 2007). In a similar fashion, other studies have found positive results for increased speech rate and length of fluent runs, but were not able to show the same decrease of pauses (Towell, Hawkins, & Bazergui, 1996; Towell, 2002; Juan-Garau & Pérez-Vidal, 2007; Llanes & Muñoz, 2009). With the exception of Llanes and Muñoz (2009), these investigations evaluated learners from
semester-long (13 to 16 weeks) or year-long SA programs. Llanes and Muñoz researched learners participating in either a three- or four-week program, and demonstrated that in this shorter time period, the SA context can have a significant effect on L2 fluency similar to the effects of a longer-term program.

In attempting to further understand the impact of learning context, several investigations have compared SA learners to traditional AH learners (Freed, 1995; Freed et al., 2003; Freed et al., 2004; Segalowitz & Freed, 2004; Segalowitz et al., 2004; O’Brien et al., 2007). Overall, results have shown that within the same time period, SA learners make significantly more progress towards more fluent speech than AH learners. Additionally, these results demonstrate that learners in SA are not only benefitting from the additional coursework provided to them during the program, but also benefitting from the context. With the exception of Freed (1995), these studies have found this result for both intermediate- and advanced-level learners. Freed (1995) found that only intermediate-level learners were able to show an advantage for SA. Given that advanced-level learners are highly proficient in language skills, it is possible that learning context may not have as significant an impact on their abilities as is seen at lower levels.

Many studies investigating SA and L2 fluency (Isabelli-García, 2003; Segalowitz & Freed, 2004; Segalowitz et al., 2004; Freed et al., 2004; Derwing, Munro, & Thomson, 2007) have found a positive connection between the amount of L2 contact and use during the SA experience and the increase in fluency measures. Isabelli-García found that two of her three participants reported having more frequent and meaningful contact with NSs and were able to significantly improve in temporal fluency measures over the learner with less reported contact. The learner who showed limited change in fluency reported spending more time with other L1 (first language) speakers and did not develop personal relationships with NSs. Nonetheless, the small number of participants in this study weakens the results somewhat, in that it is difficult to know whether or not the same results would be seen with a larger participant group. This behavior may be very likely if all participants are part of the same study group at the same location abroad. As can be seen with larger participant populations in the SA context, as in Magnan and Back (2007), learners have a tendency to cluster together and avoid forming deep personal relationships with NSs. In some ways, it may be beneficial for learners to be part of a smaller learner group, because they may be more willing to branch out from their safety zone.

Segalowitz and Freed (2004) showed a slightly positive effect for L2 contact and increased fluency, whereas Segalowitz et al. (2004) and Freed et al. (2004) were able to find a stronger connection in that learners with more contact made greater improvements. As discussed by Swain (2000), the pressure to produce understandable output in a timely manner while interacting with NSs or more advanced NNSs (non-native speakers) most likely assisted these learners in improving their fluency. In comparing the amount of L2 contact during their programs, Freed et al. also considered learners in an intense IM (immersion context) at the home institution consisting of courses and out-of-classroom activities with a strict “French only” pledge. These IM learners reported a higher level of contact than SA learners who used the L1 frequently with other students. Results showed that although SA learners made improvements in length of turns, speech rate, filled pauses, repetitions, repairs, and mean length of fluent runs, IM learners had greater significant gains in all of these elements along with a larger amount of total words post-program. Since both groups had similar amounts of classroom-based instruction, it appears the increased L2 contact enabled IM learners to make additional progress.
Derwing et al. (2007) also found L2 contact to strongly impact fluency. Participants were 16 MLS (Mandarin language speakers) and 16 SLS (Russian and Ukrainian (Slavic) language speakers). Results showed that while initially there was no difference between the two groups, only SLS learners improved significantly over time. It was revealed that SLS learners spent more time interacting in English with NSs and NNSs, as well as spending more time listening to English talk radio; this additional L2 contact appears to have positively impacted their fluency. MLS learners reported difficulties in interacting with NSs based on a lack of common interests.

In sum, research of learning context has found that after participating in an immersion program, learners are considered more fluent in their L2 by showing faster rates of speech, fewer hesitations and dysfluencies, and in many cases producing longer fluent strings of speech. Further investigation into a variety of learners and programs is needed to help researchers better understand which situations favor increased fluency and which may hinder fluent speech. These results can be better understood when L2 contact is considered. As several studies have been able to demonstrate, learners who were able to have more frequent and meaningful contact in the L2 were able to show more improvement in fluency.

WTC

Given the findings discussed above, it appears that the opportunity for language use in the SA context plays an important role in improving L2 fluency. Nevertheless, we know that learners do not always take advantage of this opportunity, as was seen in Isabelli-García (2003). To explore this desire or lack thereof to use the L2, researchers have investigated the concept of WTC in the L2. Following the concept that learners must talk in order to learn, there is a general belief that learners who have a greater WTC in the L2 will make more progress in acquiring that L2 (MacIntyre & Charos, 1996).

Many L2 WTC studies thus far have been conducted at Canadian institutions investigating immersion programs. These investigations (Baker & MacIntyre, 2003; MacIntyre, Baker, Clément, & Conrod, 2001; MacIntyre, Baker, Clément, & Donovan, 2003a, 2003b; Clément, Baker, & MacIntyre, 2003) have all focused on WTC and frequency of L2 use, and the variables that can affect them. Participants for these studies were L1 English students learning French as an L2 in either immersion programs, or traditional foreign language programs (non-immersion). All data were collected by surveying large groups of learners by means of questionnaires about WTC, language anxiety, motivation, frequency of language use, perceived competence in the L2, and other similar topics. Results of these studies found that perceived competence and anxiety are strongly correlated with WTC. Originally believed to be an important factor of WTC, motivation did not highly correlate with WTC in most of these studies; the only study to find a strong connection between motivation and WTC was MacIntyre et al. (2003a) who found this to be true for immersion learners only. In exploring the differences between the two learning contexts, results from this body of research discovered that IMs tend to promote WTC as well as developing higher perceived competence and lowering anxiety levels.

In continuing to explore the question of WTC and learning context, Yashima, Zenuk-Nishide, and Shimizu’s study (2004) was the first study to research WTC with SA and AH learners. Results for the AH learners showed that frequency of communication was relatively low, since learners rarely used English outside of class. Nonetheless, for learners who had a higher level of WTC, frequency of communication was greatest, indicating that they communicated more in the classroom and outside of class than learners with lower WTC.
Once again, it was found that learners with higher perceived competence were more willing to communicate. Results for SA learners were similar to AH learners and confirmed that learners who had higher WTC more frequently participated in communication in the SA environment. It was found that higher WTC led to a development of strong interpersonal relationships during SA which then led to more frequent communication. Interestingly, Yashima et al. collected data both at the beginning and end of the SA program, yet they did not analyze their data for changes over time.

Adding another layer to their research, Yashima and Zenuk-Nishide (2008) investigated the relationship between proficiency and WTC with one SA group and two AH groups of participants. The participants were enrolled in one of two courses: communication-focused (SA and AH1) or grammar-focused (AH2). The researchers used questionnaires to assess WTC and the ITP TOEFL (Institutional Testing Programme Test of English as a Foreign Language) exam to assess language proficiency; a pre- and post-test design was employed to determine changes over time. Results revealed that SA learners demonstrated significantly higher levels of WTC than both AH groups both pre- and post-program. Additionally, results showed that AH1 students had significantly higher levels of WTC than AH2 students both pre- and post-program. The results suggest that level of WTC can determine the likelihood that students will choose to go abroad and to what extent they will choose to participate in communication-based courses. When considering the results of the proficiency test, the SA learners made larger gains than both AH groups. When looking at the AH groups themselves, results showed that AH1 learners had higher proficiency than AH2 learners who were in a class specifically designed to help them succeed in taking standardized tests. Therefore these results are particularly important in that they appear to support the notion that learners with higher levels of WTC in the L2 are able to demonstrate higher levels of proficiency; at the time of the present study, this research is the only empirical evidence known to support this belief.

Taken as a whole, previous WTC research has shown that learners in an IM (including SA) show higher levels of WTC than those in a traditional foreign language setting. Although these studies have been able to demonstrate that WTC leads to more frequent communication, to our knowledge, as of now, there has been only one empirical study by Yashima and Zenuk-Nishide (2008) that has explored a connection between WTC and linguistic abilities. Their findings concur with the belief of communication leading to acquisition and suggest that learners who are more willing to communicate will create more opportunities for interaction in the L2 therefore becoming more proficient in linguistic abilities. Nevertheless, there is still a need for additional empirical evidence of the possible relationship between a learner’s level of WTC and linguistic abilities.

Methodology

Research Questions

The goals of this study were to evaluate learners’ progress in oral fluency and WTC during intensive short-term language study and investigate any possible connections between these two factors. The research questions motivating this study were: (1) How does intensive short-term language study relate to learners’ fluency in Spanish? How does fluency differ among learners in an AH context versus those in an SA context?; (2) How does intensive short-term language study relate to learners’ WTC in Spanish? How does WTC differ among learners in an AH context versus those in an SA context?; and (3) What is the relationship between learners’ fluency in Spanish and their WTC in Spanish?
Participants

The total number of participants was 23, with 9 students in the SA group (7 female and 2 male) and 14 students in the AH group (7 female and 7 male). Participants were all NSs of English and were not proficient in any other language. All participants were classified as traditional university students from a North American university between the ages of 19 and 22. All students were enrolled in the same intermediate-high level grammar course designed to be the starting point for the third year of Spanish study. Both classes, SA and AH, were taught by university instructors and followed a similar lesson plan to develop writing skills and review grammatical structures. Given the fact that one program took place on the AH campus and the other in the SA setting, there were curricular differences that could not be controlled. Nonetheless, given the common prerequisites and the common syllabus and requirements, it was deemed an acceptable comparison between relatively equivalent groups.

Participants in the SA program spent six weeks in Santander, Spain and took two three-credit Spanish courses taught by home university instructors. The AH program was at the home university and was also six weeks long. The participants in this program were all enrolled in the same three credit intermediate-high grammar courses. Six students in the AH program were also enrolled in a second Spanish course.

To evaluate oral fluency, data were collected in the form of informal oral interviews following a pre- and post-program design. The interviews were approximately 15 minutes in duration and consisted of personal information and opinion questions that covered a variety of topics and grammatical structures. Two sets of interview questions were devised in order to ensure that the participants received different questions for each interview¹. A digital voice recorder was used to make recordings of the interviews for subsequent analysis.

A questionnaire inquiring about language contact was administered to all participants to measure weekly L2 use. The Language Contact Profile developed by Freed (1990, 1995) was the basis for this questionnaire; however, the investigator chose to develop a shorter version. The new questionnaire asked each participant to quantify the number of hours per day he/she spoke Spanish outside of class, with whom he/she spoke and for what purpose. Additionally, the questionnaire asked participants to indicate how many hours per day he/she spoke English. The survey also asked the participant to indicate how frequently he/she participated in certain non-speaking activities in Spanish, for example, watching TV in Spanish. Data were collected weekly using an internet-based survey program.

Following research methodology used by Freed (1995), Freed et al. (2004), and Segalowitz and Freed (2004), two 1-minute segments from each participant’s pre- and post-program interviews were extracted for analysis, yielding a total of 4 minutes of each participant’s speech. These segments were taken from approximately the fifth and tenth minute of both the pre- and post-interviews. Out of concern for the level of the learners and their abilities to answer more difficult opinion-based questions, only answers to descriptive questions were used in the data analysis. In order to determine fluency, each segment was evaluated on seven measures: (1) rate of speech—calculated on the basis of the number of non-repeated complete words per minute; (2) frequency of unfilled pauses—calculated by counting silences which are 0.4 seconds or longer in duration per minute; shorter silent pauses are characteristic of native speech and are not considered to be dysfluent; (3)

¹ The two sets of interview questions were counterbalanced to ensure that a similar style of questions using the same structures was asked during each interview.
frequency of filled pauses—calculated by counting filler sounds, drawls, sound stretches, or the filler L1 words like, or, okay, and yeah; (4) average length of fluent speech runs—calculated by averaging the total number of non-repeated complete words produced continuously without interruption by dysfluent pauses; (5) frequency of repairs—calculated by counting the number of repairs made per minute; repairs include repetition (of a word, syllable, or phrase), reformulations, self-corrections, and partial repeats; (6) frequency of L1 or created words used—calculated by counting the number of L1 words or non-words used per minute; and (7) clusters of dysfluencies—calculated by counting the number of clusters of dysfluencies occurring per minute. A cluster of dysfluencies is defined as two or more dysfluent elements grouped together.

Following the methodology that has been used in many WTC investigations, participant self-rating questionnaires exploring WTC in English and WTC in Spanish were employed in order to determine a quantified value of WTC for the participants. These questionnaires were based on WTC questionnaires designed by MacIntyre et al. (2001) to measure WTC in a variety of situations and contexts. A change was made from the original questionnaire in both reference to the language (then French, now Spanish) and the wording of the Likert scale instructions. Using a 5-point Likert scale, participants rated their willingness to participate in a given situation with 5 being “almost always willing to participate in this situation” and 1 being “almost never willing to participate in this situation” (please see Appendix for a copy of the questionnaire).

In pre-program, all participants completed a WTC in English questionnaire to act as a baseline for how willing participants are to communicate in their L1. Considering how willing some individuals may be when communicating in their L1 may help to explain how willing they are to communicate in their L2. Furthermore, it may help explain if certain individuals are particularly reserved or particularly outspoken. The WTC in Spanish questionnaire followed a pre- and post-program design in order to help establish how WTC may change over time for these participants. There was only one version of the questionnaire, but due to the nature of the questionnaire and the number of questions it was thought that participants would be unlikely to remember their original responses and would consider how they felt in that particular moment.

Results and Discussion

Fluency—SA Learners

When analyzing the SA group on their own, significant changes were seen over time. The results of a paired T-test, shown in Table 1, revealed that SA learners significantly increased speech rate, average length of fluent runs, and self-repairs. The first two measures indicated an increase in fluency. Although not found to be significant, there was a decrease seen in filled pauses that is approaching significance, \( p = 0.079 \). Once again this would be in the direction of more fluent speech. Although simple means showed a decrease in unfilled pauses and in the use of L1 and/or created words, these measures were not found to be significant.

---

2 Proper names using English pronunciation or English filled pause words were not counted. It was believed that learners at this level would not be familiar with Spanish equivalents of proper names and the English name could be recognized by NSs of Spanish.

3 The original questionnaires were for French as an L2 and the Likert instructions stated that 5 was for “almost always willing to speak French” and 1 for “almost never willing to speak French”.

4 Due to the overall smaller participant population and the difference in group size, non-parametric tests were also run and results were found to be the same with regards to significance.
Table 1

Paired T-Tests of Fluency Measures for SA Learners

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fluency measures (pre—post)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>Standard error mean</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Speech rate</td>
<td>-18.77</td>
<td>12.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>-4.69</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.002*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unfilled pauses</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>3.67</td>
<td>1.22</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filled pauses</td>
<td>1.67</td>
<td>2.48</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>2.01</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.079</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avg. length of fluent runs</td>
<td>-0.92</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>-2.90</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.020*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repairs</td>
<td>-1.94</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>-3.86</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.005*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L1/created words</td>
<td>2.50</td>
<td>5.55</td>
<td>1.85</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dysfluency clusters</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>1.91</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.560</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: * significance ≤ 0.05.

Following Swain (1993, 2000), it is likely that the pressure required by real-world interaction to produce output in a timely manner, assisted these learners in being able to produce more words at a faster rate of speech to meet the demand of responding to NSs. The significant improvement in average length of fluent runs indicates that SA learners were able to produce more words in a fluent string without any dysfluent interruptions. This result also suggests that these learners were capable of having longer stretches of fluency and thus able to create more “smoothness” to their speech as is so often discussed when defining fluent speech. When further considering these temporal features, both speech rate and average length of fluent runs have been found to be positive indicators of more fluent speech when assessing which measures are best for evaluating fluency (Raupach, 1987; Lennon, 1990; Riggenbach, 1991; Freed, 1995; Towell et al., 1996; Ejezenberg, 2000; Kormos & Dénes, 2004).

Since self-repairs are considered to be a dysfluency because they break the flow of natural speech, this increase indicates a move away from more fluent speech. However, when looking at the repairs that were made in the post-program interviews, 92% of them are correct repairs, while in the pre-program interviews, the repairs are only correct 73% of the time. Therefore, although repairs may be seen as a dysfluency, these learners were able to make correct repairs the majority of the time and with increased accuracy after SA. While it is unknown what caused this shift in behavior, two possibilities are seen: First, it is possible that from their increased interaction with NSs learners felt a need for greater grammatical accuracy in order to be understood, or second, after participating in the intensive grammar course, learners were more aware of their grammar production overall.

Also of interest here in the results of the SA group was that although there were significant increases in fluency predictors, there were no significant decreases in dysfluencies. As with the increase in self-repairs, the reason behind this lack of improvement in pauses and L1/created words is unknown. One possible reason for this lack of significant change may be that it is more difficult to reduce the amount of hesitations in one’s speech than it is to use additional words or speak at a faster rate.

Considering the use of L1 words, it might have been that because the participants knew that the interviewer was a native English speaker, and the interviews were completed in a casual style, they felt that it was permissible to use English words since they knew that the interviewer would understand their meaning. It would be useful to see if learners would continue to produce the same amount of English words if the interviewer was a native
Spanish speaker that spoke little English. The same can be said of the created words that were used in their speech, since these words were often Spanish versions of English words or some type of created word using English grammatical patterns that the interviewer was likely to understand. For example, in one SA student’s post-program interview, she was trying to say “It is very convincing” and produced *es muy convenzando* where convenzando is a combination of the Spanish gerund pattern for the first conjugation and the second conjugation verb convencer (“to convince”). While it is possible in English to use the gerund as the object of the copula to create an adjectival phrase, this is not possible in Spanish and the use of the adjective convincente is needed instead. However, as both an English and Spanish speaker, the interviewer was able to recognize the English grammar pattern while recognizing the root of the created word and understand this statement. The probability of an NS understanding this phrase is not particularly high and most likely would depend on how much interaction that NS has had with English.

In all, when considering these dysfluencies, it does appear that, while a non-significant decrease, SA learners may have been able to decrease their dysfluencies sufficiently enough to produce a greater average length of fluent runs. When looking further into where pauses (filled and unfilled) occurred in the speech segments it was hoped that a pattern might be found (for example, perhaps pauses occurred more before and after clauses), but this was not discovered.

**Fluency—AH Learners**

Results for AH learners showed significant changes from pre- to post-program, however such change was unexpected. The *T*-test analyses revealed two significant increases over time: unfilled pauses and dysfluent clusters (shown in Table 2). This result is rather surprising in that it was expected that silent pauses and clusters of such dysfluencies would be reduced over time. Rather than showing a shift toward an increase in fluency, the AH learners showed an increase in dysfluent features. All other fluency measures showed no significant change over time.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fluency measures (pre—post)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>Standard error mean</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Speech rate</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>12.17</td>
<td>3.25</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0.614</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unfilled pauses</td>
<td>-2.00</td>
<td>3.20</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>-2.34</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0.036*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filled pauses</td>
<td>-0.71</td>
<td>4.15</td>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>-0.64</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0.531</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avg. length of fluent runs</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>1.27</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0.225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repairs</td>
<td>-0.39</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>-0.99</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0.340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L1/created words</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>2.03</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0.342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dysfluency clusters</td>
<td>-1.39</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>-2.90</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0.012*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note.* * significance ≤ 0.05.

These findings indicate that at the time of the second interview AH learners had more hesitations in their speech resulting in a style of speech that was choppier. It appears that the intensive study in the traditional AH context did not show a positive impact on learners’ oral fluency. It is unknown why these learners did not show the same level of improvement as SA learners, but it is possible that their lack of change is due to the number of
hours of coursework during the program, a possibility that will be discussed in greater detail below. It is also possible that lower levels of interaction with NSs meant that AH learners did not experience the same time-pressure constraints as SA learners did. This possibility is also explored below in the analysis of language contact and fluency.

Analyses of means were also run for a sub-set of the six AH learners who took a second Spanish course, resulting in a total of six credit hours. Table 3 shows the results of paired T-tests for each fluency measure for this sub-set of learners. Results found a significant increase in the amount of repairs used by this group. This finding is similar to that of the SA group, who were enrolled in the same amount of credit hours of Spanish. It is possible that the additional hours of study influenced these learners’ awareness of grammar errors, resulting in more self-repairs when they perceived an error had been made. No other significant changes were seen for this group.

Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fluency measures (pre—post)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>Standard error mean</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Speech rate</td>
<td>1.92</td>
<td>11.13</td>
<td>4.54</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.691</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unfilled pauses</td>
<td>-1.83</td>
<td>3.41</td>
<td>1.39</td>
<td>-1.31</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filled pauses</td>
<td>-0.17</td>
<td>5.70</td>
<td>2.33</td>
<td>-0.07</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.946</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avg. length of fluent runs</td>
<td>-0.12</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>-0.46</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repairs</td>
<td>-1.17</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>-5.53</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.003 *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L1/created words</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>0.51</td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dysfluency clusters</td>
<td>-1.08</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>0.51</td>
<td>-2.14</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.086</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. * significance ≤ 0.05.

Unlike the complete group of AH learners, a significant change towards more hesitations is not shown here in these learners’ speech, nor were significant changes seen with speech rate and average length of fluent runs as was found for the SA learners. It appears then that the added coursework may have impacted fluency, but perhaps not as much as it did for the SA learners or that perhaps the SA learners gained more from their overall experience apart from the additional credit hours.

Fluency—Comparison of Groups

When comparing SA learners to AH learners, a series of univariate analyses of variance were run for each fluency measure to determine if there were any significant differences in fluency between the two groups at the beginning of the programs. The results of these analyses found a significant difference between the groups: AH learners produced a faster rate of speech pre-program ($p = 0.002$), than SA learners. These results indicate that initially the AH participants were more fluent speakers in that one measure than the SA participants. Analyses of all other measures revealed no significant differences between the groups.

In post-program, when comparing SA learners to AH learners for changes over time, a series of general linear models for each of the fluency measures were run; Table 4 presents the results of these analyses. Of the eight measures, five were found to be significantly different in favor of SA learners. Results showed that, over time, the SA group increased their speech rate, average length of fluent runs, and repairs significantly more than the AH learners. Of these, speech rate and average length of fluent runs, have been suggested as indicators of
fluency and willingness to communicate (Raupach, 1987; Lennon, 1990; Riggenbach, 1991; Freed, 1995; Towell et al., 1996; Ejezenberg, 2000; Kormos & Dénes, 2004). Correspondingly, the SA group decreased their unfilled pauses and clusters of dysfluencies significantly more than the AH learners. These two measures are characteristic of dysfluent speech and therefore, decreasing both is a move towards more fluent speech. No significant differences were seen between the two groups for the amount of filled pauses and the amount of L1 and/or created words used.

Table 4

Comparison of SA Learners to AH Learners for Changes in Fluency Over Time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fluency measures</th>
<th>Type III sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Speech rate</td>
<td>1,142.224</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1,142.224</td>
<td>15.674</td>
<td>0.001*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unfilled pauses</td>
<td>25.574</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>25.574</td>
<td>4.444</td>
<td>0.047*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filled pauses</td>
<td>15.528</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>15.528</td>
<td>2.381</td>
<td>0.138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avg. length of fluent run</td>
<td>4.647</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>4.647</td>
<td>8.487</td>
<td>0.008*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repairs</td>
<td>6.594</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>6.594</td>
<td>5.916</td>
<td>0.024*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L1/created words</td>
<td>10.569</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>10.569</td>
<td>1.476</td>
<td>0.238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clusters of dysfluencies</td>
<td>8.696</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>8.696</td>
<td>5.110</td>
<td>0.035*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. * significance ≤ 0.05.

In addition to the above comparison, SA learners were also compared to the sub-set of AH learners who took two Spanish courses during the six-week period. As above, a series of general linear models for each of the fluency measures were run; Table 5 presents the results of these analyses. Only one significant difference for speech rate was found between the two groups, indicating that SA learners had a faster speech rate at the end of the program than the sub-set of AH learners. This indicates that with regards to the other fluency measures the two groups were similar in their abilities. This finding is important, because it suggests that the additional three credit hours of study were beneficial to both groups in making improvements in these fluency factors. Furthermore, given that these learners were enrolled in a course designed to improve oral communication, it is not entirely surprising that they were able to show gains in fluency.

Table 5

Comparison of SA Learners to AH Learners With Two Spanish Courses for Changes in Fluency Over Time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fluency measures</th>
<th>Type III sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Speech rate</td>
<td>770.868</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>770.868</td>
<td>11.31</td>
<td>0.005*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unfilled pauses</td>
<td>15.022</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>15.022</td>
<td>2.35</td>
<td>0.150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filled pauses</td>
<td>6.050</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6.050</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>0.404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avg. length of fluent run</td>
<td>1.192</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.192</td>
<td>3.37</td>
<td>0.089</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repairs</td>
<td>1.089</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.089</td>
<td>1.45</td>
<td>0.250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L1/created words</td>
<td>6.613</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6.613</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clusters of dysfluencies</td>
<td>3.901</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.901</td>
<td>2.73</td>
<td>0.122</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. * significance ≤ 0.05.

Fluency and Amount of Spanish Used

Despite a similarity in improvement, the question remains as to why SA learners were able to show a faster speech rate than AH learners. Based on previous research findings, it is possible that the improvement seen by SA
learners was related to their context and their greater interaction with NSs. To explore this possibility, correlations were run to compare the fluency measures against the amount of Spanish used during the program. For these correlations the values from the post-program interviews were used for the fluency scores. Findings revealed no significant correlations between the amount of Spanish used and any of the fluency measures for any of the learners. SA learners reported spending over five hours a day speaking Spanish, and it was originally believed that a relationship would be found between this amount of language use and the fluency measures. However, no relationship was seen between this use and their fluency scores.

The same correlations were run for the AH group to determine if any significant relationships could be seen between their fluency and use of Spanish. Once again, as was seen with the SA group data, no significant relationship was seen between the amount of Spanish used and the fluency measures. AH learners reported a lower level of Spanish use, ranging from one to two hours per day, and it was previously believed that a possible relationship could be found between the amount of language used and fluency; yet, no such relationship is seen for these data.

Finally, when looking at the possible relationships between the total amounts of Spanish used during the programs and the fluency measures, correlations were run for all the participants together. Since there was a clear difference in the amount of Spanish used between the two groups, it was thought that perhaps when looking at the entire participant group, a relationship would be seen between language use and fluency features; yet again, no significant correlations were found between the among of Spanish used and fluency measures.

Originally, it was expected that some relationship would be established between the amount of L2 contact and the fluency improvement seen. When considering the additional qualitative data from language contact questionnaire, it can be seen that SA learners appear to have made close personal relationships with NSs and based on these relationships the learners had a large amount of Spanish communication. It is possible that through these relationships, learners were able to spend more time communicating, but this additional time does not appear to have impacted the learners’ fluency. Based on these results, the original expectation that learners who spent more hours communicating in Spanish would make more significant progress in fluency than learners who reported lower levels of communication must be rejected. However, perhaps it is not the quantity of communication that should be considered by rather the quality of that communication.

**WTC—SA Learners**

To analyze the WTC questionnaire data, a score was determined based on the 5-point Likert scale for the highest possible total of 80 points (16 questions with a 5 for each question). Initially a univariate analysis of variance was run on the WTC in English questionnaire data to determine if any learners were significantly willing or unwilling to use their L1 as compared to the other learners in their group. Results showed no significant differences between the learners with respect to WTC in English. Similarly, a univariate analysis of variance was run on the WTC in Spanish pre-program data, and again no learner was found to be significantly more or less willing to communicate in Spanish than others in their group. In order to analyze the changes in WTC for statistically significant differences, a paired $T$-test was run. When considering the changes over time for SA learners, results showed a significant increase in WTC, presented in Table 6. This finding indicates that learning context appears to have impacted WTC, in other words, as learners spent more time interacting with NSs, they
appear to have become more willing to communicate in Spanish. This result was expected based on results from previous research into WTC and immersion programs.

Table 6  
*Paired T-Test of WTC in Spanish for SA Learners*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WTC section (pre—post)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>Standard error mean</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Speaking</td>
<td>-6.77</td>
<td>7.27</td>
<td>2.42</td>
<td>-2.79</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.023*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: * significance ≤ 0.05.

In order to further explore this connection between WTC and the amount of time spent using the L2, a series of correlations were run between the results of the WTC and the language contact questionnaires. No statistically significant results were found connecting the two data sets. Like fluency, it may be that the amount of Spanish used was not as important a factor in influencing WTC as the quality of the communication. It is possible that SA learners became more willing to communicate in Spanish through developing deep personal relationships with NSs and inspired them to seek out similar relationships with other Spanish speakers in the future.

**WTC—AH Learners**

As with the SA group, univariate analyses were run for both the WTC in English and the WTC in Spanish pre-program questionnaires in order to determine if there were any individuals who were significantly different from the group. Results of these tests revealed no significant differences, indicating that all learners were equally willing to communicate in the respective languages (This is to say that they were equal within each language, not that their WTC was the same for both languages). Again, as was performed for the SA group, a paired *T*-test was run to analyze the change over time for WTC in Spanish. No significant difference was seen over time for WTC for the AH learners (seen Table 7). The sub-set of AH learners who took two Spanish courses was also considered here, although unlike with fluency, no differences were seen between this group and the entire group of AH learners. The results of a paired *T*-test revealed that no significant difference was seen over time (*p* = 0.443).

Table 7  
*Paired T-Test of WTC in Spanish for AH Learners*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WTC section (pre—post)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard deviation</th>
<th>Standard error mean</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Speaking</td>
<td>-3.92</td>
<td>11.09</td>
<td>2.96</td>
<td>-1.32</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0.208*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: * significance ≤ 0.05.

Different from SA learners, these AH learners were not able to show a significant increase in WTC. However, it is important to note that AH learners had a high starting level of WTC, reporting themselves to be fairly willing to communicate in most situations, and that they maintained that level over time. As with SA learners, correlations were run between WTC and the amount of Spanish used. Results revealed no significant correlation between the two data sets. Again, it appears that the amount of Spanish used was not an impacting factor for WTC. The lack of increase of WTC seen for the AH group may also be tied to quality of communication. Since AH learners did not report having the same high-level quality of communication that the SA group experienced, it is possible that there were no environment-based factors to influence their WTC.
WTC—Comparison of Groups

At the outset when comparing the SA group to the AH group, a univariate analysis of variance was run to determine if there were any statistically significant differences in WTC in Spanish levels between the two groups. The results of this test found no significant difference between the SA and AH learners. In other words, both groups started their programs with comparably equal levels of WTC in Spanish. This is important because it shows that while the SA group is a naturally self-selected group, there is no indication that this group is naturally more willing to communicate in Spanish than those learners in the AH group (O’Brien, 2004). To compare the change over time in WTC between the SA and AH learners, a general linear model was run; the results of the model are presented in Table 8. As can be seen, no significant difference between the SA and AH learners was found. Again, the SA learners were also compared to the sub-set of AH learners but no significant difference was seen between the two groups. The lack of difference between the two groups along with the high WTC scores indicates that at this level all of the participants were generally very willing to use Spanish when given the opportunity. There may be a subtle difference in change to WTC over time due to the quality of communication between the two groups, but this difference was not great enough to be statistically significant.

Table 8
Comparison of SA Learners to AH Learners for Change in WTC Over Time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WTC section</th>
<th>Type III sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Speaking</td>
<td>22.236</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td>22.236</td>
<td>0.461</td>
<td>0.504*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. * significance ≤ 0.05.

Connection Between Fluency and WTC

One of the three main goals of this study was to attempt to show a relationship between fluency and willingness to use Spanish. To analyze these possible links, correlations were run between the fluency measures and WTC. Three sets of correlations were conducted, the first for SA learners only, the second for AH learners only, and the third for the entire group of participants. The results of all three sets of correlations found no significant correlation for this data between WTC and fluency. It appears that based on this data set for these participants, there is no indication that WTC influences fluency or vice versa. To further explore any connections between fluency and WTC, the data were reviewed on a case-by-case basis. Again, no connections between WTC and fluency were found. It appears that these two factors may be independent of each other. For example, in the SA group, the learner with the lowest fluency scores both pre- and post-program had one of the highest WTC scores, meaning that although this participant had trouble producing fluent speech he/she was still very willing to use Spanish.

Conclusions

For certain learners, intensive short-term language study was shown to have a positive impact on oral fluency by improving specific temporal features of speech. SA learners were able to show significant improvement that supports the findings of previous research (Lennon, 1990; Freed, 1995; Towell et al., 1996; Towell, 2002; Isabelli-Garcia, 2003; Freed et al., 2003; Freed et al., 2004; Segalowitz & Freed, 2004; Segalowitz et al., 2004; O’Brien et al., 2007; Juan-Garau & Pérez-Vidal, 2007; Llanes & Muñoz, 2009). In the case of AH
learners, the intensive period of study does not appear to have had much of an impact on fluency in that significant improvements were not seen. Significant increases were found for hesitations indicating a shift away from more fluent speech. This does not necessarily mean that the intensive study had a negative impact on fluency. Given that only two minutes of the data were analyzed, it would be rather rash to make such a strong statement. This methodology of analyzing two minute-long samples has been fairly common in prior research (Freed, 1995; Freed et al., 2003; Freed et al., 2004; Segalowitz et al., 2004; O’Brien et al., 2007) and was selected with the hope of obtaining comparable results. Yet, perhaps it is necessary to look at larger segments of data before being able to make a more decisive conclusion.

When comparing the SA group to the AH group, it was found that SA learners made significantly greater improvement, again supporting prior research (Freed, 1995; Freed et al., 2003; Freed et al., 2004; Segalowitz et al., 2004; O’Brien et al., 2007). However, when comparing a sub-set of AH learners who were enrolled in the same amount of credits as SA learners, only one significant difference was found: a faster speech rate for SA learners. This finding indicates that perhaps additional study, in particular study with a focus on oral communication, can lead to gains in fluency regardless of learning context. In prior research, the amount of credit hours has not been analyzed, but may be an additional reason behind the improvements in fluency. In many language-based SA programs, learners have the opportunity to take a larger amount of credits in their L2 than they normally would in an AH setting. Based on the results seen here, future studies should consider these additional credit hours.

Nonetheless, the SA learners from the current study did manage to show an improvement over all of the AH learners in speech rate. Logically, this would lead one to believe that learning context might play a role in this improvement. While previous investigations (Isabelli-García, 2003; Segalowitz & Freed, 2004; Segalowitz et al., 2004; Freed et al., 2004) were able to show that learners who spent more time interacting with NSs and using their L2 made greater improvement in fluency, the current study was not able to replicate these findings. What then is the reason for this difference? It is possible that the quality of the communication can explain the different findings. SA learners reported spending many hours of extended conversations with their host family on their language use surveys. Perhaps, through longer spontaneous conversations that broke away from the formulaic speech these learners were able to develop skills that enabled them to increase their speech rate. Unfortunately, for this data set, the AH learners had a tendency to leave that question blank on the questionnaire. We might assume then that the AH learners did not participate in extended conversations, but cannot for sure if they simply did not report their extended conversations. It does appear useful to find ways in which to capture this type of quality of language use. In addition to collecting controlled interviews designed to elicit learner speech and/or measure other elements (such as proficiency), data collection may need to move towards natural data as means of better understanding how learners use language while abroad and how it may impact their oral fluency.

In the case of WTC, it appears that it is positively impacted by short-term SA showing an increase in WTC; yet, it does not seem to be as strongly influenced by AH study which showed only maintenance of WTC but no increase. The findings of this study support the findings of Yashima and Zenuk-Nishide (2008), an important result given that it is the only other study to assess changes in WTC over time (at the time of the current study). Furthermore, when it is considered that the participants from Yashima and Zenuk-Nishide (2008) participated in
a 10-month SA program, it is impressive that the SA learners from this study were able to show similar results after only having been abroad for six weeks. For all participants in this study, WTC was reported to be quite high, indicating that these learners were very likely to use Spanish when given the opportunity. There are limitations, however, to the method used to assess WTC, in that all data were self-reported by the participants. Although not possible for this research, future studies should attempt to look at WTC from other sources in order to explore a multi-faceted view of WTC.

The final element considered in the current study was a possible relationship between WTC and oral fluency. However, the results found here were not able to find a connection between the two. This result is different from that of Yashima and Zenuk-Nishide (2008) who were able to show a connection between WTC and linguistic ability, specifically language proficiency. Of course it is important to remember here that oral fluency is not equivalent to language proficiency. It was originally hypothesized that learners who were more willing to communicate would demonstrate more fluent speech. However, the results of this study do not support this hypothesis. Based on the results shown here, it is possible that learners do not consider their own abilities when assessing their WTC, and while they may be lacking by linguistic measures, this does not mean that they are lacking in their willingness to use the L2. In searching for a possible relationship between WTC and fluency, further research is needed that can look at both of these factors in multiple ways. It may be that temporal features of fluency do not show a connection to WTC, but other features which pertain to a more complex definition of fluency might. Additionally, if other data are collected on WTC that incorporates different viewpoints, outsider observation as well as self-reported data for example, this may assist with finding the possible connection.

References


L2 FLUENCY AND WILLINGNESS TO COMMUNICATE


Appendix: Willingness to Communicate in Spanish Questionnaire

Name: _____________________  Program? Santander/On Campus

This questionnaire is composed of statements concerning your feelings about communication with other people in Spanish and about completing various activities in Spanish. In the space provided, please indicate the frequency with which you choose or would choose to use Spanish in each situation using the following numerical scale. You may not have encountered all of these situations, but given how you feel in other situations, and what you know of yourself, please do your best to judge how willing to communicate...
you would be. Remember there is no right or wrong answer to these questions/situations, this survey is just to look at how and when people choose to communicate.

1 = almost never willing to participate in this situation
2 = somewhat willing to participate in this situation
3 = willing to participate half of the time in this situation (50-50)
4 = usually willing to participate in this situation
5 = almost always willing to participate in this situation

1. Speaking with a group of Spanish class students about your summer vacation. _____
2. Speaking to your teacher in Spanish about your homework assignment. ______
3. Speaking one-on-one with a classmate about your plans for tonight. ______
4. A stranger enters the room you are in, how willing would you be to have a conversation if he talked to you first? ______
5. You are confused about a task you must complete for class, how willing are you to ask for instructions/clarification from your teacher? ______
6. Talking to a friend while waiting in line. ______
7. Talking to a stranger while waiting in line. ______
8. How willing would you be to be an actor in a play in Spanish? ______
9. Describe the rules of your favorite game to a native Spanish speaker friend. ______
10. Play a game in Spanish, for example Jeopardy. ______
11. Give a presentation in Spanish class. ______
12. Give a presentation to a group of native Spanish speakers. ______
13. Order food in a restaurant while in a Spanish-speaking country. ______
14. Report your stolen wallet to the police while in a Spanish-speaking country. ______
15. Ask a salesperson in a store for help while in a Spanish-speaking country. ______
16. Talk to a stranger you find attractive at a bar. ______
Variation and Change in Danish Nominal Morphology

Michael Ejstrup
Danish School of Media and Journalism, Aarhus, Denmark

The Danish language has a comprehensive morphology, both as regards inflection, derivation, and composition. Canonical nominal morphological paradigms are formed as opposed to examples of the variation found in modern Danish regional dialects anno Domini 2008. Danish has a phoneme based on writing system which is not suitable for investigating morphological variation in Danish. A new corpus of spoken language shows the very substantial variation in Danish nominal morphology, and this variation is shown to be enormous. New analyses concerning variation and change in Danish morphology seem extremely important, before research in logopaedic treatment and the acquisition of Danish morphology of little children can even start.

Keywords: morphology, noun, dialect, Danish, language variation

The Danish Language Seen From the Ivory Tower

During the past decades, a common claim that the Danish dialects are dying has been “aired” quite often in both the printed and the electronic media. Lately, dialectologists have said both in national newspapers and on the Danish radio that now the dialects are in a really bad state; they are said to be almost non-existing. On November 21, 2007, the Danish newspaper Politiken claimed:

Danish dialects are more or less extinct. Almost all children are taught to speak standard Danish. The Danish language has become so standardized that the dialects are dead or dying. That is the conclusion made by a number of linguists, says Kristeligt Dagblad, another Danish newspaper. Recent research shows that you can no longer find environments outside the capital where children and young people find it natural to use the same dialect for communication as their grandparents.

The question for the quotation might well be if the findings are worth mentioning. Was there ever a time when children and young people found it natural to speak in the same dialect as their grandparents? The author doubts it!

In his book The Euphony (Vellyden) (2003), Skyum-Nielsen claimed that among other things syllables disappeared, because they were not being pronounced clearly and correctly. The phenomenon is called syllable cannibalism (Skyum-Nielsen, 2003). Syllables being added or subtracted is a well-known and well-documented phenomenon in natural language development in languages all over the world. In Swedish, we find for instance snigel, spegel, and vatten, which are all two-syllable words; in Danish, however, we have snegl, spejl, and vand, which is part of a natural linguistic development where post tonic syllables are lost in Danish. In Finnish, you count to three using the words üksi, kaksi, and kolmen; in Estonian, the words are üks, kaks, and kolm, another example of a linguistic historical change in the number of syllables. In Latin, to write is scribere and a slave is sclavus; today the same words with the same meaning in Italian are scrivere and schiavo; in French, the words are
écrire and éslave. The first word has lost a post tonic syllable, and both words have an added pretonic syllable; these linguistic phenomena are well-documented and well-known as parts of natural language development.

Linguistic research now shows that Danish, which, by the way, has a long tradition of reducing and deleting post-tonic schwa syllables, is still moving towards a change that has already happened in the Western part of the country and is relatively fast happening to the language in Copenhagen. This change is happening in the eastern part of the country. Only Bornholm, a relatively isolated enclave, is situated even more towards the east. Loss of post-tonic schwa syllables has a very large influence on Danish inflexional morphology because indeed a very large part of Danish inflexional morphology consists of the suffixing of phonetic elements with a schwa. Also pre-tonic introductory syllables are being subject to change and reduction where more than one syllable occurs; well-known examples from spoken language in Copenhagen are frikadeller, lokomotiver, and cigaretter ((friq'delr), (logmo'tsiq), and (sj'grødn)) (Brink & Lund, 1974).

Writing in Danish

Danish has a well-developed system of both derivation morphology and inflexion morphology (Jacobsen & Skyum-Nielsen, 1996) and (Burcharoth, 1988) plus a comprehensive and varied compositional morphology system where prosodic items form important elements in the linguistic system. Those items are well-documented for standard Danish as the language is pronounced in selected areas of Copenhagen (Grønnum, 2005) and (P. M. Hansen, 2003). For example, we find prosodic differences in the pronunciation of: (1) Sofa (indef), en sofa (defindefsing), sofa-en (defsing.), sofa-er (indefplu), and sofa-er-ne (defplu); (2) Hør-bar (verb toadj), hør-lig (verb toadj), hør-ing (verb to nom), hør-else (verb to nom), and hør-t (verb tointerj); (3) en halvstegtkylling—(n'hael'sdegd'kylîn); and (4) en halvstegtkylling—(nhael'sdegd'kylîn).

Not everybody would agree that the written language is trying to infiltrate descriptions of the language spoken in Copenhagen; examples are the notation of low, rounded front vowels, phonological interpretation of /a/, and nasal consonants (Grønnum, 2005).

Written Language and Phonology

The written language cannot be a guideline for the interpretation. Firstly, it has no unambiguous connection with the former situation of the language or the pronunciation in Norwegian and Swedish.

The Danish written language is extremely fixed, and the regulations are compiled in Retskrivningsordbogen (Official Danish Orthography Dictionary) (Dansk, 2012), edited and published by the official institution Dansk Sprognævn (the Danish Language Council). Retskrivningsordbogen exerts a huge authoritative influence on language used in Danish media, on teachers’ teaching of pupils in the Danish state school, and on the teaching of future teachers for the Danish state school during their training (Hansen, 1991). On February 9, 2008, Politiken (a Danish newspaper) said:

Conversation and writing further understanding, but only if the sentences are working. Even though loads of sentences flow from mouths and keyboards, only a few modern Danes are very much aware of grammar and syntax. One wonders how the sentences can be both clear and striking as there is just a minimum of linguistic insight.

1 Danish spoken language corpora from six regions in Denmark collected and analyzed between 2005 and 2008. To be introduced in connection with a Ph.D. defence in 2009.
2 The phrase standard Danish is used about the kind of spoken Danish which is close to the written language, and which is also used in the media and the theatres for reference.
Written Danish is a phoneme based writing system with 29 letters which corresponds more or less with phonemic segments in one of more possible phonemic interpretations of a spoken language as standard Danish mentioned above. In many areas, the spoken language can be compared with the language spoken in closely defined areas of Copenhagen and only to a lesser degree with other forms of spoken Danish. Also problematic issues exist as written Danish has only nine vowel graphemes (i, e, æ, a, y, ø, u, o, and å), but 20 consonant graphemes (p, t, k, b, d, g, f, s, h, v, m, n, l, r, j, c, q, w, x, and z). Of these the first 15 correspond with phonemic elements in standard Danish, and the last five are rarely used—and with redundancy compared to the other graphemes. A possible phonemic analysis of standard Danish operates 15 initial consonant phonemes and 14 final; 10 vowel phonemes are used, all of which differ distinctively as short, long, and (long) with a special prosody (called *stød* [glottal stop] in standard Danish). This creates a redundancy compared with the writing of consonants, as all the phonemic elements of the Danish vowel system cannot be seen in writing. Stress is free and distinctive in all variations of Danish; as is the degree of stress. This cannot be seen in Danish writing Example 1 and is important compared with Danish word formation which plays a very important role in all variations of Danish, for example, in words like *forkoge* and *regne med*. Both graphemic elements have at least two readings resulting in very different meanings determined by the placement of the phonemic stress (see Examples 1-4).

Example (1) (’fɒ(ː)kægdə) “kogtførvejen” (preboiled)
Example (2) (fɒ’kægdə) “kogt for meget” (boiled too much)
Example (3) (’kʰjʊnmɛ) “have tillidiit” (have confidence in)
Example (4) (ʊqɛ;mɛ) “lægetilantallet” (add to a certain number)

Stress and degrees of stress also play a very important role in Danish concerning syntax. Examples are...

Example (5) (’hul的颜色 s’fældnepʰ’ɔ’hyln) “har placeret cigaretterne på en bestemthylde”
(having placed the cigarettes onto a certain shelf)
Example (6) (hul的颜色 s’fældnepʰ’ɔ’hyln) “er holdt op med at ryge” (having stopped smoking)
Example (7) (hul的颜色 s’fældnepʰ’ɔ’flæsn) “har fysisk slået sig på en flaske”
(having hurt oneself physically on a bottle)
Example (8) (hul的颜色 s’fældnepʰ’ɔ’flæsn) “drikker for meget alkohol” (drinking too much alcohol)

Written Danish\(^3\) builds on three main principles involving either/or: (1) one to one correspondence between grapheme and phone/phoneme: e.g., the graphemes l, m, f, and s both initial and final correspond with the similar phones and phonemes in words like *sul*, *lus*, *mus*, *sum*, *puf*, and *fup*; (2) regular correspondence between grapheme and phone/phoneme: e.g., the double consonant graphemes correspond with the pronunciation of a short vowel sound in words that have no short vowel in the last syllable. The vowel grapheme for a short non-low front vowel corresponds with a short vowel sound one step down, as in *hvas*, *kasse*, *hvis*, and *nisse* (’væs), (’kʰæs(ə)), (’vɛs), and (’ngs(ə)); and (3) irregular correspondence between grapheme and phone/phoneme: Danish has many very frequent morphs/morphemes and words spelt with a very irregular correspondence between grapheme and phone/phoneme, e.g., the morphemes -er, -re, -ere, and -et; the three

---

\(^3\) A more thorough account is to be left to posterity.
former blend into the morph/phone (υ) in many, but not all variations in Danish, whereas the latter has the form (οδh), (ος), (οδ), (ον), in which forms the vowel can be omitted into the bargain. And the very frequent words like jeg (jʊ), (jʊ), (jœ), (a), and (å); mig (mʊ), (mæ), (mʊ), and (mc); meget (mʊd), (mʊd), (mæ), (mæ); and af (æ)/(/æ); (i)ø)/(/ø), (ø)/(/ø), and (ø)/(/ø).

Old Methods

This means that written Danish is not suitable for an investigation of morphological variation and change in Danish. The written language is particularly normative and conservative; linguistic changes, apart from the incorporation of new words, are rare and late arrivals in written Danish. The many variations have trouble finding a place in written Danish. The same goes for a point of departure in spoken standard Danish spoken language where informants read aloud lists of words and selected examples. The pronunciation and the morphological forms appearing will be formed on the basis of a normative and archaic written language. These recordings and the derived morphological forms of course only hold diachronic interest, but the method will give a distorted and simplified picture of the morphological status of modern Danish anno Domini 2008. Morphological change and variation in Danish cannot be described satisfactorily using this method; a picture will emerge that will not render a just and fair description of the very large variations in Danish morphology.

Modern Methods

Bearing those considerations in mind, a different and new method has to be invented to secure a fair description of the morphological variation of modern Danish as it is to be found in the various regional variants of modern Danish anno Domini 2008. Many outstanding and thorough descriptions of Danish dialects as they were described in the previous century exist. Among them are Skautrup’s huge work Dansk Sprog Historie (The History of the Danish Language), where minute details show that there was a very significant morphological diversity in spoken Danish (Skautrup, 1944-1970). If you take a look at the grammars used in the teaching of Danish in state schools, at teacher training colleges, and in universities, you will see that Danish morphological diversity fades away completely, and only the written language and a strongly prescriptive standard Danish oral language appear. If you include teaching material from the instruction of speech trainers, reading specialists, and audiopedic specialists at teacher training colleges and universities, a similar prescriptive language picture will emerge. So the basis for the teaching of oral Danish is a common Danish language with specific references to a very restricted area in the eastern part of Copenhagen, which is situated also as far to the east as you can go in Denmark. The usage of language in teaching materials for phonetics/phonology/morphology seems more or less to skip phonetic/phonological and morphological elements which are widespread in regional variants outside that restricted area in Copenhagen.

Modern Danish Spoken Language Corpus

So it seems proper to get a description of this modern morphological variation in spoken Danish. It would only be possible by compiling a modern spoken language corpus which is completely without influence from the prescriptive powers of the written language and without the normative influence from people speaking a non-regional language. Such a spoken language corpus was compiled in 2006 in order to be able to give an acoustic description of the vowels in different variants of Danish. The regions were chosen to form a line from

---

4 Further details of the spoken language corpus will be revealed in connection with the handling in of the Ph.D. thesis.
the most eastern part of the area around the Baltic Sea to the coast of the North Sea. The corpus is based on 70 informants and 35 hours of spontaneous speech. The distribution between male and female is equal; none of the informants is more than 45 years of age, and no one is under 19 years old. All informants were born and raised in the region that they represent, and they have not lived outside that region for a long period of time. This spoken language corpus has provided a perfect opportunity to describe morphological variation in spoken Danish language as of 2008.

**Danish Nominal Morphology**

Here will be described only material elements in the variation in morphological inflexion of nominal and prosodic elements attached to word composition in modern Danish.

In Danish, written language normal nouns take one of two possible grammatical genders: the common gender and the neuter. That system also exists in the morphology of adjectives. The conjugation of adjectives will normally depend on the nouns. Adjectives can also occur as adverbials in combination with the neuter form of the adjective, which is often found where an adjective is used adverbially. There are many exceptions from that rule, and in particular derived base forms of adjectives are often heard in most variants alongside the neuter forms of the same adjectives in adverbial position. According to *Retskrivningsordbogen* and other prescriptive grammars, Danish nouns can form plurals with a number of non-productive morphemes such as -e (ə), umlaut and the productive suffix -er (ə). According to the same works, nouns have a base form which is the indefinite form with no morphological marking; a definite form in the singular which is different from the nouns of the common gender and the neuter, with the suffixes -en and et. The pronunciation of those morphemes are different in various parts of Denmark, e.g., (ən), (n), (əd), (d), (ød), and (d). The pronunciation of the morphological marking of finiteness in the singular influences in a number of instances the length of the consonant and the vowel of the base form; also the addition of a special prosody in the resulting word form may occur. Formation of the plural of nouns is, as mentioned above, made by various morphological suffixes. It seems not to be possible to set up regular taxonomies for morphological formation of the plural attached to the nouns being of either the common gender or the neuter.

Apart from a few diachronically arisen exceptions, the definite plural forms of nouns are formed by adding the suffixes -ne or -ene according to the phonetic relations. Also these morphemes are pronounced differently in various parts of the country. A spreading change is gaining ground where the vowels of morphemes are lost, and syllables disappear in words such as dreng-e-ne (ˈdreŋ̩ənə), pige-r-ne (ˈpʲɪɡ̩ən̩ə)/ˈpʰɪɡ̩ən̩ə), and føl-ene (ˈfʊl̩ənə). No distinction is made then in the plural forms of the nouns neither in the indefinite or definite forms between the neuter and the common gender. Concerning the morphology of adjectives the distinction is only in the singular indefinite form between the common gender and the neuter. There is a distinction between the base form of the adjective that is now a diacronic lost feminine form, and a form with the addition of an apical alveolar stop, in writing -t. The sound is only added when it is in accordance with Danish phonotax. Where the sound forms extensive consonant clusters, it is omitted both in spoken language and in writing in words such as springsk, svensk, and træls. In the morphological system of adjectives, there is also a common form where an -e (ə) is added to the base form. In modern Danish anno Domini 2008, that form is rarely heard pronounced as an independent element except in very regular media and stage language. The form of many lexemes can be heard as different from the base form as a change in the length of the consonant or vowel of the base form. The orthographic form is connected with the singular definite form, the plural definite form, and the indefinite form.
Word or Morpheme

In Danish, the marking of the indefinite form of nouns in the singular traditionally appears as an article, which in the written language is separated from the lexeme by a space; the marking of definiteness is with the same grapheme, but as a suffix of the lexeme. This means that the indefinite marking of nouns is seen as an independent word, whereas the marking of definiteness of the same lexemes is a morphological suffix. When a noun is connected to a moderator or a specification in the form of an adjective, the marking of definiteness is in pre-position as an independent word with no main stress. This distinction is of course totally unacceptable as we are dealing with elements which are inseparable as linguistic elements of a full system. All markers of definiteness are hereafter considered morphological elements whether or not the writing separates them from a lexeme or not. In Danish, there is an additional generic form of nouns appearing in connection with syntactic constructions where the verb has no stress, and the noun has neither a definite nor an indefinite marking (see Examples 9-12).

Example (9) *Drikkeøl* (d̥r̥k̥eøl)/(d̥r̥k̥e′øl)—the generic use; drinking an unlimited amount of beer of some kind.

Example (10) *Drikke en øl* (d̥r̥k̥e øn̥øl)/(d̥r̥k̥e′øl̥n̥l̥)—drinking an unknown, but limited amount of beer.

Example (11) *Drikkeøllen* (d̥r̥k̥eøl̥n̥)/′(d̥r̥k̥e′øl̥n̥′l̥)—drinking a certain amount of beer; an amount of beef that is known by both the speaker and the receiver of the message.

Furthermore there is the restriction that the amount cannot be followed by any more beer.

All those forms are seen to be marked morphologically either by the presence of morphologic material or the absence thereof as opposed to the normally required marking with morphologic material, be it either pre- and post-positioned morphologic marking.

Morphologic Variation in Nouns in the Western Part of Jutland

The corpus mentioned above shows that all informants from the western part of Jutland do not use the indefinite article *et*. They consistently use the indefinite article *en* and pre-positioned (*e*) as the definite article, such as: (1) *en hus*, *en træ*, *en vindue*; (2) *vedsidenafkirken* (v̥e′si̥n̥e̥f̥i̥k̥e̥̥n̥k̥e̥̥); and (3) *udepåøen* (′u′de̥p̥a′ø̥n̥).

The demonstrative pronoun in the plural *de* is not used and is pronounced as *dem*. As can be expected the neuter is heard to be used about more or less abstract uncountables, such as: *er vi så færdige med det*, where the question refers to a whole paragraph of a scenery that has just been mentioned very thoroughly. There is also a phonetic discrepancy between: (1) the indefinite article *en* (′en)/′(′o′); and (2) the number *en* (′en̥̥n̥).

Accordingly, the words related to the number are pronounced: *ene*—(′en̥̥n̥), *alene*—(′en̥̥n̥n̥), and *ens*—(′en̥̥n̥).

The inflection of adjectives follows this pattern completely; as does the adverbial inflection in relation to the adjectives so that no apical stop is added. The plural of the inflection of the adjectives is consistent, but with an almost consistent schwa assimilation or apocope resulting in the glottal stop of the western part of Jutland in short vowels in front of a stop, such as: (′l̥u̥n̥̥n̥), (′h̥ḁg̥), and (′s̥u̥k̥t̥s̥) *l̥an̥̥g̥e̥*, *h̥o̥j̥e̥*, and *s̥o̥r̥t̥e̥*.

Sometimes the definite article is being omitted in idiomatic expressions such as: *vedsidenaf* (v̥e′s̥i̥n̥e′f̥a′).

The expression is also heard to be used with the article in pre-position: *vedsidenaf* (v̥e′s̥e′g̥a′).
The use of consistent pre-positioning is unfailing and consistent for all the informants from the western part of Jutland.

In the plural forms of the substantives sometimes variations of the standard norm can be heard. These forms were heard repeatedly: hjule (ˈjuːl̥), bene (ˈbɛn̥), glasser (ˈɡlk̥aːs̥), and skaber (n plu) (ˈsk̥ab̥er̥).

Word Formation in the Western Part of Jutland

Word formation is another category where a specific morphologic variation is heard. The informants from the western part of Jutland often pronounce composita with a one-syllable first part where this first part outside the compositum has a glottal stop in a final sonorant consonant. That glottal stop disappears as a part of the compositum where the sonorant consonant is then prolonged, e.g., (1) håndtag (ˈhɒn̥t̥aːɡ̥), livrem (ˈlɪv̥r̥em), vindue (ˈvɪn̥duː), fuldskæg (ˈful̥dsk̥æɡ̥), and vandhul (ˈvɑ̃d̥hul̥). So in the syllables long sonorant consonants appear as a result of morphologic alternation. That phenomenon is seen to be disputed (Grønnum, 2005).

Against that is the word: (2) ølkrus (ˈøl̥k̥rus̥). As expected it has no long consonant in the first part, as the first part outside the compositum has no glottal stop. In composita in connection with one-syllable first part which outside the compositum has no glottal stop in a short vowel before stop, a glottal stop is often heard in the first part of the compositum, e.g., (3) opleve (ˈɒl̥p̥lev̥), rakværk (ˈrɑ̃k̥væːrk̥), and topstykke (ˈtɒp̥st̥ɪk̥ke).

Morphologic Variation in Nouns in the Southern Part of Jutland

Nouns appear for all informants with two grammatical genders using pre-positioned markers of indefiniteness en (ən)/n and et (ət̥)/(əd̥). They are being used almost in accordance with the description of Danish writing. A single exception is that all informants from the southern part of Jutland have the word kop in the neuter. The common pre-positioned marker of definiteness (ə) in the singular is heard in front of substantives of either the common gender or the neuter, such as: (1) et hus, et træ, en bold, en hund; (2) et kop; (3) vedsidenafbordet (ˈvɛd̥sider̥n̥aˈfɔrd̥ət̥); and (4) op ad bakken (ˈɒp̥əˈbæk̥k̥).

The regular and productive formation of the plural of substantives is normally a morphologic addition of (ə), and not (e), as required for standard Danish, such as: mågerne (ˈmɑːɡərn̥), støvler (ˈstəv̥l̥ɐr̥), and kræmsnitter (ˈkr̥æm̥sn̥ɪt̥ər̥).

There are also many examples of substantives with different non-regular plural endings such as: vinre (ˈvɪn̥re), gaf (ˈɡaf̥) (huller), skaaaf (ˈsk̥ɑːaf̥) (skabe), and skortstene (ˈsk̥ɔːr̥t̥st̥ɛn̥ɛ).

The singular forms of the last three lexemes mentioned above are (ˈɡaf̥), (ˈsk̥ɑːaf̥), and (ˈsk̥ɔːr̥t̥st̥ɛn̥ɛ); i.e., morphologic alternation attached to distinctive vowel length is heard with no other morphologic marking.

We also see a phonetic distinction between: (1) the indefinite article en (ən)/(n); (2) the number et (ət̥)/(əd̥); (3) the indefinite article et (ət̥)/(əd̥); and (4) the number et (ət̥)/(əd̥).

Similarly the words related to the number are pronounced: ene (ˈeːn̥e), alene (ˈæl̥eːn̥e), and ens (ˈeːns).

The inflection of the adjectives follows that pattern completely and is in accordance with the general rules for the inflections of adjectives in the written language. As a general rule is added an apical stop as a concord marker for substantives in the neuter, and the plural marker is consistent with the addition of a schwa and with a matching loss of this schwa, and with the rules for the elongation of vowels and consonants where possible. The same applies to the adverbial inflection in relation to the adjectives so that an apical stop is added where possible in accordance with the same governing system as described for the writing. The inflection of the adjectives is consistent, but, as mentioned above, with almost consistent schwa assimilation or apocope resulting in the
particular intonation pattern of the southern part of Jutland, such as: lange (ˈlʌŋə), høje (ˈhʌjə), and sorte (ˈsɔrte).

All the words are pronounced with a rising and subsequent falling tone within the word boundary.

**Word Formation in the Southern Part of Jutland**

With regards to word formation a particular interesting element appears for all informants from the southern part of Jutland. The vowel of the second part of the word is sometimes shortened to ultra short, and the glottal stop is reduced to something weaker than a binary stress. That goes for a large number of composita which can all be seen as very solid with reference to very well-known and frequently occurring elements from everyday life. The informants might consider the words as being monomorphic rather than being bi- or poly-morphic such as: skorsten (ˈskɔrsteŋ), stuehus (ˈstуйhus), våbenhus (ˈvæbenhus), greskar (ˈgɾeskʰa), and strygejern (ˈʃɾyɡejan).

**Morphologic Variation in Nouns on Bornholm**

The informants on Bornholm all have a three gender system for nouns using pre-positioned indefinite markers *en* (ən)/(n)/((ən)/ŋ), *et* (ət)/(øt)/(øt)/ðt) before feminine, masculine, and neuter nouns respectively. Consistently feminine nouns are for instance: ramme, a, krone, ruse, mave, nakke, and gynge. Masculine nouns are for instance: båd, hals, præst, degn, kat, fisk, and kurv. Neuter words correspond fairly well with the description of standard Danish and Danish writing, e.g.: hus, svin, vindue, smør, brod, and håndtag. All informants used all those examples several times. The indefinite article is post-positioned. For feminine words, it is: -an ((ən)/øn) as in ruse ((ˈrʊsən)); for masculine words: -in (in)/(ŋ) as in katten (ˈkʰædən); for neutral words: -ed (ød)/(ø) as in huset (ˈhʊsət). In feminine words, the weak vowel of the suffix sometimes disappears in the definite form of words which have a monomorphic final vowel, for instance in words like: øen (ˈønən) and skyen (ˈʃkjən).

There are some exceptions where some informants have the word sav as the neuter and the word flag as masculine, definite form (ˈflegt). Sometimes informants also refer to a *uv* using the pronoun *han* (he).

On Bornholm a particularly Danish phenomenon is heard with informants who all use a double definiteness as in utterances like: (1) hvordan ser det(def) vinduet(def) ud—(vœnsəŋ deŋdənuːtˈuːd); (2) bag det(def) ene tårnet(def) —(ˈbeŋdəŋ ˈtærnˈtæɾn); (3) den(def) der vasen(def), hvor rosen—(ˈdeŋ ˈvæzənˌvœχəzn); (4) hen til den(def) næste store porten(def), jo—(ˈheŋtəsɛdəŋ nəˈste stœ:rəˈpœɾtənˈjoʊ); (5) det(def) ene hjørnet(def) på dugen—(ˈdeŋˈjœɾnˌvœχəznˈpɑ:`ˈduːɡən); (6) du havde ikke noget(def) kirketårnet(def) —(duhənˈdəŋ ˈkærkəˌtærnˌvœχəzn); (7) de(def) resterende pladsene(def) —(dɨsəŋˈplɑ:`dənˌvœχəzən); and (8) der er kun de(def) der ungerne(def) —(dər ˈkœndədəŋˈvœχəzn).

The regular and productive plural formation of substantives is like the canonical description of standard Danish and of the writing with some exceptions: (1) gulderod/gulderød, which is heard conjugated as (ˈɡʊldəɾoːd)/(ˈɡʊldəɾɔ̃); (2) ore is consequently conjugated in the plural form as (ərøn); (3) knapper (ˈkʰnɑ:`pær); klatter (ˈkʰleʔdər); spisder (ˈspίːslər); æbler (ˈɛblə); and sokker (ˈsʌkər).

In the plural definite form, the following pronunciation is heard for masculine words: fuglene (ˈf管辖ənə) and mågerne (ˈmɒɡənə); feminine words, as for instance: botterne (ˈbɔtərənə); bjørkerne (ˈbjœɾkənə) and støvlene (ˈstʊvlaːnə); and for the neuter, for instance: husene, sideskibene, bladene, and færene (ˈɦusənə), (ˈʃ giveaway), (ˈblɪnən), and (ˈfɑ:`ɾənə).

As opposed to standard Danish, the writing and regional variations in Jutland in the continental part a
systematic difference between definite plural suffixes connected with the gender of the nouns are heard with suffixing: definiteness suffix for feminine plural -(ænæ), masculine plural -(ønø)/-(ønø) and the neuter plural -(ønø).

The inflection of the adjectives follows that pattern and is in accordance with the general rules for the inflections of adjectives in the written language. A general rule is added to an apical stop as a concord marker for substantives in the neuter. Examples of trichotomy in the inflection of adjectives are heard for instance in the word liden, which some informants use like this: en lidinhorre (iøn'lidip'hækø), en liden botte (gøn'lidon'bøtsa), and et lidet hus (qød'lidats'høus).

Suffixing of adjectives using -er (ø) for the short feminine form is not heard with all informants, but with some as: en tykker hund (iøn'tocok'e'huŋŋ) and en sorter sål (iøn'svøtsr'søøl), where the adjectives have the base forms (tocok⁹) and (svøts) corresponding with the feminine forms. The marking of the plural corresponds with the canonical addition of schwa in writing. The same applies to the adverbial inflection so that an apical stop is added where possible in accordance with the same governing system as described for the writing. The inflection of the adjectives is consistent, but with almost no schwa assimilation or apocope resulting in the fact that the number of syllables is heard clearly to correspond with the canonical regulations for writing. Often a pronunciation is heard where a consonant, which in other variants of Danish would be final, becomes initial in a weak syllable which in other variants of Danish is not heard as an independent syllable.

**Composita on Bornholm**

As regards composita the vowel of the second part of the word is heard in a few instances with the informants on Bornholm to be ultra short, and the stress is reduced to a weak secondary stress. This applies to the pronunciation of words such as: strygejern (œsdøiøa), halstørklæde (hæls'œtsøk'öl), and kirsebær (œcosbø).

In the words fodbold (œfo'bul) and bogstav (œbosdøv), the first syllable has been exposed to segmental reduction.

**Specific Genitive Constructions**

The genitive in Danish is formed by pre-positional phrases and by adding a clitic-s to the noun acting as a specification in the genitive construction. The genitive is also heard formed by head marking with some informants from both the southern and the western parts of Jutland in utterances as for instance:(1) påhunden sin hale—(øe'huŋ⁹'sil'hal); and (2) sommenrifaderenudeibaden—(œ'søøntsøe'faœøie'bøc).

Right after this the same informants are heard to use dependency marking in the formation of the genitive in an utterance as for instance: man kangodt se, detertraetskkaggeder—(œn'kød'æd'sœtsøedø'e'tœøsø'øegødø).

**Conclusions**

The Danish language has a comprehensive morphology, both as regards inflection, derivation, and composition. As an illustration canonical nominal morphological paradigms are formed as opposed to examples of the variation found in modern Danish regional dialects anno Domini 2008. Danish writing is shown to be a phoneme based writing system which is not suitable for investigating morphological variation in Danish. Both stress and word and syntagme prosodic relations are present in Danish and are particularly important elements in composition morphology. Those elements are normally not found in Danish writing. A new corpus of spoken language shows the very substantial variation in Danish nominal morphology. This variation is not found in much of the literature used in the teaching of Danish in both state schools, at teacher training colleges and at
universities. The variation in Danish morphology is enormous, and it is left to posterity to investigate that area in more detail. Analyses like these seem extremely important, before research in logopaedic treatment and the acquisition of Danish morphology of little children can even start.

References


Danish dialects areas good as dead (Danske dialekter er så godt som døde). (2007, November 21). Politiken.


Analogical Levelling as Optimization in Greek Nominal Inflection: A Cross-Dialectal Case Study

Dimitra Melissaropoulou
University of Patras, Patras, Greece; Open University of Cyprus, Nicosia, Cyprus

The aim of this paper is to investigate the special factors favouring or disfavouring cross-paradigmatic levelling in the light of the evidence provided by Modern Greek dialectal variation, and dialectal nominal inflection in particular. In the data examined, cross-paradigmatic levelling seems to act as a movement towards the elimination of markedness and allomorphy, which are thought to add extra complexity or ambiguity to the systems. On the other hand, the role of case syncretism and the loss of the genitive case in the ongoing process are not borne out by the data. The observed variation is accounted for as representing different stages in the process of cross-paradigmatic levelling as a tendency towards grammar optimization (Kiparsky, 1982, 2000, 2005). The above discussion is intended as a contribution to the central issues of analogy, allomorphy, and markedness in the organization of grammars, thus as an integral part of linguistic theory.

Keywords: analogical levelling, nominal inflection, paradigms, markedness, allomorphy, case-syncretism, language optimization

Introduction

Undoubtedly, analogy or analogical reasoning plays an important role in linguistic change (Hock, 1991; McMahon, 1994 and references therein). Over many centuries, the term “analogy” has been assigned different interpretations or definitions by different schools and frameworks.

Latin grammarians (e.g., Varro) used the notion of proportional analogy to account for regularities in inflection\(^1\), while Neogrammarians adopted it to refer to the process by which new (and usually regular) inflectional forms replace existing (and usually irregular) ones.

In the Neogrammarian and Structuralist traditions, analogy is generally viewed as a purely proportional process, constituting along with sound change and borrowing the main mechanisms of language change. On this basis, questions about the factors favouring or disfavouring analogical change normally follow and lead to various proposals. Among these are the mostly cited works of Kuryłowicz (1949) and Manczák (1958) on laws and tendencies in analogical change, as well as more recent publications such as Janda and Joseph (2003), focusing on category extension and social factors, and Bybee and Hopper (2001), emphasizing the role of frequency.

---

\(^1\) Regularities were thought of as complexes of mathematical proportions.
On the other hand, within the generative tradition, several attempts have been made to account for analogical phenomena and their role in grammar simplification (Kiparsky, 1982, 2000) involving both competence and performance (Dressler, 1976; Vincent, 1974). With respect to morphology, a variety of terms have been subsumed under the notion of analogical change: (non-)proportional analogy, analogical extension, four part analogy, analogical levelling, and back-formation, to name just a few. Levelling, in particular, is defined as the elimination of paradigmatic alternations (Hock & Joseph, 1996; Trask, 1996; Garrett, 20082).

The aim of this paper is to investigate the process of levelling in nominal inflection in the light of evidence provided by Modern Greek dialectal variation. Our discussion will revolve around the question whether the observed cross-dialectal variation is best interpreted as representing different stages or directions in the process of cross-paradigmatic levelling, when this is seen as a process towards grammar optimization (Kiparsky, 1982, 2000, 2005). Furthermore, the factors favouring or disfavouring cross-paradigmatic levelling will be addressed, with a special focus on the cross-dialectal role of markedness, allomorphy, and case-syncretism (Kiparsky, 1982 and references therein; Lahiri, 2000 and references therein; Ralli, Melissaropoulou, & Tsiamas, 2004; Ralli, 2006).

We should notice that for the purposes of this paper the term “optimization” (Kiparsky, 1982, 2000, 2005), usually interchangeable with or close to the term “simplification”3/4 (Kiparsky, 1982; Klein & Perdue, 1997; Miestamo, 2006; Miestamo, Sinnemaki, & Karlsson, 2008; Trudgill, 1986, 2009) is used to refer to changes in the formal properties of the examined systems, with particular emphasis on regularity, economy, and the elimination of (formal) markedness relationships. In the particular case considered, “optimization” refers to the elimination of superfluous morpho(phonological) alternations, i.e., the loss of redundancy in inflectional sub-paradigms.

Two basic premises are important with respect to the use of the term “optimization” in this study: (1) Assessing optimization by studying allomorphy reduction and the conflation of different plural sub-paradigms into one is a quantitative method. It resembles absolute complexity approaches (McWhorter, 2001) in that optimization is accounted for in terms of reduction in the number of formal realizations; and (2) We treat “language optimization” as a theory-internal concept, although we take something like “language optimization” to occur in language users’ minds.

It is true however that: (1) Optimization or complexification claims should take into account the characteristics of the language in question; and (2) Simplicity in one part of the grammar is often compensated for by complexity in (an)other part(s) of the grammar (Aitchison, 1991, p. 253). However, as pointed out by Kusters (2008), inflectional morphology concerns morphological structure, which is, “[…] with its idiosyncratic allomorphies, exceptions, and communicatively superfluous distinctions, less susceptible to trade-off effects than syntax or phonology” (p. 10).

---

2 In Garrett (2008), levelling is defined as the extension of an existing pattern. Our findings on cross-paradigmatic levelling of inflectional sub-paradigms corroborate this claim.
3 As correctly noticed by an anonymous reviewer, the term “optimization” is usually preferred since it refers not just to economy or simplicity but also to maximization of contrast.
4 The notions of complexity and simplification have been quite controversial, partly due the equation of complexity with a high or higher value (in a cultural, social, or even cognitive sense), leaving intentionally or unintentionally nationalistic overtones. However, in recent linguistic studies, especially in the fields of second language learning and dialectology, the terms “complexity” and “simplification” have become quite common (Klein & Perdue, 1997; Trudgill, 1986).
The case to be discussed here involves simplicity in a sub-paradigm of an inflection class in a fusional system. This is indeed a purely morphological domain showing no trade-off phenomena with the other levels of linguistic analysis (inherent inflection in terms of Booij (1994, 1996, 2002)), in the sense that the agreement features are in any case present and available to syntactic processes.

Lastly, dialectal varieties, until recently overlooked in modern linguistic theory, are chosen as the empirical test bed of this research, as they can offer—at least in our view—new insights into language structure as well as into language variation and change. Furthermore, it is worth mentioning that, while dialectal varieties originated from Hellenistic Koine (with the possible exception of Tsakonian), SMG (S(standard) M(odern) Greek) has a much more recent history (no more than two centuries), and has been heavily influenced by standardization processes involving purification movements and an extended period of diglossia (among others Browning, 1983)—i.e., divergence between the everyday spoken language and the official one, trying to get closer to or to imitate the Ancient Greek of the Classical period or to achieve a balance between the two. In this perspective, dialectal variation comes to the fore as a very rich and important testing ground for theories about language optimization, because variation between related dialects should reflect different optimization pathways with the same starting point, or different stages on similar or the same pathway.

The paper is organized as follows: In section 2, basic premises and assumptions on inflectional classes and paradigms are summarized and a presentation of the adopted categorization of SMG nominal inflection (i.e., that by Ralli, 2000) is offered, enriched with comments on the Hellenistic Koine nominal system, since this is the common source of all the examined varieties. Section 3, with its different sub-sections, discusses the dialectal data, with their commonalities and particularities in the process of levelling as grammar optimization. More particularly, sub-section 3.1 discusses data from Lesvian and Aivaliot, 3.2 from Pontic, 3.3 from Livisi, and 3.4 from Silli. Section 4 constitutes the core of the paper, where generalizations are offered and specific claims and proposals are put forward with respect to the factors favouring or disfavouring cross-paradigmatic levelling as grammar optimization. The paper concludes in this section by pointing out possible directions for future research.

The dialectal data our research is based on come from both oral and written sources: glossaries, grammars as well as the still under construction GREED Database of Modern Greek Dialectal Oral Corpora of the Laboratory of Modern Greek Dialects hosted at the University of Patras.

**Inflectional System and Nominal Paradigms in SMG**

Starting with basic assumptions on inflection classes and paradigms, earlier analyses used to regard inflection classes as rather arbitrary, showing a rather confusing picture with respect to word classification. However, relevant publications in the past decades (among others Carstairs, 1983, 1987; Carstairs-McCarthy, 1991, 1994; McCarthy, 2002; Ralli, 2000, 2006, for Greek) have shown that inflection classes have their own properties, acknowledging paradigmatic relations as an indisputable part of the synchronic system of a language, thus suggesting important theoretical consequences for the architecture of grammatical systems.

The organization of inflectional systems and paradigms is governed by two competing forces: (1) paradigmatic uniformity (when the grammar maintains the same output shape for pairs of inflected words); and (2)
paradigmatic contrast (when it strives to keep them apart). Some important premises concerning inflection classes are the followings: (1) One inflection class cannot simply be thought to be equal to another; (2) Different inflection classes within an inflectional system may vary in size; (3) The classes clearly differ from one another with respect to their productivity. There are preferred as well as less preferred ones; and (4) There are inflection classes which take over words from other classes and classes that lose words (for a thorough discussion, see Wurzel, 2000, p. 193).

Greek is a fusional language. It has four cases (Nom(inative), Gen(itive), Acc(usative), and Voc(ative)) and two numbers. Noun stems combine with fusional, suffixal, and inflectional markers. The choice of the correct inflectional marker for a given noun stem depends on (1) case, (2) number, and (3) the infection class the noun stem belongs to. In other words, Greek nouns have explicit information on the inflection class according to which they inflect, or are explicitly marked for a specific inflection class.

Several categorizations of Greek nominal inflection have been proposed, based on different criteria, for example, gender (Triantafyllides, 1941; Sotiropoulos, 1972), number of syllables in the singular vs. plural number sub-paradigms (Tsapanakis, 1948), or case syncretism (Kourmoulis, 1964; Babinotis & Kontos, 1967; Klairis & Babinotis, 1996).

In this study, we adopt the analysis of Ralli (2000), who bases her categorization on the notions of allomorphy and the unique inflectional paradigm, i.e., on the whole set of same inflectional markers for the same set of morphosyntactic properties, since it describes the examined data in the most adequate way for the purposes of this paper and does not abstract away from the native speaker’s intuition. According to this analysis, Greek nouns are divided into eight different inflection classes. The first two comprise mainly masculine nouns, the next two feminine nouns, and the last four neuter nouns.

Standard Modern Greek masculine nouns in particular are inflected for number and case according to two

---

5 Or in other words, adhere more persistently to distinctiveness, i.e., overt marking of important distinctions than to economy, i.e., minimization of the use of overt markers (Sinnemäki, 2008).
6 A respectable number of publications have been produced on the notion of allomorphy and its different types (e.g., Chomsky & Halle, 1968; Dressler, 1985; Carstairs, 1987; and especially for Greek, Drachman, 2001, 2003; Ralli, 2006). In the present paper, the notion of allomorphy refers only to lexical or morphological allomorphy excluding those cases which can be accounted for via the application of phonological rules.
7 An alternative and in some aspects admittedly simpler account (especially from a phonological point of view) which would make use of morphophonological rules applying to stem-suffix combinations is not feasible in our case study for several reasons. First, the hypothesis that the entire paradigm of pa’pas for example is based on the stem papa, whereby a phonological rule which would delete -s- before consonantal endings and word-finally but retain it before vocalic endings, seems rather weird for a native speaker’s intuition. In this case, another phonological phenomenon, that of vowel epenthesis, would be thought a more natural process to solve the phonotactic problem caused for example by the adjacency of the dental fricative /θ/ with the fricative inflectional marker -s- in nominative singular. Adaptation of nominal loans in Greek provides supportive evidence in favor of this choice. Second, this alternative account would force us to treat all inflection classes the same way, a task which does not seem to be feasible. For example, neuter nouns of the eighth inflection class display a similar allomorphic pattern in /θ/. For example, in the singular number (except for genitive case) the stem for ‘ema.Nom.Sing. “Blood” is ema, while in the plural number the allomorphic stem is emat, e.g., ‘emat-a.Nom.Pl. The application of morphophonological rules in this group of nouns runs against the behavior of these stems in other morphological processes, e.g., compounding. More specifically, the two stems of blood, em–emat, alternate in the formation of new lexemes without being subject to the above mentioned—or any other—rule of phonological nature. See for example: emat-o-loy(οs) and not *em-o-loy(οs) “hematologist” em-o–ботι(ς) and not emat-o–ботι(ς) “blood donor”. The choice between the two stems, ema- or emat-, cannot be accounted in terms of phonological rules or restrictions, since as already shown in the examples, they alternate in the same phonological environment, i.e., before a vowel.
8 For a detailed analysis of the interaction between gender and inflection class in Greek, see Anastasiadi-Symeonidi, Ralli, & Cheila-Markopoulos (Eds.) (2003) and Ralli (2002).
ANALOGICAL LEVELLING AS OPTIMIZATION IN GREEK NOMINAL INFLECTION

different inflection classes (Ralli, 2000). Inflection class I includes masculine nouns in -os\(^9\) displaying no stem alternation. Consider the nominal paradigm of the noun 'an\(\theta\)rop(os) “man” under Example 1 below. The inflectional markers are separated by a hyphen and are put in bold characters.

**Inflection class I an\(\theta\)ropos. MASC “man”**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example (1)</th>
<th>Singular</th>
<th>Plural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nom</td>
<td>'an(\theta)rop-os</td>
<td>'an(\theta)rop-i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen</td>
<td>an(\theta)rop-u</td>
<td>an(\theta)rop-on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc</td>
<td>'an(\theta)rop-o</td>
<td>an(\theta)rop-us</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc</td>
<td>'an(\theta)rop-e</td>
<td>'an(\theta)rop-I</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Inflection class II includes masculine nouns in -s displaying a systematic allomorphic pattern, either via the addition of a vowel \(X_v\text{_{singular}}-X\text{_{plural}}\), as in 'koraka(s), koraka–korak “raven”, shown in the example under Example 2, or via the addition of the formative \(-\delta\)-, i.e., \(X\text{_{singular}}-X\delta\text{_{plural}}\) as in pa'pa(s), papa–papa\(\delta\) “priest”, shown under Example 3 below.

**Inflection class II korakas. MASC “raven”**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example (2)</th>
<th>Singular</th>
<th>Plural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nom</td>
<td>'koraka-s</td>
<td>'korak-es</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen</td>
<td>'koraka</td>
<td>ko'rak-on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc</td>
<td>'koraka</td>
<td>'korak-es</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc</td>
<td>'koraka</td>
<td>'korak-es</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example (3)</th>
<th>Singular</th>
<th>Plural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nom</td>
<td>pa'pa-s</td>
<td>pa'p(\delta) -es</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen</td>
<td>pa'pa</td>
<td>pa'p(\delta) -on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc</td>
<td>pa'pa</td>
<td>pa'p(\delta) -es</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc</td>
<td>pa'pa</td>
<td>pa'p(\delta) -es</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In SMG, all masculine nouns inflect according to these two inflection classes and no systematic cross-paradigmatic levelling phenomena are attested. As correctly mentioned by an anonymous reviewer, this statement implies that, while all the examined systems in this case study (both SMG and the dialectal varieties) share the same origin—i.e., come from Hellenistic Koine—, which constitutes inevitably the base line for comparison, SMG differs considerably from the other varieties in the occurrence of cross-paradigmatic levelling phenomena.

For reasons of clarity, we should mention that the morphological and phonological changes in question started in the Classical or late Classical period and continued during Hellenistic times, resulting in the restructuring of the morphological system of nouns (i.e., in the remodeling of the three Classical Greek declensions). The most relevant change of this period\(^{10}\) for the purposes of this paper was the shift of nouns of one declension into another, resulting in the restriction of the large number of inflectional morphemes and nominal paradigms of the Classical period.

---

\(^9\) There are also a very small number of feminine nouns in -os (e.g., proo\(\delta\)-os. FEM “progress”), the majority of which is of learned origin.

\(^{10}\) Other important changes were the replacement of the dual number by the plural as well as the restriction of dative case (Jannaris, 1897; Browning, 1983; Christidis, 2007, Horrocks, 2010 and references therein).
More specifically, Classical Greek athematic nouns (corresponding to the classical third declension) shifted to the classical first declension; in some nouns, the starting point was the accusative singular, in others it was the nominative singular, and in others it was a diminutive which lost its diminutive meaning. The classical athematic noun 'koraks “raven” for example, shown in Example 2 above for SMG, shifted on the basis of the accusative form 'koraka to the -os paradigm (i.e., the traditional first declension), while the noun 'jeron “old man” shifted to the -os paradigm (i.e., the traditional second declension) on the basis of the nominative form. The above mentioned processes (alongside the change in the formation of diminutives) also played a very important role in the overall morphological restructuring of nominal inflection, resulting in the loss of the old athematic declension and in the restriction of all masculine nouns to two different paradigms, those in -os and -as (for further details, Jannaris, 1897; Browning, 1983; Christidis, 2007; Horrocks, 2010 and references therein). Crucially, these lines of development of the nominal inflectional system during the Hellenistic period have continued to be a basic characteristic of the grammar to this day.

However, a thorough presentation or contrastive analysis of the nominal system of Hellenistic Koine goes beyond the scope of this paper whose goal is to account for the factors favouring or disfavouring cross-paradigmatic levelling as grammar optimization, with the observed variation representing different stages of this process. Our interest focuses, for the purposes of the present paper, on the realization of the plural masculine sub-paradigm on a cross-dialectal basis.

**Dialectal Data**

**Lesvian—Aivaliot**

The first dialectal varieties under investigation are Aivaliot and Lesvian. Aivaliot dialect was spoken in the west coast of Turkey (Aivali and Moschonisia in Asia Minor) until 1922. After the exchange of populations that followed the treaty of Lausanne, the dialect continues to be spoken by the second- and third-generation refugees settled on specific enclaves in the area of Eastern Lesvos. Lesvian on the other hand refers to the local variety spoken on the island of Lesvos. Both varieties belong to the group of Northern Greek dialects and display the two major characteristics of this group, i.e., unstressed mid-vowel raising and unstressed high vowel deletion.

In the examples that follow under Example 4, the paradigms of masculine nouns in the dialectal varieties of Lesvos and Aivali are illustrated.

Example (4) Lesvian—Aivaliot (Data from GREED Database)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Singular</th>
<th>Plural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nom</td>
<td>'aθρi/op-us (-os)</td>
<td>aθrop- (&lt;-i)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen</td>
<td>aθrop- (&lt;-u)</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc</td>
<td>'aθrop-u (&lt;-o)</td>
<td>aθrop- (&lt;-i)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc</td>
<td>'aθrop-i (&lt;-e)</td>
<td>aθrop- (&lt;-i)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For further details on this process, see Horrocks (2010) and references therein.

As correctly noticed by Horrocks (2010, pp. 120-121), the process lasted several centuries because of the strong normative influence of official written languages.

The elements in parentheses preceded by the “<-” symbol denote the inflectional endings before high-vowel deletion or mid-vowel raising.
What can be seen from the examples above is that the noun "korakas" "raven", in Example (4b), is inflected for plural, according to class I, i.e., following the pattern of 'aθripus in the dialect and not according to inflection class II, as in SMG. The dialectal varieties of Lesvian and Aivaliot (Papadopoulos, 1927; Ralli (in preparation)) have undergone cross-paradigmatic levelling in the plural forms, resulting in the reduction of the difference between the two classes in favour of the inflectional paradigm of class I nouns. Ralli et al. (2004) have proposed that the disappearance of the genitive plural case and the innovative case syncretism between the nominative and the accusative case (as opposed to the different morphological realizations in SMG), facilitated levelling and led to cross-paradigmatic uniformity (interpreted by the authors within the optimality-theory framework). However, masculine nouns displaying an allomorphic variant with -Δ- resist cross-paradigmatic levelling, as can be seen in Example 5, and follow the paradigm of inflection class II, as in SMG.

As can be seen in the examples above, pa'pa(s) "priest" is inflected for plural as pa'paΔ-is (<es) and not as *pa'p-i or *pa'paΔ-i. In this case, resistance to paradigmatic levelling is ascribed by the authors to the presence of allomorphy as a factor contributing to structure preservation (Ralli et al., 2004) in the sense that the loss of the element -Δ- element would cause the deletion of a part of the lexical item, i.e., a part of the (allomorphic) stem (since with levelling the plural form of the noun Papa-s would have to be *pa'pi). Elaborating on these arguments, Ralli (2006) has emphasized the independent character of allomorphy and its role in the organization of paradigms as well as in structure preservation (preservation of stem forms)15.

On the basis of the observed dialectal divergence a number of interesting questions seem to emerge, namely: (1) Is this a cross-dialectal phenomenon?; (2) Is stem allomorphy a prohibiting factor to cross-paradigmatic levelling?; (3) What is the role of stem allomorphy in language optimization?; (4) Are case syncretism and loss of the genitive plural preconditions for the activation of cross-paradigmatic levelling?; (5) And more generally, what are the (structural) factors favouring or disfavouring language optimization?.

In order to get a better idea of the specific conditions under which cross-paradigmatic levelling manifests itself and the way it could be interpreted as grammar optimization, what would seem appropriate is to broaden the range of data to further dialects.

---

14 An apostrophe is used to mark palatalization of the uvular /k/ due to the following underlying front vowel /i/.
15 According to Ralli (2006), allomorphy contributes to the organization of inflected words into paradigms, but also assists lexical items (i.e., stems) to resist levelling for reasons of structure preservation.
Pontic

The variety of Pontic was spoken from the 12th century until the exchange of populations in 1923, in Northeast Turkey (Browning, 1983; Bruneau, 1998). After the end of the war between Greece and Turkey in 1922 and the exchange of populations following the treaty of Lausanne, it continues to be spoken within communities of the first-, second-, and third-generation refugees in various areas mainly in the northern parts of Greece. What is crucial in Pontic is the alternation of plural nominal paradigms between the inflection class I and the inflection class II patterns. Let us have a closer look at the examples seen under Example 6 (Data from Oikonomides, 1958, p. 46).

Example (6) (a)  Singular     Plural
Nom  'anθrop-os     anθrop-i     “man, human being”
Gen  anθrop-u & anθro'p-ιu     anθrop-on & anθro'p-ion
Acc  'anθrop-o(n)17     anθrop-(u)s
Voc  'anθrop-e     anθrop-i
(b)  Singular     Plural
Nom  'martira-s     'martir-es & mar'tir-(i)     “testifier, martyr”
Gen  'martira     'martir-on & mar'tir-ion
Acc  'martira-(n)     'martir-es & mar'tir-(u)s
Voc  'martira     'martir-es & mar'tir-i
(c)  Singular     Plural
Nom  a'fedi-s     afe'daδ-es & afe'daδ-i     “master”
Gen  a'fedi     afe'd-ιon
Acc  a'fedi-(n)     afe'daδ-es & afe'daδ-us
Voc  a'fed a     afe'daδ-es & afe'daδ-i18

The noun 'martira-s “martyr” in Example (6b), equivalent to 'koraka-s “raven” in Lesvian and Aivaliot, is inflected following both the first and the second inflection class plural sub-paradigm. More interestingly, stem allomorphy with the formative -δ- is maintained in Pontic, and in some cases it spreads to nouns of the second inflection class that displayed only the vocalic stem allomorphy (i.e., the Xv singular~Xv plural pattern discussed in the example under Example 2 in section 2 for Standard Modern Greek). Thus, the plural of a 'fedi-s is afe'daδ-es & afe'daδ-i, as shown in Example (6c), displaying stem allomorphy with the formative -δ-, i.e., afe'daδ-, instead of a'fed-es (in this case, the whole paradigm would be a'fed-es.NOM, a'fed-es.ACC., a'fed-es.VOC, and the allomorphic pattern a'fedisingular~a'fed plural).

Furthermore, in Example (6c), we can see that cross-paradigmatic levelling is active resulting in the alternation of the plural sub-paradigm of the first inflection class with that of the second. However, no case

---

16 Pontic is still spoken by an unknown number of Pontic Muslims who live in the same area in Turkey (Mackridge, 1999; Drettas, 1999, 2000; Kaltsa & Sitaridou, 2009).

17 The realization of the elements appearing in parentheses varies depending on the different sub-varieties of Pontic. For a categorization and further details on the intra-dialectal divergence, see Papadopoulos (1955) and Oikonomides (1958).

18 Similarly, δespotaδ-es along with δespotaδ-i “archbishops”, 'adres along with 'adruδes “men”, kle'fti δ-es along with kle'fti “thieves”, and po'paδ-es along with po'paδ-i “priests”.

syncretism is observed between accusative and nominative case and no loss of the genitive plural seems to be in play. A situation of de-systematization in inflectional paradigms is observed, allowing for multiple alternations, which is indicative of an ongoing change.\(^{19}\)

Crucially, in Pontic the ongoing cross-paradigmatic levelling seems to have triggered the analogical extension of the observed stem-allomorphy, i.e., the analogical extension of the allomorphic pattern with the formative -Δ- to nouns belonging to inflection class I, which crucially did not display this morphological property. You can see the relevant examples under Example 7.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example (7)</th>
<th>Singular</th>
<th>Plural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nom</td>
<td>ja'tr-os</td>
<td>ja'tr-i &amp; ja'tri-Δ-i “doctor”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ka'k-os</td>
<td>ka'k'-i &amp; ka'k'ī-Δ-i “bad, evil”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>pedik-os</td>
<td>pedi'k'-i &amp; pedi'k'ī-Δ-i “mouse”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The noun ja'tr-os “doctor” for example inflects for plural both as ja'tr-i, i.e., along the lines of its inflection class sub-paradigm (the first), according to which no stem allomorphy occurs, and as ja'tri-Δ-i, i.e., via the addition of the formative -Δ-, by means of analogical extension of the allomorphic pattern of inflection class II nouns.

Contrary to what traditional descriptions of the dialect imply (Oikonomides, 1958), this -Δ- element is not reanalyzed—at least not yet—in the specific dialectal system as part of the inflectional marker, since it is not present in all the nouns of the first inflection class. However, this is not an impossible or even un-economical direction of change. In fact, this is what happens in the dialect of Silli. However, before turning to Silli, let us examine another variety, that of Livisi.

Livisi

The dialect of Livisi (nowadays the area of Livisi is called Kayaköy) was again spoken until the exchange of populations, in Asia Minor, in the area of Lycia (opposite the island of Rhodes) in Southwest Turkey. Although a relation with Northern Greek dialects has been ascribed to the dialect of Livisi (Hadzidakis, 1905-1907; Kretschmer, 1905) due to the presence of unstressed mid-vowel raising, the variety is thought to be more closely related to the other Asia Minor dialects, e.g., Cappadocian, Pontic, and Pharasa (Dawkins, 1916) as well to other eastern dialects like Cypriot and varieties of the Dodecanese (Andriotis, 1961). In the variety of Livisi, the situation is rather different in comparison with the varieties discussed above. See the examples under Examples (8a-8d) (Data from Andriotis, 1961, p. 23).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example (8) (a)</th>
<th>Singular</th>
<th>Plural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nom</td>
<td>'andr-a-s</td>
<td>an'dra-Δ-i “man” instead of *-'andriss(&lt;es)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen</td>
<td>'andra</td>
<td>an'dra-Δ-un (&lt;on) instead of *-an'dron</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc</td>
<td>'andr-a-n</td>
<td>an'dra-Δ-us instead of *-'andriss(&lt;es)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc</td>
<td>'andra</td>
<td>an'dra-Δ-i instead of *-'andriss(&lt;es)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{19}\) An alternative account of the phenomenon could be based on the argument that the non-loss of the genitive inflectional marker, which has the same form in both inflectional classes, might have been of help in the ongoing cross-paradigmatic levelling, since in all cases there is a trans-paradigmatic syncretism, i.e., in both inflection classes the same genitive marker -on-/ion is observed, triggering possibly a partial cross-paradigmatic syncretism in the terms of Müller (2005, p. 229) to become total. However, this is a tentative assumption that needs further investigation.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Singular</th>
<th>Plural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nom</td>
<td>psa'ra-s</td>
<td>psa'rað-i ‘fisherman’ instead of *psa'rað-is(&lt;es)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen</td>
<td>psa'ra</td>
<td>psa'rað-un (&lt;on)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc</td>
<td>psa'ra-n</td>
<td>psa'rað-us instead of *psa'rað-is(&lt;es)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc</td>
<td>psa'ra</td>
<td>psa'rað-i instead of *psa'rað-is(&lt;es)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nom</td>
<td>'nafti-s</td>
<td>'nafti-ð-i ‘sailor’ instead of *'naftis (&lt;es)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen</td>
<td>'nafti</td>
<td>'nafti-ð-un (&lt;on)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc</td>
<td>'nafti-n</td>
<td>'nafti-ð-us instead of *'naftis (&lt;es)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc</td>
<td>'nafti</td>
<td>'nafti-ð-i instead of *'naftis (&lt;es)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nom</td>
<td>kri'ti-s</td>
<td>kri'ta-ð-I “judge” instead of *kri'tes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen</td>
<td>kri'ti</td>
<td>kri'ta-ð-un (&lt;on) instead of *kri'ton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc</td>
<td>kri'ti-n</td>
<td>kri'ta-ð-us instead of *kri'tes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc</td>
<td>kri'ti</td>
<td>kri'ta-ð-i instead of *kri'tes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As can be seen from the examples above, neither case syncretism nor loss of the morphological realisation of the genitive plural is attested. Cross-paradigmatic levelling in the dialect of Livisi is extended even to those nouns which, in the previously examined varieties, resisted it, leading to the formation of one unified inflectional sub-paradigm for the plural corresponding to the first inflection class. See for example the noun 'andra-s “man” in Example (8a), which is inflected for plural as an'dra-ð-i, i.e., following the inflectional class I sub-paradigm and not as 'andris(<es) following the inflection class II pattern. In order to establish cross-paradigmatic levelling, extension of the allomorphic pattern with the -ð- formative seems to have taken place.

In other words, while in the varieties of Lesvian and Aivaliot stem-allomorphy was maintained in a specific morphological sub-environment, i.e., in a sub-group of inflection class II nouns, for reasons of structure preservation (Ralli et al., 2004; Ralli, 2006) or in terms of Drachman (2001) for reasons of stress preservation, in Livisi the pattern expands, favouring cross-paradigmatic uniformity at the expense of cross-paradigmatic contrast, thus leading to the creation of a less complex and more economical paradigmatic organization of the nominal inflection, in the sense that the nominal plural sub-paradigm has become uniform.

Moreover, in comparison with the above-mentioned variety of Pontic, in the dialect of Livisi no multiple alternations vacillating between the two different plural sub-paradigms are observed, indicating a more advanced stage in the process of cross-paradigmatic levelling.

In this variety, cross-paradigmatic levelling is leading to the maintenance of a unified plural sub-paradigm for all masculine nouns, which will be interpreted in the next section as a movement towards the optimization of the inflectional system. It is worth noticing that in some cases this innovative pattern, with the presence of allomorphic -ð-, extends analogically to masculine nouns originally belonging to the first inflection class (see Example 9).

---

Drachman (2001, p. 116) claimed that the Xð allomorph allowed stems to keep stress on the same vowel in both singular and plural paradigms (e.g., pa'pa-s “priest”; pa'pað-es “priests”), and thus assists stress preservation.
ANALOGICAL LEVELLING AS OPTIMIZATION IN GREEK NOMINAL INFLECTION

Example (9)  Singular  Plural
Nom  jift-os  jiftiō-i and not jift-i  “gipsy”
rumj-os  rumjaō-i and not rumj-i  “Greek”
j-os  jeō-i and not j-i  “son”

However, as already mentioned for Pontic, this pattern does not appear to be generalized in Livisi.

Silli Dialect

Lastly, the dialectal variety of Silli belongs again to the general group of Asia Minor dialects (Dawkins, 1916) and was spoken, until the exchange of populations, in Silli, Northwest of the city of Ikonion (today’s Konya), in Turkey. By contrast with the above-mentioned varieties, in Silli the whole process of cross-paradigmatic levelling seems to be completed. Some examples are shown under Example 10.

Example (10) (a)  Singular  Plural
Nom  ’kleftši-s  ’kleftši-ri  “thief”  instead of *’kleftš-es
Gen  ’kleťfšj-u  kleťfši-’rjo  instead of *kleťfš-jo
Acc  ’kleftši  ’kleftši-ri(s)  instead of *kleťfš-es
Voc  ’kleftši  ’kleftši-ri  instead of *kleťfš-es
(b)  Singular  Plural
Nom  pa’pa-s  pa’pa-ri  “priest”  instead of *pa’par-is(<es)
Gen  pa’pa  -------
Acc  pa’pa  pa’pa-ri(s)  instead of *pa’par-is(<es)
Voc  pa’pa  pa’pa-ri  instead of *pa’par-is(<es)
(c)  Singular  Plural
Nom  xristja’n-os  xri’stjani-ri  “Christian”  instead of *xristja’n-i
Gen  xristja’n-u  -------
Acc  xristja’n-o  xri’stjani-ri  instead of *xristja’n-i
Voc  xristja’n-e  xri’stjani-ri  instead of *xristja’n-i

A thorough examination of the above-mentioned examples, illustrates that in Silli’s system the whole process of cross-paradigmatic levelling seems completed, leading to a more simple inflectional system. More specifically, in all different cases of masculine nouns ((a) ’kleftši-s “thief” ’kleftši-ri; (b) pa’pa-s “priest” pa’pa-ri; and (c) xristja’n-os “Christian” xri’stjani-ri), the plural sub-paradigm is the same (see Table 1).

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unified Plural Inflectional Paradigm</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Moreover, in this particular system, loss of genitive plural case is observed (Costakis, 1968, p. 57) and case syncretism seems to be also at play. What is crucial though is that a somehow differentiated or innovative inflectional marker seems to have emerged, with the form -ri. This -ri element (which is the equivalent of -i in this variety as well as in other Asia Minor varieties) resulted from -i, due to a phonological rule changing the dental fricative to a liquid (Dawkins, 1916, pp. 78, 79)\textsuperscript{21/22}.

More importantly, in this new inflectional marker, the -r- element, while being originally part of the stem, forming a stem allomorph in the nominal system for the plural sub-paradigm, is found reanalyzed as part of the inflection,\textsuperscript{23} compensating for the complexity that stem allomorphy would cause to the inflectional system of the dialect. This new inflectional marker was then analogically extended to all masculine nouns, thus was generalized in the plural sub-paradigm for all masculine nouns, schematically, see Schema 1 below.

Schema 1
Reanalysis in the nouns [[pa'pa]-s] “priest” and [[dzadar'ma]-s] “policeman”
(a) [[pa'par]-es] → [[pa'par]-i] → [[pa'pa]-ri] → pa'pari
(b) [[dzadar'mar]-es] → [[dzadar'mar]-i] → [[dzadar'ma]-ri] → dzadar'mari

The direction of change is accounted for as a movement towards language optimization, in the sense that the two different plural sub-paradigms have been reduced to one, thus a less complex system with fewer morpho-phonological alternations has been created. This is in fact what we are going to argue for in the following section.

**Discussion and Proposal**

All the above-mentioned instances of cross-paradigmatic levelling raise very important issues for discussion. First, as already shown, it is the plural sub-paradigm that is subject to cross-paradigmatic levelling\textsuperscript{24}. In all cases, the paradigm of the first inflection class (in -os) has prevailed.

We should mention that Christophidou (2003, pp. 126, 131), within a natural morphology framework, claimed that the declension in -is and -as, in her terms, containing nouns like maθi'tis “pupil”, ma'navis “grosser” and pa'teras “father”, corresponding to the second inflection class, was the most productive one, while nouns in -os, like ‘anθropos “man”, corresponding to the first inflectional class, although still productive, showed signs of decreasing productivity. In her approach, productivity is defined in qualitative terms without distinguishing necessarily from frequency (type/token), and is based on the integration of loans and neologisms into the Modern Greek inflectional system.

\textsuperscript{21} The change of /i/ is a rather generalized phenomenon appearing in different morphophonological environments (i.e., word initially, within and across morpheme boundaries, etc.) both in Silli and in Cappadocian dialects as well, showing remarkable intra-dialectal variation (it appears as /i/, /i/, or /i/). For further discussion, see Dawkins (1916, p. 79).

\textsuperscript{22} Contrary to what could easily be suggested on the basis of the sociolinguistic situation in the area, the new inflectional marker of Silli with the form -ri cannot be accounted for in terms of heavy structural borrowing from Turkish, and thus be related to the agglutinative Turkish plural marker -ler-. Hints of agglutinative patterns in nominal inflection are not traced in other Asia Minor dialectal varieties except for the Southern Cappadocian zone (i.e., the towns of Ulaghats, Gurzono, Fertek, Aravan, and Semendere). However, no case of direct grammatical borrowing of the -ler- marker is reported in any of the Asia Minor varieties. For a more detailed discussion Dawkins (1916, pp. 87-116) and Janse (2004, pp. 6-12).

\textsuperscript{23} See Dammel and Kürschner (2008, p. 256) for a parallel left-to-right reanalysis of the stem-suffix boundary in Afrikaans as an instance of simplification.

\textsuperscript{24} Only a few traces are found in the genitive singular, which call for further research.
On the contrary, on the basis of the formal properties of the two different inflection classes and in the light of the evidence provided by the dialectal data, we claim, at least for the plural, that the most frequent sub-paradigm is that of the first inflection class. Additional support for the claim that inflection class I, containing nouns in -ος is the most frequent word class, thus in terms of Haspelmath (2006) the unmarked word class, is provided by quantitative measures. The notion of un-markedness is used for the purposes of this paper to refer to the properties all its different types discussed in the literature have in common, i.e., regularity, high frequency, and salience (Haspelmath, 2006).

Although big representative data-bases providing tools for morphological analysis are lacking for Modern Greek, a quick calculation in the Anastasiadis-Simeonidis Reverse Dictionary of Modern Greek, supports the claim that nouns of the first inflection class represent approximately the 80% of all masculine nouns, while those of the second inflection class represent approximately the 20% of the total. In other words, in our view, paradigmatic uniformity is affecting the marked sub-paradigm of a marked category (Garrett, 2008) (the plural of inflection class II), in all cases of dialectal variation.

It is worth noticing that the reverse tendency is not observed, i.e., cross-paradigmatic levelling towards the inflection class II plural sub-paradigm. This does not come as a surprise for two reasons: Firstly, the plural inflectional sub-paradigm of the second inflection class is typical for feminine nouns (e.g., μητέρα “mother” is inflected for plural as μητέρες, μητέρων, etc.), thus it is found in other inflection classes (inflection class III following Ralli’s (2000) classification (Ralli et al., 2004)). Secondly, another crucial difference between the two inflection classes lies in the presence of allomorphy. Inflection class I contains stems bearing no allomorphy whereas in inflection class II a systematic allomorphic pattern either consonantal or vocalic is necessary. Thus, cross-paradigmatic levelling is activated as a movement towards the elimination of markedness, where markedness includes allomorphy but is not limited to it.

We may now reinterpret the factors activating cross-paradigmatic levelling in favour of the class II sub-paradigm: (1) More frequent and productive patterns tend to generalize at the expense of less frequent and unproductive ones; and (2) Forms that clearly mark the relevant category and can be simply generated tend to generalize at the expense of those that are ambiguous (in our case masculine vs. feminine plural) or depend on

---

25 The notion of markedness, based solely on synchronic criteria, has developed a vast range of divergent readings in linguistics. It started from phonology (the Prague school) to expand to all levels of linguistic analysis closely related to the notion of complexity, in the sense that “unmarked values do not contribute to complexity” as stated by Chomsky and Halle (1968, p. 402) for phonology. Markedness has been proposed to hold with respect to certain parameters such as (1) covert vs. overt marking; and (2) lexical distinctions (e.g., reference to a particular sex or a more special/marginal category or to inflectional class membership (Wurzel, 2000, p. 199)).

26 According to Garrett (2008), high token frequency results in salience.

27 Haspelmath (2006) discussed all the different types of markedness and their properties. However, he argued that it often proved to be a very abstract, superfluous, and ambiguous notion that could be replaced by other more concrete notions.

28 Similar support is provided by Melissaropoulou and Manolessou (2010) for Medieval Greek. According to the authors, in the first five volumes of Kriaras’ lexicon, nouns of the first inflection class represent roughly 65% of the masculine nouns, and those of the second inflection class 35%. A comparison between the two different stages, although beyond the aim of the present paper, could prove particularly useful for testing the claim from a diachronic viewpoint.

29 Lahiri (2000, p. 116) based on data from Old Norse and High German argued that paradigmatic levelling was brought into force to reduce markedness caused by surface allomorphy in stems. In a similar vein, English is usually regarded as simple in comparison with systems like Icelandic or Faroese seen as complex because of their large variety of allomorphs (Lahiri, 2000). Kusters (2003) argued that the loss of allomorphy in Arabic is an instance of simplification.
more complicated alternations, i.e., stem allomorphy.

Moving now to case syncretism and loss of the genitive plural as factors favouring cross-paradigmatic levelling, this claim is not borne out by the data. Case syncretism is systematically found in the feminine and neuter plural sub-paradigms of Greek nouns in all the other inflection classes. In some dialects, it does expand to the first inflection class as well. However, there exist dialectal varieties, displaying partial cross-paradigmatic levelling, for example, Lesvian and Aivaliot, in which loss of the genitive plural and case syncretism occur, while in others, e.g., Pontic, even though cross-paradigmatic levelling is much more expanded, i.e., affects all members of Inflection Class II, no such phenomena are attested. There are systems displaying instances of cross-paradigmatic levelling in progress or completed without these factors being at play. The loss of the genitive plural may trigger case syncretism since these two phenomena seem to go hand to hand, but no direct relation to levelling can be ascribed.

In an attempt to generalize the observed phenomena we would say that levelling does not arbitrarily or blindly eliminate alternations between forms, it rather eliminates alternations that are not so prevalent or those that are marked, i.e., further complicate the system. These findings verify one of McCarthy’s (2005) predictions on Optimal paradigms, i.e., that inflectional paradigms generally level to the unmarked.

To rephrase, cross-paradigmatic levelling manifests itself in all cases as an economic process aiming at the elimination of alternations, because they often add extra complexity without providing extra information. For example, the reanalysis of stem-allomorphic -Δ- as a part of the inflectional paradigm, i.e., -Δι, in progress in the variety of Livisi, whilst almost completed in the variety of Silli, could be interpreted as a repair strategy to reduce complexity (loss of redundancy with repair in the terms of Trudgill (2009), in the sense that one (class I) sub-paradigm is maintained instead of the initial two, the repair strategy being the constant presence of the reanalysed allomorphic -Δ- (originally part of the stem of the inflection class II nouns) in the maintained sub-paradigm).

Following Manczák’s (1958) second tendency, we would say that analogy has abolished root alternation rather than introduce it. Root alternation abolishment diminishes allomorphy, allowing for more regularity. It is in this crucial point that cross-paradigmatic levelling could be interpreted as language optimization. Loss of an inflection class sub-paradigm constitutes a move towards greater simplicity in inflection and in the paradigmatic relations of the system as a whole. In the spirit of Natural Morphology, it leads to a greater uniformity of morphological coding (Dressler, Mayerthaler, Panagl, & Wurzel, 1987; Kilani-Schoch, 1988).

Case syncretism could serve as a counterargument to the optimization claim, as mentioned above, in the sense that the “One Meaning One Form” correspondence is disturbed (Hock & Joseph, 1996). However, in our view, the evaluation of this kind of phenomena should vary depending on the typological characteristics of the systems in study (Dammel & Kürschner, 2008, p. 248). Moreover, the One Meaning One Form Principle is re-achieved in another sense, in that superficial morpho(phonological) alternations in inflectional paradigms are cast off. In a similar vein, Müller (2005, p. 259) has claimed that “By maximizing syncretism and iconicity, and minimizing the set of separate inflection marker forms, the system arguably comes close to optimal design” in the sense that redundancy resulting from the existence of several forms (sub-paradigms) for the realization of the same features/grammatical properties is avoided, thus maximization of iconicity is achieved eliminating complexity and bringing the system closer to optimality.

In an optimality-theory account, the synchronic counterpart of paradigm levelling is formalized as a set of constraints on paradigm uniformity or uniform exponence (Kenstowicz, 1995). As pointed out by an anonymous reviewer, the historical process of paradigm levelling is formalized in Optimality Theory in terms of constraint re-ranking, in which constraints on paradigm uniformity become more highly ranked than they were previously.
In this spirit, we would claim that the different dialectal cases in point could be viewed as representing different stages in the process of levelling as a pathway towards grammar optimization. It should be noted that the above-mentioned term “stage” is not thought of as a concrete phase or an autonomous module. Stages are rather conceived as different, less advanced or more advanced places/spots in the continuum of the cross-paradigmatic levelling process (depending, as already shown, on the mobility of all masculine nouns or subgroups of them, the alternation between old and innovative forms, and the reanalysis of the allomorphic -Δ- as part of the inflection).

In an effort to represent schematically the cross-dialectal divergence, we would place the dialect of Silli on the simplest pole of a complexity scaling, since in this dialect cross-paradigmatic levelling is completed, leading to a uniform plural sub-paradigm for all masculine nouns with less markedness relationships, and thus to a simplified inflectional system. By contrast, SMG would have to be placed at the complex pole of the scaling since no cross-paradigmatic levelling phenomena are attested and hence stem allomorphy and marked sub-paradigms (involving stem allomorphy) occur. Other varieties would be placed in the intermediate positions, depending on their mobility towards levelling and optimization. You can see the schema 2 below.

Schema 2:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Simplicity</th>
<th>SMG</th>
<th>Lesvian</th>
<th>Pontic</th>
<th>Livisi</th>
<th>Silli</th>
<th>Aivaliot</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For example, Livisi is placed rather close to Silli but not exactly at the simplest end, since although reanalysis of the stem allomorphic -Δ- as part of the inflectional marker is in progress, it is not generalized yet to all the members of inflection class I. Similarly, Pontic is placed next to Livisi, but a good distance from Silli, on the basis that while the process of levelling is generalized to all members of the second inflection class, the innovative inflectional patterns seem to alternate freely with the old ones (recall the examples under Example (6a), e.g., 'martires & mar'tiri “martyr.PL”). In the same spirit, Lesvian and Aivaliot are placed approximately midway, since in these varieties cross-paradigmatic levelling whilst activated, does not yet affect all members of the second inflection class, only those not displaying an allomorphic pattern with the formative -Δ-. The repair strategy involving the reanalysis of the formative -Δ- is thought of as a turning point in the on-going process of levelling as optimization in the paradigmatic relations.

Given the gradual character of the optimization process, in the intermediate stages a temporary increase in system complexity is very likely to occur, in the sense that superfluous alternations, extra temporary rules, or innovative allomorphic patterns may be introduced instead of being eliminated. For example, in Pontic (section 3.2), a split of inflection class membership between the old and the innovative plural sub-paradigm is attested, creating superfluous alternations, which in this sense complicates the inflectional system. Future research would shed some more light and account for the different possible instances of temporary complexity occurring in the

---

32 Other instances which merit further investigation might be temporarily new stem allomorphy, instances of new analogy, and phonological phenomena (e.g., vowel epenthesis).
intermediate stages\textsuperscript{33} of the optimization process (Kiparsky, 2005\textsuperscript{34}).

Conclusions

Summing up, in this paper, we hope to have shed some light and provided plausible evidence on the factors favouring the process of cross-paradigmatic levelling as grammar optimization in terms of Kiparsky (1982, 2000, 2005). In this discussion, the notions of allomorphy and markedness have proved to play a crucial role in language optimization, and thus to be integral parts of the organization of grammar (Booij, 1997; Ralli, 2006). In all cases, cross-paradigmatic levelling is accounted for not as an independent mechanism or a consequence of independent mechanisms of morphological change but as a process: in fact as the extension of an existing pattern, in the terms of Garrett (2008), which paves the way towards grammar optimization. Our findings are along the lines of Kiparsky (1982), who claimed that “Paradigmatic levelling is a direct reflex of language learners’ tendency to simplify grammar” (p. 232). However, predictions on the directions of levelling should take into account both the typological features and the strength or validity of other principles and constraints languages are subject to, as well as their parametric variation.

This brings us to future research. More systematic research and enrichment of data from other dialectal varieties are needed in order to: (1) provide an exhaustive hierarchy of all interacting factors governing the direction of levelling as optimization; (2) investigate and possibly provide some plausible explanations on the way dialectal systems balance between uniformity and contrast, or complexity and simplification depending on the prominence of different principles or constraints in different systems. Our working hypothesis is that certain types of distinctiveness should be more important in certain types of languages and others in different types of languages; and (3) investigate whether (a) contact with other languages and/or varieties (Kusters,\textsuperscript{35} 2003; Trudgill, 2009), and (b) remoteness from the Greek mainland plays a role in facilitating or favouring analogical levelling as language optimization on the level of inflection.

References


\textsuperscript{33} Due to space limitations, we cannot enrich our case study with other dialectal data. However, we should mention that it is indeed the case that in other dialectal systems, exhibiting signs of a process of cross-paradigmatic levelling in their initial stages, e.g., the varieties of Rhodes or Ioannina, the first nouns to level and adopt the paradigm of the inflection class I are those with a non-consonantal allomorphic stem, i.e., those not displaying an $X_\theta$ stem allomorph, or in Drachman’s (2001) terms, those not bearing stress on the last syllable of the stem. For example, korakas—koraki “raven”, arkodas—arkodi “potentate, gentleman” in Rhodes, or arxudas—arxod “lord” in the variety of Ioannina.

\textsuperscript{34} Intermediate cases of analogical levelling as language optimization are treated by Kiparsky (2005) in terms of Optimality Theory.

\textsuperscript{35} There is a tendency in small, isolated communities to preserve complexity—fewer simplification phenomena—than languages spoken by large communities with loose social networks and adult learning (Kusters, 2003).


Reflecting Non-Verbal Cues in the Context of Crisis: The Fist and the Open Palm in Zimbabwe’s Political Crisis

Umali Saidi
Midlands State University, Gweru, Zimbabwe

The Zimbabwean political landscape has given rise to many interpretations. Violence, intimidation, and propaganda have been part of this crisis leading to serious economic and social problems for the ordinary person. The two main political parties in the country have used party signs and symbols to assert their ideology. This paper employs the semiotic theory to explore how the ZANU PF (Zimbabwe African National Union Patriotic Front) party sign or symbol the clenched fist as well as the MDC T (Movement for Democratic Change—Tsvangirai)’s open palm, the same hand but communicating two conflicting political ideologies as non-verbal cues reveal party ideology and identity and in some cases become the cause of either conflict or harm on party followers. Semiotics offers us a platform to theorize as well as gain semantic realizations of signs and symbols as used to communicate in various contexts. Because non-verbal cues of various nature are in fact signs and symbols largely decoded by the eye, semiotics allows us to give attention to even non-verbal cues which they themselves have received less attention in communication studies yet they are found to be 60% responsible for meanings realized in any communication situation.

Keywords: fist, palm, semiotics, non-verbal

Introduction

The turn of 21st century saw Zimbabwe reduced almost to a political and economic rubble. The LRP (Land Reform Programme) dubbed “Third Chimurenga” driven by the revolutionary political party and the ZANU PF (Zimbabwe African National Union Patriotic Front) led by Robert Mugabe. The new opposition political party, the MDC (Movement for Democratic Change) led by Morgan Tsvangirai, was also viciously advancing the regime change agenda against the failing political and economic policies employed by the ruling party, ZANU PF. The country realized two political ideologies viciously conflicting for almost a decade from 1999 when the MDC was formed to 2008 when a GPA (Global Political Agreement) was put in place. The period 1999-2009 saw two hostile political camps battling ideologically and politically to control the land between the Zambezi and the Limpopo rivers through either nationalism in the ZANU PF nationalist style or regime change as driven by the MDC.

The effects were felt by the ordinary person in the streets in the form of a chronic economic crisis characterized by shortages of fuel, food, bank notes, medicine, and various public services. Agriculture was disturbed and Agro business also received a huge knock but the two political parties soldiered on for political dominance.

Umali Saidi, lecturer at Communication Skills Centre, Midlands State University.
The most disheartening realizations were propaganda, violence, and general human rights violations. Violence for example was noted in all its forms, physical in all its magnitude, psychological, and intellectual. Amnesty International (2005) reported that:

For the past five years, elections in Zimbabwe have been characterized by an escalation in human rights violations. These violations take place before, during and after elections. The majority of victims are members and supporters of the main opposition party, the Movement for Democratic Change (MDC), including opposition Members of Parliament (MPs) and opposition candidates. The perpetrators have largely been supporters of the ruling party, Zimbabwe African National Union Patriotic Front (ZANU PF), and members of the security forces.

This report summarizes the dire situation not only of MDC sympathizers but of ZANU PF and non-aligned members of the Zimbabwean society at the time. People were even forced to migrate from places of political battlefields—mostly the remote areas for the better-safe areas such as the city. But there they were followed by OM (Operation Murambatsvina) too, which was described by Vambe (2008) “in official circles as a crackdown by government agents on vendors; innocent men and women doing their business” (p. 1). Mahoso (2008), however, was quick to point out that OM was “something treated in most of the world as a routine event, namely slum clearance” (p. 160). More importantly, however:

Murambatsvina targeted people in both rural and urban areas; ZANU PF supporters, MDC supporters and the non-aligned. This sent a strong message to many Zimbabweans, which is that in the course of protecting power, a chicken, a goat, a cow and even a human being can be sacrificed. More was at stake than simply dividing the masses in terms of ZANU PF and the MDC. (Vambe, 2008, p. 3)

And an increased number of people decided to leave the country with the highest influx of boarder jumpers and Zimbabwean economic and political asylum seekers flocking to neighboring countries like South Africa and Botswana. For economic reasons, most ordinary Zimbabweans found themselves in purported safe, economically and politically stable countries around the world, mostly USA (United States of America), UK (United Kingdom), and other European and Asian countries.

Human rights violations and the economic crisis were realized largely, because people were caught up between two conflicting and hostile ideologies which were popularized through party slogans and party philosophies. The party symbols of both ZANU PF and MDC became an important mark for not only one’s political identity but also affiliation and even economic survival. The ZANU PF’s party symbol, the clenched fist raised somewhere close to the forehead, identified one as a ZANU PF cadre, a Youth Brigade or “Green Bomber”, or War Veteran. The MDC open palm identified on the other hand that one was “democratic” and an opposition member, a change force, progressive, and so on. These two symbols ceased to be simply political party symbols, but became signs from which one party would siphon individuals for punishment, political re-orientation or fish out non-aligned members of the community into submerging into either one of the two. It was as if one had to be a ZANU PF or MDC supporter or sympathiser. Periods led to elections, for example, ordinary people were in some cases forced to assume ZANU PF or MDC political identity in accordance to the political demands and context in which they found themselves. Amid “Green Bombers” or War Veterans, one assumed a ZANU PF identity, and amid MDC supporters, one had to be a “Chinja” (a Changer).

Political identities and affiliations were reduced to everyday life of individuals with simple greetings by handshake for example becoming a politically driven mode of communication. Some ZANU PF affiliated cadres
would greet using clenched fists in contrast to the socio-cultural norm of the handshake. If one brought an open palm in this scenario, he/she would have communicated easily that he/she belonged to the opposition, therefore the handshake was given a political meaning and a number of people found themselves being assaulted due to this. It is important therefore to investigate how these non-verbal cues helped push such issues and party ideologies ahead.

**Theorizing Non-verbal Cues**

**Semiotics & Non-verbal Communication**

Semiotics allows us to understand sign systems we use in our everyday lives. Saidi and Pfukwa (2011) found semiotics as a “science that studies the life of signs within a society” (p. 136). Semiotics as a theory can be credited to the Swiss linguist Ferdinand de Saussure (1857-1913) and the American philosopher Charles Peirce (1839-1914). For De Saussure (1915), language is not an event but a system of signs that “expresses” various “ideas” (pp. 66-67). The expression of these ideas through language could be read as simply the enaction of various semantic realizations in communication set-ups in a given context. In other words, the various meanings we generate from use of signs we use in a communicative environment allow us to express our deep seated notions and to even achieve various communicative goals.

De Saussure’s (1915) triangular diagram (Saidi & Pfukwa, 2011, p. 137) reveals the relationships that exist between the sign, its signifier, and the signified. The relationship, as De Saussure advanced, was arbitrary for there was no direct link between linguistic units and the objects they referred to. While De Saussure (1915) was focusing on the linguistic sign, an inference can be made which may help explain the case at hand. The idea of arbitrariness explains how non-verbal cues as semiotic signs are in their own arbitrary, in that there is nothing in the clenched fist which directly produces what it represents in ZANU PF neither is there anything directly connected to the MDC ideology from its open palm semiotic sign. Therefore, these non-verbal cues as semiotic signs are conventional and social (Culler, 1994, p. 26). The ZANU PF founding fathers and the party simply agreed that they would use the clenched fist as their party semiotic sign or the non-verbal cue. The meanings realized therefore point towards revolution, rule, victory, popularity, heroism, and consequently Pan-African nationalism. The MDC, on the other hand, decided on the open palm, which is in direct opposition to that of ZANU PF. Semantic realizations one gets for the MDC open palm are freedom, opposition, democracy, and transparency.

![Semiotic model](image)

*Figure 1. Semiotic model.*

De Saussure’s (1915) triangular diagram shows the relationship between sign, signifier, and signified. The triangular diagram thus gave rise to a semiotic model which over the years has been made visible by various scholars as summarized by Figure 1.

In the semiotic model (see Figure 1), De Saussure’s SIGN cognitively occupies the defining triangular
position and is still something which is perceived or can be seen (psychologically, physically, or otherwise) and standing for something else in the world. The CONCEPT\(^1\) becomes the thoughts and various meaningful images brought to mind due to the perception of the SIGN. This is the “thing” (De Saussure, 1966, p. 65, as cited in Manghani, Piper, & Simon, 2006, p. 105) or “something” (Manghani et al., 2006, p. 107) De Saussure and Pierce respectively refer to which is in the world to which the sign refers. For a speaker or user of a SIGN, the CONCEPT is realized by the user’s perception where CONCEPT and OBJECT are connected by the user’s existing knowledge of the world which is this case experience. SIGN and OBJECT are given life by the socio-cultural conventions within which the user is an active member. The semiotic model thus reveals the important connections from which meanings arise and are created in a communication set-up.

De Saussure (1915), apart from his contested triangular diagram, came up with two other pairs of terms, namely, the “syntagm” which refers to a set of signs strung together to express or convey various meanings. The other term is “paradigm” where same semiotic signs of the same syntagm can belong to different paradigms. In this case, political semiotic sign (non-verbal cues) qualifies as a syntagm but belongs to different or oppositional political ideologies (paradigms). This is a case in point we observe in the relationship between ZANU PF and MDC’s non-verbal communicative cues. The clenched fist and the open palm both are clusters of the same syntagm but belong to a different paradigm whose difference actually brings untold suffering to the ordinary person in the country as explained by Merjury Banda in 2005 arriving at an MDC rally as follows:

As soon as she was in the stadium, Merjury Banda reached into her bag, pulled out a T-shirt with the open-palm symbol of the Movement for Democratic Change (MDC) and slipped it over her head.

“I am afraid,” she said. “If the Zanu PF people catch me wearing this, I am in trouble. We are not free.” (Phiri, 2005, p. 1)

Indeed this marked a different direction in the history of Zimbabwe.

Pierce (1966) was credited for the tri-sign typology which he noted as ICON, INDEX, and SYMBOL. ICON and OBJECT share a degree of quality, for example, a map or a photo. The icon created in the mind of the user what Pierce (1966) found as a more developed sign by virtue of characters of its own and what it possessed whether such object exists or not (as cited in Manghani et al., 2006, p. 107). The INDEX denotes its object through physical linkage, effect, or attachment to it. A good example is smoke which could be read as an index of fire. The smoke has a physical relationship or is given effect by the fire. Pierce (1966) noted that indices had no significant resemblance to their objects and they referred to single units, individuals, or single collections through directing attention “by blind compulsion” (as cited in Manghani et al., 2006, p. 108). Psychologically, the actions of indices hence depend upon association by contingency and not association by resemblance or upon intellectual operation (Manghani et al., 2006, p. 107). SYMBOL is conventionally realized, that is, it is defined by socio-cultural convention and symbols are ideologically based. Communicative goals are thus obviously linked to or rely on the use of symbols or symbolic cues for communication hence room to assign meanings based on the notion of social and cultural convention.

De Saussure was accused of being structuralist in his semiotic theory, hence Martella (2003) chose Peirce’s cognitive semiotic theory of signs and found it more appropriate for a semiotic culture citing that Peirce’s theory “does not require a sign to be intentionally sent and artificially produced as necessary conditions in order to be

\(^1\) De Saussure’s (1915) signifier.
defined as such” (p. 3). This automatically works in negative effect to this researcher’s view as sign systems under discussion are intentionally used and their artificial production are the very conditions that give them communicative meaning. If we are to choose Pierce and De Saussure’s semiotic systems, both semiotic views partially carry the day and hence a fusion of the two semiotic systems gives us a better understanding than one which Martella (2003) advanced although Pierce’s semiotic programme is rather found to be applicable than that of De Saussure based on “cognitive and creative processes” (Martella, 2003, p. 3).

Van Leeuwen (2005) called signs “semiotic resources” which were “the actions and artifacts we use to communicate” (p. 3). These artefacts are the nucleus of varying meanings realized in a contextualized communication set-up. Van Leeuwen (2005) found that these semiotic resources did not have fixed meanings, that is, the meanings realized were not already given as they may be assumed, but convention and context came into being up the meaning. This was why he (2005) spoke of semiotic resources having what he called “meaning potential” (p. 5) traced back from Halliday’s (1978) concept of meaning potential. People are found to be try(ing) to fix meanings during communication.

The central issues brought about by semiotics are that meaning and context are the pillars of our communicative endeavors. The contextualized meaning is brought about by the patterned forms of language and in this case the use of signs as symbols for political advancement and survival. Against this background semiotics can then be viewed as a theory of meaning in that it involves production and interpretation of meaning. Meaning arises during the communicative process itself. When we create socio-cultural meanings via cultural artifacts we produce practices specific to a society of community. If a sign stands on its own it is devoid of meaning. It can only assume meaning the moment it is deliberately brought into a context where it then begins to play a part in relation to other signs. De Saussure (1915) argued for this relation/idea.

The Clenched Fist and Open Palm as Semiotic Symbols

The raised clenched fist and the open palm can generally be classified under gestures. Krauss, Chen, and Chawla (1996) presented a typology of gestures. They highlight how the typologies abound in non-verbal behavior literature about their distinctions as necessary and useful. Following Kendon (1983) (as cited in Krauss et al., 1996), “The different types of hand movements that accompany speech... arranged on a continuum of lexicalization—the extent to which they are “word like”” (p. 4). Symbolic gestures which are of interest in this paper are “gestural signs—hand configurations and movements with specific, conventionalized meanings” (Krauss et al., 1996, p. 5). The trio identifies the raised fist, bye-bye (open palm—waved) as “familiar symbolic gestures” (Krauss et al., 1996, p. 5). Of significance, however, is the notation that these symbolic gestures are used “intentionally and serve clear communicative function” (Krauss et al., 1996, p. 5). We get a comprehensive insight as follows:

Every culture has a set of symbolic gestures familiar to most of its adult members, and every similar gesture may have different meanings in different cultures. ... Although symbolic gestures often are used in the absence of speech, they occasionally accompany speech, either echoing a spoken word or phrase or substituting for something that was not said. (Krauss et al., 1996, p. 5)

This works in agreement with Kendon’s (1983, p. 27) that “Gesticulation… is important principally because it is employed, along with speech, in fashioning an effective utterance unit” (as cited in Krauss et al., 1996, p. 7).
Every sign, therefore, conveys or expresses a distinction or difference for the simple reason of achieving a communicative purpose. Of significance is that humans communicate more through non-verbal means. Researchers (Steinberg, 2007; Cleary (Ed.), 2004) estimate that the so-called body language accounts for 65%, 70%, and even 90% of human communication. Non-verbal cues are bound to culture, and according to Martella (2003), culture is “the ways in which the individual relate to the environment and other human beings” (p. 7, emphasis original). And here culture is taken as a context, in other words, as something within which the “objects can be described in legible ways’” (Martella, 2003, p. 7). Because of the different cultural underpinnings of non-verbal cues, the discussion of the clenched fist and open palm should be studied under a socio-cultural and political context in which we find them. Effective communication demands that we observe the role of non-verbal behavior as a dimension of communication competence.

**Clenched Fist and Open Palm’s Conceptual Framework**

The clenched fist (or raised fist) is believed to be a sign system that universally symbolizes resistance and unity and is part of a broader genre of “hand” symbols. The clenched fist usually appears in full frontal display showing all fingers and usually integrated with other images for example a peace symbol or tool (Cushing, 2006). Cushing (2006) traced the history of the clenched fist but the course of its usage in various contexts gave rise to the militant fist which can be said to have been co-opted by the ZANU PF from its inception before the independence to date. Because of the clenched fist’s universality, Cushing (2006) pointed out that the reference to context is crucial to understand its meaning.

The raised fist is also traced back to the trade unions around the globe from which solidarity and unity with the suffering or the oppressed people are the connotative meaning. This has been realized somewhat as a “salute”. In USA and even beyond it has been found to be or known as the “black fist” or sometimes known as the “black power fist”. Against this background, one reads association of the clenched fist with black nationalism as well as to some degree socialism. Contrary to this is the white power symbol which although uses a fist either holding a flower (which is very rare), the red-kind of hand is usually depicted with a flat palm. This easily places ZANU PF clenched fist and MDC’s open palm at logger heads as the former is aligned to self-empowerment, Pan-African nationalism, solidarity, unity, and siding with the suffering and oppressed majority of Zimbabweans. On the other hand, the MDC, though driven by black elite, sides with the white supremacy ideology, white loyalty under the guise of democratizing the nation-state which is between Zambezi and Limpopo. Cross (2011) traced the origins of the MDC open palm and said the following:

> In 1998, a small-scale farmer took a bus from his home in the Masvingo province, and after alighting in Mbare, he walked several kilometres to the headquarters of the Zimbabwe Congress of Trade Unions, where he asked to speak to its secretary-general, Morgan Tsvangirai… his secretary went to him and he agreed to see the visitor without an appointment. The old man told Tsvangirai that he felt he had a vision from God. He said he had been told in that vision to tell Tsvangirai that his party symbol should be an open hand, palm outwards, depicting openness and non-violence.2

For Cross (2011), the MDC palm is from God given to the MDC leader by a peasant which should symbolize openness and non-violence, that is, transparency and humane.

---

Reflecting on the Clenched Fist and Open Palm

The ZANU PF’s Clenched Fist

Because of these two contrasting positions, the ZANU PF’s clenched fist has a long history that captures even the generality of the suffering and the burden of the black man in the world against capitalist drive in the form of slavery and colonialism (and even apartheid); which are two separate but identical capitalist Western driven systems that subdued the African, physically, psychologically, culturally, historically, politically, and economically. The opposite stands the white supremacy drive, disguised as democracy, transparency, equity, human rights, and notions of rule of law to which the MDC readily stands aligned. This is the base or platform on which ideological differences were noted in Zimbabwe and from which the battles between the two camps were drawn to the point where the suffering and oppressed ordinary Zimbabwean citizens felt even more oppressed. It was the women and children and the old and the hungry in the rural and urban areas that had to carry the burden of the two political parties’ non-verbal cues as their respective ideological standings.

The ZANU PF clenched fist has had two realms of meanings over the years. During the colonial period, the raised clenched fist symbolized solidarity with the oppressed African populace in Zimbabwe. It stood for a fight for freedom, a fight for a vote, and a fight for equity, recognition, and participation in the economic fortunes of the country mainly through equity land distribution, dismantlement of racial segregation, access to education, and so on. The fist stood firmly for unity of purpose with regard to self-rule, recognition, and dignified towards the writing of a people’s history and embattled past. It stood for inspiration, courage, sacrifices, and continued fight for the realization of a King’s (1963) kind of dream. The clenched fist symbolized as it were a nationalist ideology, logical at the time, against the Western capitalist imposed rule and control.

After April 1980, the ZANU PF’s clenched fist assumed yet another meaning, victory over white supremacy. Not even Ian Smith’s declaration had stood the test of time. The clenched fist further stood to cement the essence of victory and symbolized a Pan-African salute and became an emblem of possibilities as well as a drive for reconciliation. Mugabe even said:

… If yesterday I fought you as my enemy, today you have become a friend and allay and with the same national interest, loyalty, rights and duties as myself. If yesterday you hated me, today you cannot avoid the love that binds you to me and me to you the wrongs of the past must now stand forgiven and forgotten. (Huyse, 2003, p. 34)

The raised clenched fist was a salute of promise; an expression of victory and success explained largely by the successes of the ruling ZANU PF government in education, infrastructure development, to mention a few. Its success earned the country identities like “The Jewel of Africa”, in some cases “The Bread Basket of Africa”. Zimbabwe’s success story became part of the black man’s success against white supremacy in the whole world. One cannot deny the ugly scenes, however, of the atrocities during the Gukurahundi era which Mugabe, though brought to an end by the 1987 Unit Accord, should not have dismissed as simply a moment of madness.

By the beginning of the 21st century, the clenched fist began to assume a different meaning from that of past years. Eyer (2001) observed that the ZANU PF’s clenched fist lost its traditional meanings in the new millennium.
for traditionally the clenched fist had been “a gesture of defiance and now signified oppression and crushed hopes when contrasted with the freedom and openness of the hand held flat and overhead” (p. 25). Thus the MDC open palm presented “an implicit contrast with the ZANU PF symbol” (Eyer, 2001, p. 25). This time, the opposition, civil society and majority disgruntlement with misplaced policies, corruption and other acts of repression, even the unsolved Gukurahundi saga as well as the land question, drove ZANU PF to resuscitate its symbolic years of revolutionary success and victory through the use of the clenched fist in its campaigns and political drives. ZANU PF’s post-war achievements and standpoint were now driven not through solidarity but this time being by intolerance. As such the clenched fist as the years went by gradually began to wear away in terms of the positive aspects of the fist in its history and took a radical, no nonsense, and militant salute. It ended up with becoming an open symbol for violence, and the enaction of repression as well as physical act of silencing those who had decided to openly oppose its stance. Operation Murambatsvina (Operation Restore Order) viewed in Moore’s (2008) perspective can be evidence of repression, violence, and an open act of silencing and punishing the majority of Zimbabweans who had openly decided to oppose ZANU PF’s stance as evidenced from the loss to the 2000 Referendum and increasing popularity of the opposition party, the MDC. Moore says of OM that:

Operation Murambatsvina should be seen as an almost logical extension of the techniques of a party that has consistently failed to rule Zimbabwe through consent rather than force or its possibility. Indeed, closer inspection and historical analysis of the ruling party itself suggests that the leading elements within it rarely reach even a position of “minimal hegemony” (i.e., agreement within members or factions of a ruling group). This lack of consensus spreads throughout the party and into society in manifestations of violence. (as cited in Vambe, 2008, p. 22)

Election periods were characterized by violence and the ZANU PF was found to be the culprit with highest numbers of offenders and having the least numbers of victims (see also Sachikonye (2011) for statistics on violence). Human Rights Organizations, Civil Society, and the International Community came up with a lot of reports on violations including the Tibaijuka 2005 UN report. In 2005, Amnesty International reported that “Perpetrators have largely been supporters of the ruling party, Zimbabwe African National Union Patriotic Front (ZANU PF)”

Political identity and affiliation became a central notion for survival as the clenched fist was taken to the very core of everyday life even to a simple greeting. Ordinary Zimbabweans lived fearful lives and had no sense of social security as either one would easily be subjected to ridicule by ZANU PF sympathizers or physically assaulted for waving the hand. MDC in 2005 had the highest number of victims (Sachikonye, 2011).

The ZANU PF leadership also drove notions of violence in their discourse while lifting the clenched fist as a non-verbal cue from which it could cement their meanings. The leader of ZANU PF is without blame in this case. The media, both state and independent, quoted him several times pinpointing towards a violent resistance to regime change. Nkatazo (2009) reported that Mugabe while addressing voters during the 2008 presidential election campaign is quoted as having said his party symbol of a clenched fist was evidence that “we can box” and “displaying a grasp of Ndebele repeated ‘Thina ingindi silazo, siyanqinda futhi (we have the fists, and we can box’” (Retrieved from www.newzimbabwe.com). This public and open declaration of violence signified by the clenched fist which one hoped should have signified solidarity, deviance, and a fight for Black nationalism influenced members and even state organs to victimize anyone deemed to be an opposition member.

The MDC Open Palm

The MDC’s open palm was also not without its problems. If we are to consider the meanings assigned to it
against the universal symbolic meanings one would think that the MDC is identifying with the notion of white supremacy ideology and loyalty. As such the MDC’s purported stance to fight and usher a new era in Zimbabwe was wound up by elements of disregard and intolerance for the revolutionary party and against it. The drive for democracy, rule of law, and fight against corruption was driven by the regime change agenda which was powered by desire to exterminate and even delete ZANU PF from the face of Zimbabwean history. The use of the open palm therefore stood radically opposed to that of ZANU PF. Interestingly, they opted to use the same hand (right hand) but having a radical difference in the sign itself. It stands closely linked to De Saussure’s (1915) notion of difference where we cannot have good without bad or white without black.

Even as ZANU PF critics blamed ZANU PF for the violence, ordinary Zimbabwean recount how MDC supporters were also responsible for the thuggery and human rights violations with the hope that ZANU PF which already used a clenched fist purported to be signifying violence and whose leaders claimed to have “degrees in violence” (Meredith, 2007, p. 241) would easily shoulder the blame. The following confession is observed.

It’s funny I got in trouble from the MDC members who were in the streets yesterday singing and chanting slogans but they suddenly started beating people and much worse stealing from people found on ATMs. I really was disappointed especially to be assaulted by my party people… But some are saying they are ZANU-PF youth purporting to be MDC. But I really wonder coz they were also beating up members of the police force, soldiers, prison service, and anyone putting on ZANU-PF T-shirts. (Moore, 2005, p. 13)

Moore (2005) went on to reveal how MDC was responsible for human rights violations like ZANU PF by noting that:

Many MDC and civil society advisors say only action in the streets will dislodge Mugabe, or persuade the Bretton Woods institutions to maintain their sanctions on a ZANU PF led Zimbabwe until a “government of national unity” is forced down both parties’ throats. The MDC is caught between the false petards of social movement activism and “pragmatic” constitutionalism. Its leader is accused of vacillation. (p. 13, emphasis the author’s)

One wonders what this “action” was for even Tsvangirai was quoted while addressing a rally by both the state and independent media asking Mugabe to leave office peacefully failure of which he would be removed violently. Could it not be the action reported by a victim above who was assaulted by the MDC youths with the hope of having every violent act blamed on the clenched fist? Even the open palm in this regard was found responsible for the destructions of the livelihoods of ordinary people, acts which made the international community “maintain their sanctions on a ZANU PF led Zimbabwe” (Moore, 2005, p. 13), and sanctions which continue to hurt the economy of this country even in the era of a GPA (Global Political Agreement)5. It is important to note that the MDC’s ostensible stance has been to usher in a new era, yet their stance has been marked by an intolerance denigration and denial of what ZANU PF stands for.

The MDC symbol makes one read a number of meanings. These are transparency and democracy, different like the five fingers but united in the same transparent purpose. It stands for a difference, a new direction and new way to policy making and self-rule. It stands as if the party and what it represents stands for no hidden agenda as by clenching a fist it looks as if there is something hidden. The delayed announcements of presidential election results in 2008, for example, seem to have made ZANU PF at the verge of reliving its hidden and

---

5 GPA of 2008 which ushered in the Inclusive Government after the heavily disputed Presidential election in the same year.
misrepresentation and cheating stance.

Kahuni (2011) reacted to the open palm symbol adding his voice to how Jonathan Moyo, then the Information and Publicity Minister, took MDC to court over the use of the open palm symbol, citing that it was encroaching the everyday life of people. Jonathan Moyo lost the case (Kahuni, 2011). Kahuni (2011) had this to say of the open palm:

The waving of an open palm in a church sermon is a sign of passing a Godly message denoting peace. The open palm is used, internationally, at bus stops, airports, roadsides, and at the end of family yards to bid farewell to friends on a journey: indeed on a good journey for that matter. An open palm in Christianity denotes submission to God, showing him our willingness and readiness to be spiritually served. The open palm is also used for welcoming or greeting people as they shake hands and hug.

One appreciated the open palm’s meanings in the church or social context but the MDC used the same politically and whose meaning should therefore be seen within a radical political context from which then Kahuni (2011) saw the open palm as having been abused in terms of meaning, and he said:

However, this symbol that denotes peace, stability and hospitality has been hijacked from places of worshiping, places of biding farewell, places of welcoming, and places of greetings to the streets of violence by the MDC-T who has tried to use it in a treacherous fashion to bid farewell to our sovereignty, independence and territorial integrity.

This explains why human rights violations in the country not only by ZANU PF but by MDC as well, either in defense or otherwise affected the image of both parties, their followers, and the non-aligned. The point of conflict became not the use of these differing symbols but the ideology behind the symbols from which neither party was ready to accept and respect the other. This is why even the other contexts which Kahuni (2011) spoke of (where the open palm was used) ended up with being interpreted politically and as such political reactions and actions were used to make a party superior than the other. Election observers in Zimbabwe especially in the 2000 and 2002 elections concluded that the election (mostly the 2000 parliamentary elections) had become an election of the clenched fist—ZANU-PF’s symbol—versus the hand held open, that of the MDC (Johnsson, 2000).

Thomas Mapfumo (as cited in Eyer, 2001, pp. 25-27) pointed out that during his concerts leading up to June 2000 elections, fans would spontaneously raise their hands in the MDC salute. Therefore, these concerts became informal rallies for the MDC as they used the open palm hoping to have meant a salute to the musical guru, his music, and a general celebration of the rhythm of life. Among the fans, one observes that not all were for the MDC and some were even non-aligned. For Mapfumo, to conclude that the raising of the open palm was in the MDC salute means his concerts became politicized, and one realizes how even a social gathering and an attendance to a musical concert became an indirect political participation. One would then conclude that by attending a concert like that of Mapfumo, an individual was participating in the MDC affiliates. In contrast, those who did not attend or decided not to attend perhaps meant that they were not affiliated to MDC but to ZANU PF even in music. The populace was therefore divided into two camps in most structures of life, even in cases of musical taste.

The media was even quick to popularize situations where the open palm was used especially by media houses hostile to the ruling party. Tongai Moyo’s (see Appendix 4) salute to his fans with open palms peppered
by the red\textsuperscript{6} guitar and shirts of his band dancing members at the background was used in this case in a political sense, as if he was advancing the MDC agenda. A similar scenario was also captured by The Daily News in 2000 just before the 2000 election in which the First Lady Grace Mugabe arriving at a ZANU PF rally waved the open palm, and at the same time Mugabe saluted the crowd with a clenched fist. The photo was placed on front page generally sending a message of lampooning the Mugabe family as united in matrimony but divided in political affiliations. It was as if Grace was emphasizing the MDC political agenda when one could read a genuine salute and mob greeting by waving.

The same could also be said of a ZANU PF supporter celebrating victory with Mugabe (see Appendix 1). The message one gets here is simply a genuine celebration by lifting both hands and the clenched fist was raised in this case to indicate victory for ZANU PF. But getting into the hands of ZANU PF’s media opponents, the same photo could give a different interpretation which aims at downplaying the revolutionary party, and its leader gives that Mugabe himself is being brushed in celebrations by the open palm in the photo. Appendix 3 is another image used to accuse ZANU PF of violence and thuggery. The photo appeared in the independent media carrying the headline which reads “Captured on Camera: Zanu PF thugs beating MDC-T supporter” (Retrieved from www.nehandaradio.com). There is nothing in the photo which identifies anyone captured as either ZANU PF or MDC (MDC-T for that matter). But interpretations and its usage have been used to justify and identify ZANU PF as the obvious offender and MDC, especially MDC-T\textsuperscript{7} as the victim. One assumes that the Bretton Wood institutions could have maintained their economic grip and stifled the Zimbabwe economic life citing continued human violations by ZANU PF which they have failed to extinguish from the corridors of history and power in Zimbabwe. Such misrepresentations by the media have led to political polarization in the country and have actually made the Zimbabwean country a nation characterized by violence, unsafe, dangerous, and resulting in general isolation at the international level not only economically but even socially as well as making Zimbabwe as a nation and its people unable to effectively take part in development issues. The dignity of the nation and its people received a huge knock over the years with some even concluding that Zimbabwe had become a failed state.

Eyer (2001) also spoke of a petition which circulated in Bulawayo churches drafted by a preacher stating in part that it had become difficult for everybody to wave hands at one’s loved ones or for praise worshiping as they would be associated with the MDC. The open palm thus penetrated the core of Zimbabwe’s social life subjecting the use of the open palm symbol for praise in church, celebration of victory or genuine salute in musical concerts by fans and musicians to political scrutiny. In 2001, ZANU PF legislators even took a bold move by proposing to parliament the banning of the open hand symbol but were not successful.

**The Clenched Fist, Open Palm and Social Life**

It is the opinion of this researcher that the open palm used by the MDC apart from having popularized the MDC became politically justified in raising the people’s concerns against the ZANU PF led government’s failed policies and rising corruption. And this actually was a cause of the euphoria the majority had that for the first time in the history of Zimbabwe a robust force had risen to question ZANU PF’s position. The MDC’s open palm

---

\textsuperscript{6} The MDC also uses the red colour to signify send-off in the soccer/football style in which a referee who shows a red card to a player means he/she has been disqualified from playing in that match.

\textsuperscript{7} MDC split into two MDC-T (led by Morgan Tsvangirai) and MDC-M (led by Arthur Mutambara) (now MDC-N led by Welshman Ncube).
amid this euphoria also became an object of repression and oppression for the ordinary person in Zimbabwe especially during election periods. Nyaira reported in *The Daily News* that “the hand waving gesture has been ritually enforced at music concerts and football matches, much to the chagrin of the ruling ZANU PF” (as cited in Eyer, 2001, p. 26). Such an observation therefore exposed music and football fans and even church goers to the wrath of the ZANU PF who felt they had nowhere else within the social lives of its people from which they could advance their own political agenda. Eyer (2001) concluded that “Displaying an open hand… became dangerous, cause of severe beating if the wrong person saw you do it” (p. 26).

Even children understood the implications as exemplified by the rural children whom a state university lecturer interviewed by this researcher confirmed that in her rural home, Mberengwa, children are now crippled from their childhood pastime games of waving to passing vehicles and they now do so using clenched fists. Sometime in 2000, *The Daily News* also carried a cartoon in which the rural people seating around a fire on cold nights warmed their hands with clenched fists instead of the usual one in which one does so with open palms. The message driven by such cartoons indicated how daily social life became unbearable for the ordinary Zimbabwean even for children who if seen waving an open palm would put their parents in possible danger.

When Simba Makoni broke away from ZANU PF and formed his “centrist party, Muvambo Kusile Dawn (MKD)” (Onslow, 2011, p. 14) in 2008, the party gesture was a two-palm symbol in which two hands were brought together and raised overhead which signified peace and unity. Jonathan Moyo contesting in the 2005 Parliamentary Elections had also ended his political marriage to ZANU PF and stood as an independent candidate used the “V” finger symbol for peace. These two gestures while having a place in Zimbabwean political arena did not cause mayhem, suffering social, religious, and even economic discomfort to the general populace in Zimbabwe. Only the clenched fist and the open palm were a danger to identify with for economic, religious, and political gains.

**Conclusions**

It is apparent that non-verbal cues have power in themselves. They can make or break a society. In the Zimbabwean political context as has been noted the two non-verbal cues, the clenched fist for the ZANU PF and the open palm for the MDC both carry political ideologies which may even be read as difficult to reconcile. The reactions of ZANU PF and its verge to rubber stand the continued existence of the black salute were largely against the MDC’s open palm largely aligned to notions of white supremacy, democracy, and transparency in a manner that stung the revolutionary party. As such the two ideological battles were disseminated to the ordinary person in the streets even if it meant using every means available for example state organs in the case of ZANU PF or a call for international economic isolation as campaigned by MDC’s so-called targeted sanctions. The economy of the country suffered due to the country’s isolation, disturbances in economic activities (mostly agriculture), and attention instead of giving to politics. The social and religious lives and even children’s games that used open palms exposed children and their parents to agony and inability to live normal lives. Even musical concerts and sport attendances mostly football became a political arena and battlefields from which the media captured moments of political and ideological battles between ZANU PF and MDC.

Semiotics as a theory and discipline offers us an opportunity to understand the sign systems that surround us as people and how we can therefore use sign systems ideologically or intellectually for the good of humanity and for constructive communicative purposes where tolerance and the idea of difference do not make the powerful or
the weak objects of extinction. It is in the hope of this researcher that this paper may contribute in the rebuilding of the nation as well as inform directions in the doldrums of national healing and reconciliation. Further studies can also be made in this direction.

References

Appendices


In this picture from the Daily News members of the notorious ZANU PF Chipangano group can be seen assaulting an alleged MDC-T supporter during the opening of Parliament in Harare on Tuesday. (Picture by Annie Mpalume) [Caption original].

Code-Switching as a Strategy Use in an EFL Classroom in Taiwan

WENG Pei-shi
Tamkang University, New Taipei, Taiwan

This paper aims to present the use of code-switching in an English classroom. A general English class with 36 sophomore students from different departments (music, Japanese, management, and so on) and an English lecturer with over 20-year teaching experience were involved in this study. The EFL (English as a foreign language) classroom was tape-recorded and then the functions of the code-switching were analyzed on the basis of Hymes’ (1962) framework. In addition, after the class observation, participants, including the lecturer and students, needed to fill in one questionnaire related to the use of code-switching and the use of native language in an EFL classroom. Finally, a post-interview of the lecturer was used to explain the lecturer’s point of view about the use of code-switching and native language during the English learning class. In sum, this study indicates that the use of code-switching and L1 (first language) would facilitate the L2 (second language) learning. Thus, L1 could be a useful and important element to help L2 learners to learn the foreign language during the learning process.

Keywords: code-switching, L2 (second language) learning, teacher’s feedback

Introduction

Since the 1990s, numbers of studies started to examine an issue related to the target (L2 (second language)) and native (L1 (first language)) use in an EFL (English as a foreign language) classroom. In the past, some studies proposed L1 use contrasted the pedagogy of teaching English through English (Chambers, 1991; Halliwell & Jones, 1991). For those studies, teaching through the target language makes the language authentic and helps learners to be familiar with the whole English environment. This statement supports Krashen’s (1981) comprehensible input and natural order hypothesis. However, recently, this English-only pedagogy has been questioned and some research studies show that L1 is also beneficial in English learning classrooms. Guthrie (1984) has early questioned that whether the fact that a class is conducted entirely in the target language results in greater intake by those learners. It seems that the debate between L1 and L2 use has existed for a long time. As a result, the purpose of this study is to examine the use of code-switching in an English classroom, and from the results, the researcher tries to investigate if L1 is necessary in English learning processes and then provides some implications for future teaching.

Code-Switching Use in Class

Code-switching, including mixing, transferring, and borrowing, is the use of two languages simultaneously or interchangeably (Valdes-Fallis, 1977). Also, code-switching is a common phenomenon that
people use to convey a complete idea. When students are unable to conceive an appropriate word within a limited amount of time, code-switching, in some cases, allows them to express themselves more fluidly (Weinreich, 1970).

As we know, there are copies of research studies arguing that the strategy of code-switching can be a useful tool in assisting English language teaching and learning process. Code-switching helps the senders transfer the information to the receivers effectively (Skiba, 1997). Thus, code-switching has positive effect on learning processes. On the other hand, Ellis (1994), Cook (2001), and Richards and Rodgers (2001) who are specialized in L2 acquisition state that although the exposure to the target language (L2) can help learners to achieve success, this exposure may not always work effectively in every context. There are still lots of factors affecting the learning success. For example, English-only classroom would lead to frustration and anxiety, because the learners cannot get enough and proper comprehensible input. Based on above arguments, code-switching could be a strategy used by teachers to help learners. Various positive functions of code-switching, such as explaining new vocabulary, grammar, and new concepts, and relaxing learners would improve the learners’ comprehensible input during the learning process (Ahmad & Jusoff, 2009).

To sum up, on the basis of above discussion, there are three major research questions involved in this study: (1) What are the functions of code-switching used by the teacher in class?; (2) What are the students’ feedback and attitudes towards the use of code-switching in class?; and (3) What are the teacher’s feedback and attitudes towards the use of code-switching in class?.

Methodology

Subjects
A total number of 36 non-English major sophomore students and an experienced English lecturer in the course of “language training” from a university of New Taipei City were involved in this study. Based on the entrance exam in Taiwan, all of the students were divided into several classes (A, B, and C levels). This class belongs to Level B (intermediate level). In addition, this class consists of several different developments in this university—applied Japanese, applied music, and religion. Then the English lecturer in this study is a male Taiwanese teacher teaching over 20 years in this school, who is responsible for language training course in this school.

Instruments
Classroom observation. The researcher observed and video recorded the class conversations for 30 minutes. During the observation, the researcher recorded the teacher’s speech in the class. Also the research took notes on code-switching between Chinese and English when it occurred.

Questionnaire. A questionnaire was used to investigate students a feedback and attitude to the code-switching use (L1 use) in the English classroom. For students’ questionnaire, there are seven major questions related to the use of code-switching during the teaching. Students needed to provide their opinions to see if they thought L1 is important during the teaching process. For example, when and why did he use L1 during the teaching?. In addition, in order to avoid participants’ misunderstanding about the questionnaire, this study used the two questionnaires in Chinese version to help subjects understand clearly.

Post-interview. After the teaching, a short post-interview was conducted in this study. The lecturer needed to answer the following questions related to his teaching philosophy and his opinions towards the use of code-switching. The following questions were adapted from Hou’s (2006) study. The interview questions are
listed as follows: (1) the teaching background; (2) philosophy of teaching; (3) the percentage of L1 use in class; and (4) students’ comprehension of the teacher’s English use.

Procedure

Based on the research questions involved in this study, the research design was set up as follows. At first, the researcher observed this language training courses for about 30 minutes, and then, after the whole observation was completed, the subjects involved in this study needed to complete a questionnaire related to their attitude to code-switching use in class. Finally, the experienced English lecturer participating in this study accepted a brief post-interview about his attitude to the code-switching use in class. Figure 1 shows the brief research design of this study:

Results and Discussion

Observed data were analyzed in EFL context of the research questions presented in previous section. According to the three research questions, this section was divided into three major parts. The first part is the different functions of the teacher’s code-switching use during teaching. The researcher adapted Hymes’ (1962) framework, which included expressive, directive, metalinguistic, poetic, and referential functions to analyze the speakers’ uses of code-switching in classroom setting. Then, the second part is students’ feedback to the use of code-switching in the class. Finally, the third part is the teacher’s attitude towards his teaching philosophy.

The Functions of the Teacher’s Code-Switching Use

According to Hymes (1962), there were five basic functions about code-switching/mixing. In the following, the researcher analyzed the teacher’s teaching in this course based on Hymes’ framework.

Expressive functions. The teacher used code-switching to express the emotions. Chinese words are often inserted to express the true feelings (see Example 1).

Example (1) (20:28)

T: If the vending machine did not return back your money, you will say “🙁 😞 😞 😞 😞 😞”.

Directive functions. Generally speaking, this function is used in a situation where a speaker wants to direct someone. This function can get the listeners’ attention. In addition, this function often occurs in both social equals and social unequals. According to Hymes (1962), there are two subcategories: (1) direction/persuasion; and (2) social exclusion. Here are some examples (see Examples 2-6).
Example (2) (5:05)
T: ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග (Please remove all the things from your desk.)

Example (3) (12:30)
T: ග ග ග ග ග ග (Let’s move to the next one.)

Example (4) (13:10)
T: ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග 🌼
(Let’s go. Please look at the next word. Let’s go.)

Example (5) (15:21)
T: ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග ග 🌼
(Let’s start to listen to this paragraph.)

Example (6) (23:52)
T: Doris, ග ග ග ග ග ග ග 🌼 That will be good. (Doris, do you have anything to say? That will be good.)

**Matalinguistic functions.** It includes the definition of terms, paraphrasing others’ words, and some metaphors. Especially metaphors exist between equals but other functions can exist between equals and unequals (see Examples 7-11).

Example (7) (9:57)
T: Survey. Survey 🌼
(When doing research, you can use this tool to find the answers.)

Example (8) (10:40)
T: Empathy. 🌼
(Empathy, a kind of performance, can be used to express empathy to some questions.)

Example (9) (17:35)
T: ග ග ග 🌼 What’s up 🌼? What’s up means how are you. 🌼
(Do you know the meaning of “what’s up?” “What’s up means how are you. You can use it to say hello to your friends.)

Example (10) (18:01)
T: Vending machine. 🌼
(Vending machine is a kind of machine. You put your money into this machine and press the bottom, and then you can buy what you want.)

Example (11) (23:09)
T: A disappointing situation. Disappointing 🌼
(Disappointing is an adjective.)

**Poetic functions.** About poetic functions, it means that during the conversation, the speaker inserted some jokes, stories, and some poetic quotations into an English-based conversation. During the teaching, the researcher did not find any examples related to this function. No related examples were found in the teacher’s teaching.

**Referential functions.** According to Chen’s (2003) explanations, referential function has following categories. The first one is terms that lack readily available in the other languages. The second one is terms that lack semantically appropriate words in other languages. The final one is terms with which the speakers are more familiar in L1 than in L2. Also, here, no related examples were found in the teacher’s teaching.
From the above analysis, the research found that most of the time, the teacher used code-switching to give students’ instructions, to explain complex concepts, and to explain the difficult words. From the teacher’s perspective, the teacher used lots of different code-switching skills to make the students understand what the teacher taught and also to keep the teaching fluent. Here, the teacher used code-switching of direct functions to control his students to ensure students can understand the instructions and then follow the class schedule. Further, the teacher used the code-switching to express the meanings of the new vocabulary and some complex concepts, such as grammar and some explanations. As a teacher, using this function can help students to understand what they have to learn in a class and then students may not feel confused easily.

**Students’ Feedback to the Use of Code-Switching in the Class**

The questions contained in this questionnaire were analyzed and explained as follows (see Tables 1-6).

**Table 1**

Question 1: Do You Like Your Teacher Use Chinese in This English Course?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Liked</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
<th>A little</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>Very much</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14/36 (39%)</td>
<td>22/36 (61%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 2**

Question 2: In Your Opinion, When Do You Think Chinese Is Necessary in the English Learning Class? (Multiple Choices)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Define new vocabulary</td>
<td>20/112 (18%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice translation</td>
<td>18/112 (16%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explain complex grammar rules</td>
<td>26/112 (23%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explain complex concepts</td>
<td>25/112 (22%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide instructions</td>
<td>14/112 (13%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggest how to learn English efficiently</td>
<td>9/112 (8%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 3**

Question 3: If You Think Using Chinese Is Necessary, What Is the Major Reason?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Understanding complex concepts</td>
<td>16/36 (44%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding new vocabulary</td>
<td>13/36 (36%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reducing anxiety</td>
<td>6/36 (17%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catching up with the class procedure</td>
<td>1/36 (3%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 4**

Question 4: Do You Think It Is Helpful to Use Chinese in the English Learning Class?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Helpfulness</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
<th>A little</th>
<th>Much</th>
<th>Very much</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14/36 (39%)</td>
<td>18/36 (50%)</td>
<td>4/36 (11%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 5**

Question 5: How Often Did the Teacher Use Chinese in This Class?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Not</th>
<th>A little</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>Much</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2/36 (6%)</td>
<td>30/36 (83%)</td>
<td>4/36 (11%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 6**

Question 6: In Your Opinion, What Is the Percentage Should the Teacher Use Chinese in Class?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
<th>A little</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>Much</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2/36 (6%)</td>
<td>16/36 (44%)</td>
<td>12/36 (33%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall, students confirmed that the use of code-switching is necessary in EFL teaching. Sixty-one percent...
of students like the use of Chinese in their English learning process. Moreover, a total of 23% of the students indicated that it is necessary for the teacher to use L1 to explain complex grammar rules. Besides that, 22% of students indicated that it is necessary for the teacher to use L1 to explain complex concepts. In addition, 36% of students stated that L1 can help them to understand new vocabulary. These findings correspond to Ahmad and Jusoff’s (2009) study. Those students perceived that the use of code-switching has helped them understand difficult concepts faced in their learning. In addition, the teacher’s code-switching has helped them understand the grammar being taught. Also, students perceived that they are satisfied with the use of L1 during their learning. They think the use of L1 in class is related to their learning success. If the teacher can use L1 appropriately in class, students can reduce some anxiety and get some psychological support. As a result, learning success requires successful provision of comprehensible input to ensure that students understand the content, the grammar rules, complex concepts, and so on (Tang, 2002).

In sum, English learning success involves students’ ability to use English effectively, which means students can understand the teacher’s input and try to intake the knowledge the teacher provides in class. As we know, an English-only classroom cannot always guarantee the comprehensible input. Thus, the use of code-switching by the teacher can be seen as a kind of teaching strategy to help students.

The Teacher’s Feedback and the Teaching Philosophy

As mentioned above, there are four major areas for the interview questions: (1) the teaching background; (2) philosophy of teaching; (3) the percentage of L1 use in class; and (4) students’ comprehension of the teacher’s English use.

Question 1: How long did you teach English? What kind of course are you responsible for?
Ans: “Actually, I have been taught English over 20 years. At school, I am responsible for several different courses, such as language training, grammar, linguistics, reading and so on”.

Question 2: What is your philosophy of teaching?
Ans: “I emphasize the interaction between teachers and students. Thus, I hope my students can achieve the goal of communication. In addition, I hope students can find answers by themselves. Thus, I always encourage them to asking questions and also I will ask them some questions in class. I do not like to become a class controller. I hope I can be a facilitator to help them to improve their English ability”.

Question 3: How much L1 do you use in class?
Ans: “It depends on what kind of course I teach now. If this is an oral practice course, I would not use L1 so often. For oral practice, the goal is to help students to speak out. Thus, I would encourage them to use L2 even they still make some mistakes. However, if the course requires more complex concepts, I would use L1 more. Thus, students will be more familiar with these concepts and also reduce the anxiety”.

Question 4: Take this class as an example. Do you think your students can understand the content of this class?
Ans: “From this class, I found it seems that some students can not catch up with the class schedule. If I just use L2 to express some meanings, students start to feel confused and then start to lose the attention in class. As a result, for the next class, I think I would use more L1 to help them”.

Conclusions

From the above findings, overall, the findings indicated that most students have positive attitude to the teacher’s code-switching use in this EFL classroom. First, students like the teacher to use L1 in their English class. Second, students think it is necessary for the teacher to use L1 in explaining complex grammar rules, complex concepts, and defining new vocabulary. Third, students indicate using L1 in class can help them understand complex concepts and reduce anxiety. On the other hand, from the teacher’s perspective, it is necessary to use L1
in class but the teacher still needs to pay attention to the goals of each course. L1 is effective in some courses related to some complex concepts. However, if the course is related to the goal of communication, such as oral practice, the teacher can try to reduce the use of L1 and then encourage students to use L2 in class even they would make some mistakes. But basically, code-switching is still a strategy teachers can try to use to help learners. The researcher suggests that the strategy of code-switching in EFL classroom is not always a deficiency in language learning, but may be considered as a kind of useful strategy in learning a language.

References
The Study of Pragmatics in the Interpretation
From Chinese Into English*

ZOU Jian-ling
University of Shanghai for Science and Technology, Shanghai, China

Interpretation is a cross-cultural communication. Interpreters’ awareness of cultural difference and context plays a vital role in conveying faithful and reliable information. Thus it is essential for interpreters to possess some pragmatic ability. It is proposed that pragmatic ability should be obtained from studying the correctness and appropriateness of language expression and linguistic comprehension. This paper lists examples of two kinds of pragmatic failures committed in the process of interpretation: pragma-linguistic failures and socio-linguistic pragmatic failures, and analyzes the causes of the pragmatic failures from the perspectives of culture and value. The purpose of the paper is to help facilitate oral interpretation in the cross-cultural communication.

Keywords: interpretation, communication, pragmatic ability, context, cross-culture pragmatic failure, pragmatic difference

Introduction

With the development of foreign trade and cultural exchange, interpreting activities are wildly carried on. Interpreter also becomes a very hot occupation. Many English majors and learners are involved in this occupation. However, their oral interpretative qualities are at variance. Judging from interpreting standards, we can find that some interpreters only focus on correctness in linguistic form and fluency in expression but neglect two important factors—cultural difference and context. Consequently, their interpretation will be inappropriate in context and cannot convey the speaker’s true feeling or attitude. Accordingly, interpretation is closely relevant with other disciplines, pragmatics in particular. Firstly, let us analyze the relationship between pragmatics ability and interpretation.

Pragmatic ability is a kind of communicative ability, referring to the ability to comprehend context and understand others’ meaning and intention based on contextual knowledge, and to correctly express one’s meaning (HE, 1997). In other words, pragmatic ability is an ability to understand and apply language to different communicative situations. Interpretation is a process of receiving and decoding source language, then recoding it to target language. Therefore, interpreter has to undertake the hard task of decoding and recoding message simultaneously. Faithful and reliable information conveyed by an interpreter depends largely on his/her

*Acknowledgements: The paper is funded by University of Shanghai for Science and Technology (USST) of Humanities and Social Sciences (USST 11XSY21).
ZOU Jian-ling, lecturer at College of Foreign Language, University of Shanghai for Science and Technology.
awareness of context, thus it is essential for interpreter to possess pragmatic ability. How to obtain pragmatic ability? We will discuss the question from the perspectives of language expression and language comprehension.

Language Expression—Correctness and Appropriateness

Correctness in expression refers to that words are correct in collocation and sentences are correct in grammar. Its function is to ensure that communication can be smoothly carried out. Appropriateness of expression refers to sentences which are not only grammatically correct, but also appropriate and fit in specific situations. Since interpretation is an oral communication, the appropriateness in context is more important than the correctness in grammar. What is more, not all grammatically correct sentences are appropriate. Some of them are pragmatically unacceptable. XIA (1995) gave us the followings (see Examples 1-2).

Example (1) A director of a school made a welcome speech for an American teacher. The interpreter translated his sentences like following:

“Ladies and gentlemen, I’m delighted to introduce to you a very pretty girl, Miss Brown. She is a very good teacher from the USA…”

Although this sentence is grammatically correct, but inappropriate from the angle of pragmatics. Firstly, according to western culture, a grown-up will be unhappy when addressed “girl”, since girl implies being inexperienced and immature. Secondly, when meeting at the first time, people seldom use subjective words, such as “pretty”, “good”, etc., to describe a person.

Example (2) “Could you possibly help me with the luggage?”

If the speaker asks for help to an unfamiliar person, this sentence is undoubtedly very appropriate. But if the speaker talks to his/her intimate friend, it will not be suitable.

In a word, correctness and appropriateness are important in cross-cultural communication. Communication is a dynamic process. Interpreters must frequently adjust their codes and make their interpretation fit for cultural context in target language.

Interpretation is a direct and face-to-face cross-cultural communication. The interpreters’ cultural knowledge on the source language and the target language is vital to the success of interpretation. Therefore, it is of great importance for interpreters to have awareness of cross-cultural in order to avoid cross-cultural pragmatic failures. The followings will analyze and study some pragmatic failures frequently committed in Chinese-English interpretation in order to clear up misunderstandings and facilitate communication.

Pragmatic failures do not refer to performance errors in selecting words and making sentence, but failures in talking something in inappropriate or incorrect expression, which results in the failure of communication (HE, 1997). “The inability to understand what is meant by what is said”, Thomas (1983) believed that there were two kinds of cross-culture pragmatic failures: pragma-linguistic failure and socio-linguistic failure.

Trying to Avoid Pragma-Linguistic Failures in Interpretation

Thomas (1983) pointed out that:

Pragma-linguistic failure occurs when the pragmatic force mapped by the speaker onto a given utterance is systematically different from most frequently assigned to it by native speakers of the target language, or when conversational strategies are inappropriately transferred from language 1 to language 2. (p. 99)
Pragma-linguistic failures result from a failure to identify or express meanings correctly. As far as Chinese-English interpretation is concerned, pragma-linguistic failures are committed in the equivalence between Chinese and English words according to their literary meaning, which violate linguistic conventions of English native speakers. People often commit pragma-linguistic failures in the following situations:

**Finding equivalence from one language to the other language.** The typical example is that Chinese people are used to answering some questions with “确认” (“of course” in English) (ZHANG, 2000). When they communicate with foreigners, they also bring this habit into English expressions. But in English, “of course” implies “evidently” and “clearly”. Therefore, after hearing the reply, listener will probably feel unhappy: “Do you think I am foolish?”.

For another example: There are many modifiers in Chinese, such as “可能, 或许, 可能的, 可能性, 关于, 约定, 大约, 大概, 几乎, 根本, 基本上”, etc. (WANG, 2002). But in English, too many modifiers will appear redundant and malfunction contrarily. Interpreter does not necessarily translate each modifier. Moreover, some sentences with modifiers, which seem very correct and appropriate in Chinese expression, become completely unsuitable when interpreted into English. For instance, when one foreign delegation visit a company, Chinese like to say to them “你的意见将被非常重视” as an end. If an interpreter translates this sentence into “Please give us your valuable opinions”, the visitors will feel embarrassed and probably think “How can I know whether my opinions are valuable or not”. On this occasion, they will say nothing. In fact, the best interpretation is “Your opinions will be appreciated”.

**Neglecting the cultural difference between Chinese and English and interpret in Chinese way.** Influenced by traditional culture with Confucianism as a core, Chinese people regard modesty and implicitness as virtues and tend to respond in an ambiguous way to show their courtesy. Thus, Chinese people often use vague words in communication, such as “可能, 或许, 可能的, 可能性, 关于, 约定, 大约, 大概, 几乎, 根本, 基本上” (“maybe, perhaps, probably, about, approximately, almost, nearly, generally, basically”) (WANG, 2002). But Westerners, especially American people, on the contrary, are more straightforward. They like to go directly to topics. Too many vague words in interpretation will give foreigners the impression of ambiguity and speaking with their tongues in their cheeks. The vagueness of Chinese expressions also violates one of the standards of interpretation—clarity, which may result in pragma-linguistic failures in communication. In addition, Chinese people usually use the pet phrase “[我会尽力...],” which can be translated into “I will do my best...”. In Chinese, this phrase has two connotations: One is to decline, and the other is for the sake of avoiding taking responsibility. It seems to imply that once they cannot finish task, they may easily find excuse. But in English, this phrase is a positive response, because “I will do my best” means “I will try to overcome difficulties to accomplish commission”.

**Trying to Avoid Socio-Linguistic Pragmatic Failures**

Socio-pragmatic failures refer to linguistic inappropriateness committed in communication due to the ignorance or neglect of difference in social and cultural background (HE, 1997). Socio-pragmatic failure results from different cultural norms and pragmatic principles that govern linguistic behaviors in different cultures. It is related to the status of communicators, communicative register, and familiarity to topic. In interpretation, socio-linguistic pragmatic failures are showed in the following aspects.
Interpreting polite formulas but neglecting cultural difference. With the evolution of culture, each language has its own polite formulas which are accepted through common practice. In oral communication, it is easy for interpreter to transfer this kind of polite formula into the target language if the interpreter is lack of two languages competences (see Examples 3-4).

Example (3) In opening ceremony of international academic conference, the key-note speaker usually concludes their ceremonial speech with the sentence “Interop the conference successfully”, “Ip a great success and wish you good health and a happy stay in (the name of city holding conference)”. Interpreters may not translate these words literally but replace them with English expressions, such as “I wish the conference a great success and wish you good health and a happy stay in…”.

Example (4) Chinese people often say some polite formulas to foreign guests, such as “I wish the conference a great success and wish you good health and a happy stay in…”.

Pragmatic failures committed due to the neglect of value. As far as some political phenomena and propagandas are concerned, we had better translate in details and make complementary or explanatory translation (see Examples 5-8).

Political terms. There are a lot of political terms which are abbreviated into simple phrases in utterances, because they are so frequently quoted that Chinese people are very familiar with their exact meaning. In the cross-cultural communication, interpreters should give expanded explanations to the political terms rather than translate their abbreviations.

Example (5) “Three represents” theory (The Party should always represent the development needs of China’s advanced social productive force, always represent the onward direction of china’s advanced culture, and always represent the fundamental interests of the largest member of the Chinese people).

Example (6) “Three emphases” education (to stress theoretical study, political awareness and good conduct).

Example (7) “Three direct links (mail, air, and shipping service and trade) and bilateral exchange.”

Propaganda. Propaganda is a typical cultural phenomenon with Chinese characteristics. Some propaganda cannot be translated into English according to their literary meaning (see Examples 9-11).

Example (9) “Go to work happily, and come back safely!”
Example (10) “_act as a good host, warm welcome guests”. This kind of interpretation will surely result in confusion and misunderstanding. We can simply express “you are warmly welcome”.

Example (11) “learn from civilized tourists! salute to civilized tourists!”. Any foreigner reading it will wonder that we foreign tourists are civilized, so are your domestic tourists barbarous. It is unnecessary to interpret this kind of propaganda.

Linguistic Comprehension—Contextual Appropriateness

Language should be uttered in a certain context. How to choose appropriate expression is decided by dynamic context or communicative situation. Context and topics involved in interpretations range widely from reception, ceremonial speech, tourism, business negotiation, conference address, publicity and presentation, to interview, cultural exchange and science report, etc. Different interpretation requires different expressions especially in style and genre. Interpreters must use appropriate language to match with topic and context. Diplomacy is an important part of state policy, so its language should be formal and appropriate. MEI (2000) gave the following diplomatic examples, each of which has two different translations (see Examples 12-14).

Example (12) “i’m very happy to have the chance to give a banquet to our distinguished srilanka guests.

a: A: I’m very happy to have the chance to give a banquet to our distinguished Sri Lanka guests.

b: B: It gives me great pleasure this evening to have the opportunity of hosting this banquet for our distinguished guests from Sri Lanka.

Example (13) “our guests, would you please find your seats and sit down.

a: A: Our guests, would you please find your seats and sit down.

b: B: Distinguished guests, you are kindly requested to take your seats.

Example (14) “we have not changed our view on this issue.

a: A: We have not changed our view on this issue.

b: B: On this issue, our position remains unchanged.

From these examples, we can find choices B are more appropriate and meet the requirements for formal diplomatic situation.

Linguistic comprehension is closely related to the consciousness of pragmatic differences. Pragmatic differences caused by Chinese and English cultural factors exist in the following aspects: number, color, time, idiomatic expression, value, etc. Interpreters should keep these differences in mind, and when necessary, make some adjustment to achieve pragmatic equivalence. The same image has different meaning in different culture. For instance, “she is a cat” does not say “_she is a cat _”. It means “_she is a cat _”. Here some specific examples are listed out in color and idiomatic expression.

The Pragmatic Difference in Color

Different nations have different preference for colors. Culture differences are also reflected in color. Interpreter should know those differences in order to facilitate his/her interpretation. Green is a taboo color in Brazil, so is yellow in Japan, red in Thailand, blue in Belgium, and black in Europe. Let us see Examples 15-17.
Example (15) “ౝ၉ ޣ ౝzy” cannot be interpreted to “blue dress, red tea, and blue jade”, but “black dress, black tea, and gray jade”.

Example (16) Since he was made manager, the company had been running in the black.
“In the black” means “ౝy”; “in the red” means “ౝz”.

Example (17) “ౝź౤඀़” cannot be interpreted into “yellow books and magazines”. It refers to pornographic, obscene, and vulgar books or magazines.

**Pragmatic Difference in Idiomatic Expression**

Because of its preciseness and vividness, idiomatic expressions are very common in both English and Chinese language. But even the same meaning can be conveyed by different expressions in both languages. We have to be flexible in the translation of the two languages. FENG (1997) listed some examples as followings (see Examples 18-20).

Example (18) ལঃ Batman is a detective. The Chinese “ౝz” is replaced by “horse” (ౝz) in the English idiom.

Example (19) ལঃ Rats eat rice. The Chinese “ౝz” is replaced by “goose” (ౝz) in the idiom.

Example (20) ལঃ No smoke without fire. The Chinese “ౝz” and “ౝź” are replace by “smoke” (ౝz) and “fire” (ౝź).

From these examples, we can see that it is very hard to find equivalent English idioms when translating Chinese idioms into English. We have to change some images to reach cultural equivalence. As an oral interpreter, he/she must have linguistic comprehension ability and rich knowledge on source language and target language in order to interpret fluently, correctly, and appropriately.

**Conclusions**

The job of an interpreter is to reproduce orally in another language what has just been said. In other words, it is oral translation on the spot. Undoubtedly, the requirement for interpreter is very strict. In addition to a good command of the source and target language, wide-ranging knowledge is indispensable, including the cross-cultural awareness and contextual knowledge. Interpreters should have some pragmatic knowledge and try to improve pragmatic ability, which will be conducive to the success of interpretation.

**References**

The Unspoken Rules: Relation Management in the Brazilian Culture Within a Context of Conciliation Hearings

Carolina Scali Abritta
Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

Since Goffman (1955, 1980), the cultural relativism has always been relevant to studies about face and facework. However, differences seem to exist in the investigative treatment given to these studies (Arundale, 2006, 2009). In this work, through interpretative and qualitative analysis, culture is seen as web of meanings (Geertz, 1989) and thus it is verified how this web is interactionally co-constructed during a conciliation hearing. It is also investigated how this network of meanings comes up in the speech data analyzed looking for the complainant’s faces constructed among the other participants. It was noticed that, when presenting the self, the complainant claims for the individual or the citizen’s face, showing that he/she is oriented by rules or laws. However, as face appears not only in masks, but also in mirrors offered by alterity, there were moments when the face of a favored person, in opposition to that one claimed of an individual with rights, was given to the complainant by the other participants. The face of a favored person confirms some anthropological theories about Brazil (DaMatta, 1980, 1986, 1997; Barbosa, 2006), which affirm that, on institutional practices, interpersonal relations are meant to be built in order to find a solution through favor and expedience.

Keywords: mediation, culture, face, role, favor

Introduction

Since the development of the Western concept of face (Goffman, 1955, 1980), especially considering how this notion was approached by Brown and Levinson (1987), much criticism has emerged from concerns about the cultural scope of this concept. Many have criticized the universal usage of the concept, believing it inapplicable on Eastern culture, for instance, especially because of the dependence between Goffman’s view of face and the Western North-American individualistic perspective (to quote an older example, Morisaki & Gudykunst, 1994; currently, Haugh, 2009).

Among those who criticize Goffman’s concept of face, there has recently been a great effort to regard face not only as a phenomenon depending on local and heterogeneous cultures (Bargiela-Chiappini, 2009), but also as an interactional and dynamic phenomenon (Haugh, 2009; Haugh & Bargiela-Chiapinni, 2010; Arundale, 2006, 2009, 2010).

This paper sets out to, first, based on Bargiela-Chiappini (2003), defend the possibility of viewing face (adopting Goffman’s perspective of face) as an interactional construct, mainly because “for Goffman, ‘facework’
has to do with self-presentation in social encounters, and although individual psychology matters, it is the interactional order that is the focus of Goffman’s study” (Bargiela-Chiappini, 2003, p. 1463). Then, it looks at the construction of faces during a particular social encounter: a conciliation hearing. The event herein analyzed is a real one; it took place in a Brazilian city, between Brazilian-Portuguese speakers. Therefore, we also aim to verify whether any peculiarities in the construction of face within this environment are related to situated and emerging cultural issues in local interactions.

**Brazilian Cultural Peculiarities and the Construction of Face**

In Brazil, anthropological theories (Holanda, 2007) suggest that there is an aversion to impersonality and to great social distance among Brazilians, even in the more formal institutional environments.

Anthropologist Roberto DaMatta (1980, 1986, 1997), after analyzing Louis Dumont’s (1983) categories of *individual* and *person*, has stated that in Brazil, both categories co-existed in a society that has proven to be eminently relational. In other words, according to DaMatta, Brazilians projected themselves as *individuals* in legal discourse, i.e., as equal beings, independent of others. However, in their daily practices, Brazilians would usually use their interpersonal relation networks in order to obtain privileged and personalized treatment—in some cases, acting beyond the law, and acting, then, as *persons*.

Ethnography studies show that cultural reality differs, for instance, from the North-American and Indian societies (DaMatta, 1980, 1997). For the former, the prior social value is equality among *individuals* (Barbosa, 2006, 2008); for the latter one, it is hierarchy among *persons* (DaMatta, 1980).

One way in which Brazilians use their relationship networks to establish privileges and personal hierarchies is through rituals such as “Do you know who you’re talking to” (DaMatta, 1980) and also through the use of “Jeitinho Brasileiro”1 (Barbosa, 2006). “Jeitinho” is understood as “a way or style of performing” (DaMatta, 1986, p. 99), a procedure used to transform an individual into a person (Barbosa, 2006), and thus, have them grant a favor or even an act of corruption, which could only be enabled through a relation that is marked by personalization.

In the hearing herein analyzed, one of our questions was whether, in this type of activity (formal and impersonal by nature), interactants—mediator, respondent, and complainant—would project the face of an *individual* to themselves and others, resorting to the law and seeking equality, or whether they would try to be recognized as *persons*, and making use of their interpersonal relation networks to establish a personal agreement.

While looking through the recorded and transcribed data (Sacks, Schegloff, & Jefferson, 1974) of this hearing, we wanted to verify whether the cultural elements described in those anthropological theories about Brazil—personalization, “jeitinho”, and favors—would, unlike what is observed in other societies, emerge sequentially in the interactants’ speeches, thus serving as a context for the understanding and construction of an interactional here and now, especially regarding the way in which people would try to be recognized and how they would recognize the other interactants.

Thus, for the purpose of this research, culture is understood as a context (Geertz, 1989), since culture adds meaning to interaction and can be reviewed in (and through) interaction.

Thus, the concept of context herein adopted resembles Goffman’s (1974) view of frame, which, according

---

1 “Jeitinho Brasileiro” (Brazilian expedience) is an expression which refers to a way of doing things getting around legal or moral obstacles, or to solve difficult situations through bypassing the system of norms and rules.
to Duranti and Goodwin (1992), involves “(1) a focal event; and (2) a field of action within which that event is embedded” (p. 3), and therefore, [it] helps to construct the meaning of that event.

Sequential Construction of Face in a Conciliation Hearing—Constructing the Face of an Individual to the Self and Allocating the Face of a Person to Another

Investigating the context of conciliation hearings, Silveira and Cunha (2010) found the existence of three distinct phases in this type of activity. These phases, established in terms of the main goals of the communicative event, would be, in ascending order: firstly, the legal framing of the complaint, which would involve the records of the facts provided by the complainant and the respondent; secondly, the allocation of responsibilities; and finally, the last phase would involve the conflict resolution.

This study aims to look for the faces that are co-constructed by interactants among the sequences which best represent the first and last phases of the conciliation hearing, especially with regard to the consumer/complainant, during the processes of: (1) presentation of the self (Spencer-Oatey, 2009); (2) ratification or threat of the face projected by the consumer/complainant and by others; and (3) projection of the consumer’s face made by the respondent and by the mediator.

This research is qualitative and interpretative (Denzin & Lincoln, 2008), and as previously mentioned, we attempted to base the analysis specifically on the sequential analysis of talk-in-interaction (Sacks et al., 1974).

Data Analysis

A Brief History of the Conciliation Hearing

The data herein used were generated in a real conciliation hearing that took place in a Brazilian city in the state of Minas Gerais. The hearing happened in a Special Consumer Court. All the people involved are Brazilian and speak Portuguese.

The legal issue concerns a mobile phone that had been purchased by the complainant and which stopped functioning properly after a month of use. Despite having taken the device for repair at an authorized service center many times, the mobile phone remained defective until the date of the hearing. The consumer then proposes an action against the product’s manufacturer in order to receive a replacement item or a refund subject to indexation. The respondent, a representative of the manufacturer, does not refuse to consider the consumer’s main request, i.e., to replace his malfunctioning mobile phone, but she will negotiate additional issues with the consumer, such as the one-year warranty required and the device color.

Sequential Analysis

Phase 1—Legal framing—projection of the face of individual. In the excerpt analyzed below, we attempted to observe the face claimed by consumer/complainant (Flavio) in his presentation of himself during his account of events. In this account, it can be observed that the consumer not only tells his version of the events experienced, but also simultaneously aims to build the legal framework of the situation, which would be the very communicative goal of this phase.

At this hearing, Cristina is the mediator, Maria and Antonio are representatives of the mobile phone’s manufacturer, and Roberto is the salesman who sold Flavio the product. The last three are, therefore, the respondents in this situation.
Excerpt 1—The face of individual—accomplishment of legal duties, legal framing of the situation is as follows.

Cristina

so let’s go.

então vamos lá.

(21.0)

Cristina

let’s begin?

vamos começar?

(1.5)

Flavio

well::I purchased this mobile phone, at tellmax on August the sixteenth of two thousand, in one month, two months of use it uhh:: started to:

malfunction, right? <peeling off> and:: the signal was going down to the

point of: dropping calls, and then I went to the tectronic store, which is a

Blookia authorized service center, and:: I left it for repair, right? it stayed

there for fifteen workdays, more or less.. I need a phone because- for two

reasons. Because I use the phone for work and because I’m from Bahia, I

need to talk to my relatives in Bahia and everything... and: >I need the

phone< right? and after two months using the phone it started to show these

problems and everything, I took it to tectronic, they told me they were

going to fix the phone, but a month after tectronic I started to have the same

problems again, right? and: it’s in here I put it here that five months after I

took it to tectronic I took it with the same problems to paracell, which is

another Blookia authorized center, and:: with the same problems. can you:

(1.5) it’s in here, right? ((pointing to case file)) the same problems it’s in

here underlined that it was repaired by one store? five months later it was

repaired by another authorized center, paracell.

é::eu adquiri esse telefone, na tellmax dia dezesseis do oito de dois mil, um
mês, dois meses de uso é::ele já começou a: dar problemas, né?

<descascado::do> e:: o sinal caindo de uma forma que: a ligação chega a
cair, e aí eu cheguei na tectrônica celular, que é uma autorizada da
dá conerto, né? ficou lá uns quinze dias úteis,
mais ou menos.. eu necessito de telefone porque- por dois motivos. Porque
eu trabalho com telefone e porque eu sou baiano, preciso falar com
familiares na bahia e tal. e: >necessito do telefone<né? e com dois meses
de uso o telefone começou a dar esses problemas e tal, levei na tectrônica,
disseram eles que iam consertar o telefone, só que um mês depois da
tectrônica começou novamente a dar os mesmos problemas, né? e: tá aqui
que eu coloquei aqui que cinco meses depois que eu coloquei na tectrônica eu
levi com os mesmos problemas na paracell, que é outra autorizada da
dá pra: (1.5) ta aqui, né? ((apontando o processo)) os mesmos problemas ta aí sublinhado que
consertou em uma? cinco meses depois consertou na outra, autorizada, que
foi a paracell.

(0.5)

Cristina

the first time you took it to?

a primeira vez o senhor levou na?

Flavio
tectronic store.
tectrônica celular.

Cristina
to tectronic=

Maria

=August twenty first, right?

=dia vinte e um de agosto, né?

Cristina

on the twelfth?:

dia doze:?

Flavio

[March] Twelve

doze [do três]

Cristina

[March?]?

[de março?]?

Flavio

yes.
isso.
In this excerpt, which is sequentially positioned at the beginning of the hearing, it is noted that the complainant (Flavio), right after being required by the mediator to start the hearing (line 34), self-selects to speak and starts his account of the events (lines 36-09). During his turn, Flavio seeks to be recognized, firstly, as someone who has purchased a defective product and, therefore, he claims the face of a consumer who has been wronged. This can be observed when, during his account, he says: “In one month, two months of use it uhh:: started to: malfunction, right? <peeling off> and:: the signal was going down to the point of: dropping calls” (lines 37-40).

However, the complainant does not settle for simply complaining about his defective mobile phone. Two noteworthy aspects account for the fact that this consumer/complainant projects a legal framing for the situation he finds himself in—and therefore wants to be recognized as an individual, i.e., as someone who knows the legal duties imposed on every citizen and who fulfills them. The Consumer Protection Code, in paragraph 1, article 18, provides that the manufacturer of the defective product is required to try to solve the problem within 30 days. The consumer seems to be guided by this rule when he emphasizes the accomplishment of the legal order because of the length of time that had passed and the number of chances the respondent had had the chance to solve the problem: “A month after tectronic I started to have the same problems again, right? and: it’s in here I put it here that five months after I took it to tectronic” (lines 50-02). Moreover, the consumer insists on keeping “((pointing to case file))”, as shown by the transcription note (line 06), and with this paralinguistic clue, he signals the fulfillment of his legal duties, claiming for himself the face of an individual—one who knows and fulfills his legal duties.

However, the complainant, Flavio, also shows that the damage he has suffered concerned not only the defective product itself, but also the feeling he experienced every time he needed the product but could not use it, because he had left his mobile phone to be repaired in authorized service centers (lines 43-47).

Since face is constructed not only through the way one says something, but also through what is said, in lines 43-47, the information provided by the consumer involves assumptions that help him construct the face of an individual, as mentioned above. In this excerpt, the consumer appears to be oriented to the rule of the law, in this case, Brazilian civil law, which requires compensation from whoever causes material and moral damages to another (art. 159, Brazilian Civil Code of 1916, effective at the time of data collection for this study—2001). The material damage can be characterized, for instance, by Flavio’s difficulty to exercise his work due to the damaging event. So he makes damages clear when, soon after mentioning that the mobile phone had been left for repair, he emphasizes how much he needs the device: “I need a phone because—for two reasons. Because I work over the phone” (lines 43-45).

Moreover, we can also assume that he is seeking compensation for the moral damages he has allegedly suffered, when he goes on to say that the unavailable device caused stress, “because I’m from Bahia, I need to talk
to my relatives in Bahia and everything… and: >I need the phone< right?” (lines 45-47).²

The complainant’s orientation to the rights granted by law is noteworthy in the selection of the information that makes up his account, thus providing a specific and favorable legal framing when he cites civil laws as well as consumer protection laws. In the construction of his report, the complainant claims for himself the recognition of the face of an individual, i.e., of one who knows his rights and whose conduct is oriented to one’s rights as a consumer and as a complainant who advocates in defense of his own rights.

The mediator’s subsequent speech (line 10) confirms the face of an individual claimed by the complainant, since she takes the turn to herself after the account is completed and asks about the first time the consumer took the mobile phone for repair. Note that by talking about the “first time”, the mediator legitimizes the idea of a series of repairs, that is, she draws attention to the fact that the consumer gave the manufacturer more than one opportunity to repair or replace the malfunctioning device, in accordance with the legal requirements of the Consumer Protection Code.

Furthermore, looking at the sequence of actions within this excerpt, the mediator requires specific information soon after the consumer points to the case file, which contains all the evidence of the numerous times the phone had been left for repair. She thus confirms, with her request, the face of individual claimed by the consumer, once she appears to know about the existence of evidence in the case file and about the possibility of the consumer providing details of his experience.

Thereby, through mutual support to the face claimed by the consumer, what takes place here is the co-construction of the face of an individual (DaMatta, 1980), i.e., of one who seeks to establish relations based on the equality granted by law, especially because both the complainant and the mediator are objectively oriented to the legal rules which favor the consumer’s version of the facts, and once passed, the rules would be equal for everyone.

Moreover, it is argued that the complainant also projects himself to this face of an individual when he seeks, during the concrete elaboration of his claim for compensation, nothing additional to what is granted by law (namely the Consumer Protection Code and the Civil Code) to every citizen. The following sequence, when the consumer/complainant is asked by the mediator (lines 25-26) to formulate his request for compensation, proves this point.

Excerpt 2—The face of an individual—the demand for the assurance of rights is as follows.

25 Cristina deixe eu ver aqui. então vamos ver o seguinte o senhor: entrou aqui no juizado pretendendo o quê?

26 Flavio eu pretendo ou a devolução do meu dinheiro com a correção monetária, né? ou a troca do meu celular num aparelho que seja bom, né? que pres:te.

² Some ethnographic information about the data: The data were recorded in a city in the state of Minas Gerais, which is far from the complainant’s home state, namely, Bahia. Thus, it can be understood that the complainant claims to have suffered moral damages, because without the phone he was not able to talk to his relatives and hear from them.
In the excerpt above, the consumer requires the compensation that is granted to him by consumer law and civil law, respectively from art. 18 of the Consumer Protection Code, he requests—“I want either a refund subject to indexation, right? or that my mobile phone is replaced” (lines 27-28), and from art. 159 of the Civil Code, he seeks compensation for—“the damages I suffered material and also moral, right?” (lines 35-36).

Here, his orientation to specific laws becomes even clearer, as does the claim for recognition as an individual, since the complainant seeks only to be reimbursed, a right that is granted by law to every citizen.

At this moment, however, the mediator does not explicitly align herself with the face projected by the consumer; instead, she simply follows the meeting’s agenda and passes the word to the respondents so that they can begin to state their case.

In this first phase of the hearing, then we can observe how the consumer presents himself—his construction of the face of an individual. This is apparent in the selection of information during his report and in the formulation of his request, when he orients himself to the law, which applies to all citizens and which, from his point of view, would apply to that particular situation. This face of an individual seems to meet the expectations of the parties in terms of a type of activity such as a hearing, in which the actions of the interactants and the faces co-constructed by them must be connected to the legal framing under discussion.

The next phase would be that of the allocation of responsibility, and in this particular case, this phase turns out to be a little shorter, since the respondent, representative of the mobile device manufacturer, voluntarily takes responsibility for replacing the device.

The consumer’s request concerns not only the replacement of the product, but also that the replacement device receives a warranty equal to that included in the previous contract of the original device (a one-year warranty), thus looking for a contractual interpretation which would favor him (as guaranteed by art. 47 of the Consumer Protection Code). However, the respondent offers only the three-month warranty required by art. 26, inc. II of the Consumer Protection Code. She also states that, in order to grant the one-year warranty, she would have to obtain permission from the manufacturer itself. Thus, we enter into a new phase of the hearing, the one in which the negotiation of the conflict of interest occurs.

In the case of a conciliation hearing, as previously mentioned, it is expected that, given the type of activity in question, the situation is framed as a discussion of rights or legal interpretations in order to reach a solution, a right granted by law to all citizens. However, because there are diverging legal interpretations involved in the situation, as is the case with the discussion about the warranty of the device, it appears that, in order to reach an agreement (the instrumental goal of the event), it may be necessary to deviate from the legal framing and use other mechanisms that could be found, for instance, in the typical set of the local culture, in order to avoid the degree of conflict involved in the divergence of legal opinions. In this situation, since the frame has changed, faces that differ from that of an individual could now be attributed to the consumer.
Phase 2—The negotiation of the conflict.

Excerpt 3—The face of a person who is the beneficiary of a favor versus the face of an individual is as follows.

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 01 | Maria  | =one year for him  
   |     | =um ano para ele  
| 02 | Flavio  | for me I’d accept this proposal if: uh:: in case I get this one year.  
| 03 | Cristina | pra mim eu aceitaria essa proposta se: é:: no caso conseguisse esse ano. |
| 04 | Cristina | one year  
   |     | esse ano  
| 05 | Flavio  | uh:: otherwise I’d prefer the refund=  
   |     | é:: sendi eu preferiria a devolução do dinheiro mesmo=  
| 06 | Cristina | Yes  
   |     | É  
| 07 | Flavio  | =and subject to indexation, it’d be more advantageous for me  
   |     | =e com correção monetária, pra mim seria mais vantagem  
| 09 | Cristina | so, let’s see the following, her proposal <of giving you a new device?, with  
   |     | a one-year warranty>? Uh: would you be satisfied with it?  
| 10 | Cristina | então, vamos ver o seguinte com o senhor, essa proposta dela <de te dar um aparelho novo?, com a garantia de um ano>? É: o senhor fica satisfeito?  
| 12 | Flavio  | I think that:: I’m not here to argue with Blokia nor with tellmax. I think I  
   |     | don’t want to gain anything from you I just want my right as a consumer to  
| 13 | Cristina | buy a device that::  
| 15 | Flavio  | eu acho que:: eu não tó aqui pra discutir com Bloquio nem com tellmax. eu  
   |     | acho que eu não quero nada em cima de vocês eu só quero o meu direito de  
   |     | consumidor de comprar um aparelho e::  
| 16 | Roberto | Exactly  
   |     | Exato  
| 17 | Flavio  | that is working properly=  
   |     | tá funcionando normalmente=  
| 18 | Cristina | =of course  
   |     | =lógico  
| 19 | Flavio  | so I’m not here to:: for me it’s great, if you replace my phone and give me a  
   |     | one-year warranty, if the phone works for me it’s excellent there’s no need  
| 20 | Cristina | for:: anything else=  
| 22 | Cristina | então eu não tó aqui pra:: pra mim tá ótimo, trocando meu telefone e me  
   |     | dando um ano de garantia, o telefone servindo pra mim tá excelente. não  
   |     | precisa de:: mais alguma coisa=  
| 23 | Cristina | =do you want: five, ten minutes to call Sao Paulo?  
| 24 | Maria  | =a senhora quer: uns cinco minutos, dez minutos para ligar pra Sao Paulo?  
| 25 | Cristina | >if you want I can make the call right now<. It’s just for::  
   |     | >quiser já ligo agora<. É só pra::  
| 26 | Cristina | great then, we’ll wait and we’ll make a customer happy::  
| 27 | Cristina | então ótimo. a gente fica aguardando e deixa um consumidor feliz::  
| 28 | Flavio  | Yes  
   |     | ó  
| 30 | Cristina | so if tomorrow there’s a new phone model will you buy a blokia again?  
| 31 | Cristina | aí amanhã se tiver um outro modelo o senhor compra de nova a bloquia?  
| 33 | Cristina | you have to promise [that’s right::!]  
   |     | tem que prometer [é isso ai::!]  
| 34 | Maria  | [you got:] you got another model coming out, huh?  
   |     | [vai lançar:] vai lançar mais um modelo, heim? ((rindo))  
| 36 | Cristina | there you go!  
   |     | aí ó!  
| 37 | Roberto | see?!  
   |     | ta vendo?!
In the excerpt above, as the mediator tries to resolve the issue of the disagreement over the new device’s warranty, she strategically chooses among three different actions that would meet her instrumental goal, which is to ensure the agreement between the parties.

The first of these actions (lines 09-10) is manifested when the mediator uses the resource of formulation (Garfinkel & Sacks, 1986) and she defines what a possible proposal of the respondent would be. In this proposal, the respondent would grant both requests, i.e., “a new device?, with a one-year warranty>”. If, however, on the one hand, the contents of the proposal formulated by the mediator would only meet the consumer’s requests; on the other hand, through the way it is formulated, the proposal might actually appeal to the respondent. The mediator uses the verb “to give” (line 09), thus defining the granting of the consumer’s requests as a donation from the respondent to the consumer. Therefore, the issue is no longer about complying with a legal obligation on the respondent’s part or enforcing consumer rights in general, but, rather about a specific and personalized proposal—what could be an act of kindness on the part of the respondent.

Right after completing the formulation of the proposal, the mediator asks the consumer a question seeking a compromise of acceptance from him (line 11). The mediator requires something from the consumer, and at the same time, reassures the respondent that the request he will have to grant is limited to the items that had been included in the formulation.

Within this new frame, where the law no longer emerges as a parameter for discussion, it can be inferred that personalization (a cultural trait described by anthropology as being typicalluy representative of Brazil) begins to appear. This is because the proposal, especially in the way it is formulated by the mediator, characterizes the agreement as a personalized act. It appears to be a solution especially devised for that consumer and granted by that specific respondent, i.e., a deal closed among people and no longer an indiscriminate fulfillment of legal guarantees granted to individuals in general.

This moment marks the start of the allocation of the face of a person who does favors (the benefactor) to the respondent, by the mediator, and especially the construction of the face of a person who is the beneficiary of a favor for the consumer.

The sequential reaction of the consumer to the mediator’s speech contains evidence of the possibility of his
inferring of the attempts to allocate the face of a beneficiary person to him: “I think I don’t want to gain anything from you I just want my right as a consumer” (lines 13-14). The complainant rejects the face of a beneficiary person and claims back the face of an individual, or that of a citizen, when he states that he only wants that which is granted by law, i.e., only the rights which are guaranteed by the regulations in place to all consumers. He does not want any special treatment granted to people because of their social network.

The following complainant’s turns of talk, in which he formulates his request in a specific and objective manner, contain more evidence of the face of an individual, with which he tries to resist the face of a beneficiary person the mediator had tried to allocate to him: “if you replace my phone and give me a one-year warranty, if the phone works for me it’s excellent” (lines 19-21). In the end, he also stresses that “there’s no need for:: anything else=” (lines 21-22), that is, what the law guarantees to everyone is enough for him.

In the sequence, the second action of the mediator is her answer to the consumer’s speech. She offers the respondent “five, ten minutes to call Sao Paulo?” (line 23) as a chance to speak to the manufacturer and obtain approval for the one-year warranty. Here, the mediator’s speech brings out the cultural frame of “jeitinho”, mainly because it gives the respondent the power to negotiate and deliberate with the manufacturer the one-year warranty sought by the consumer.

The hierarchy between the conflicting parties and the simultaneous frame of a favor (Abritta, 2007) is thus confirmed, reinforcing the face of a person who is the beneficiary of a favor, which the mediator had attempted to allocated to the consumer. This is because, once the warranty was obtained, it would come as a concession made by the manufacturer to that particular consumer, i.e., it would be a personalized deal and no longer something granted to every citizen by law.

The respondent quickly responds to the mediator’s request to call the manufacturer. The respondent says—“>if you want I can make the call right now<” (line 24)—and thus, when responding to the mediator’s request, she ratifies the higher hierarchical position in which the mediator had been placed, since the respondent accepts the decision-making power held by the mediator.

When the mediator constructs her reply concerning the respondent’s promptness, by saying that granting the request would “make a customer happy::” (lines 26-27), or when she asks the consumer if he would be satisfied, once again the mediator makes use of feelings to talk about the consumer’s condition instead of talking about the enforcement of his rights. Therefore, once the consumer is recognized as a beneficiary of a favor, the face someone who is happy and satisfied with what was given to him in that agreement is projected on him.

The last action of the mediator that supports this allocation of the face of a beneficiary person to the complainant comes, naturally, with the commitment of returning the favor he was receiving. After a pause of 1.3 minutes (line 29) in the interaction, the mediator takes the turn (line 30) and demands that the consumer states his commitment of loyalty (as a client) to the manufacturer’s brand: “so if tomorrow there’s a new phone model will you buy a blokia again?” (lines 30-31). This mediator’s request is reinforced by the explicit request of a commitment on the part of the consumer/complainant to return the favor: “you have to promise [that’s ri:ght::!]” (line 33). As defined by Mauss (1974), the favor granted should be returned and it may, therefore, come for a price. This would help guarantee the agreement, because it signals to the respondent that she also would benefit from the agreement, by gaining that customer’s loyalty.

Amidst these demands for returning the favor, in this short sequence, everyone laughs (line 32), including
the consumer himself. This may be an indication that all participants have framed the mediator’s request as a joke (Abritta, 2007).

The speech juxtaposed to the mediator’s request for a commitment of returning the favor (line 33) is from the respondent (lines 34-35). Since this speech overlaps with the mediator’s speech in order to announce the release of new products, it ratifies the face of someone who grants a favor, and therefore, the consumer’s face of someone who is indebted because of this favor. Furthermore, the respondent shows that what she is doing for the consumer is an act motivated by her interest in his loyalty to products of the manufacturer’s brand. As stated by Coelho (2002, 2006), exchanges of gifts and favors can be motivated by personal interest. At this point, there is a conflict with what had been stated by Mauss, since that author believes that a gift would always be selfless.

We should, however, notice the consumer’s silence as a response to the mediator’s request and to the respondent’s advertisement. Both this silence, which continues through the next eleven turns of talk, and the emergence of the consumer’s speech only in line 46 (when he changes the topic of conversation and recalls some news he had read), are actions that show this consumer’s resistance to accepting the face of a person who is the beneficiary of a favor, and consequently, of one who is indebted because of this favor.

In this final phase of the hearing, we can see the emergence of local contextual issues described by anthropology as being typical of the Brazilian culture, such as, personalization, “jeitinho”, and favors as “social navigation” tools (DaMatta, 1980). At this stage of the hearing, the face of a person who is the beneficiary of a favor, allocated to the consumer by the mediator, is apparent when she frames the benefits received by him as a personal deal, a solution achieved through “jeitinho brasileiro” by the respondent to grant that customer’s request, thereby doing him a favor. However, the complainant/consumer resists the allocation of this face with his words (when he clearly states that all he wants are his rights as a consumer) and with his silence (the non-answer before the mediator’s request for gratitude regarding what she considers to be a favor done by the respondent granting of the consumer’s requests).

Conclusions

Conciliation hearings are activity types (Levinson, 1992; Sarangi, 2000) in which the main institutional target is the agreement—a solution that would ideally meet the expectations of both litigants. Until this target is reached, however, the parties of the conflict should negotiate the points of disagreement among themselves.

As previously mentioned, Brazilian theories in anthropology state that, in Brazil, even in formal situations, such as conciliation hearings, there is room for Brazilians to draw not only on egalitarian standards, but also on their interpersonal relation networks, in order to reach their goals.

Thus, the faces constructed in conciliation hearings in Brazil would not always be associated with wanting recognition as an individual or as a citizen, i.e., a desire for equality, as observed in the United States of America (DaMatta, 1997; Barbosa, 2008). Instead, people might seek to be recognized for their relationship networks or actually happen to be recognized for that, by others. For that reason alone, relations between face and culture would be worth investigating.

In the hearing under investigation here, we could, firstly, observe the presence of the face of an individual in the process of face construction. The consumer, when he presented himself and defended his point of view, tried to claim the face of an individual, aiming to be recognized as an ordinary citizen (Canclini, 2006), i.e., an
individual seeking the enforcement of legal rights that apply equally to everyone. To support this face, the consumer/complainant tried to highlight, during his account, a range of information oriented to the law, which could possibly be relevant to this case. He proved to be someone who meets his legal duties and, when he formulated his request, he was careful not to ask for anything but that which is granted by consumer rights and civil laws to everyone.

However, face is an interactional construct and, therefore, a dynamic one. It depends on mutual support to be sustained and it could be threatened by others (Goffman, 1980). In the hearing under study, the mediator, although having initially aligned herself with the complainant, supporting the face of an individual, later (during the conflict resolution phase) tried to allocate to him the face of a beneficiary person, someone who is granted a favor.

The face of a person who is the beneficiary of a favor appeared mainly when the mediator bestowed upon the respondent the power of negotiating (finding a way out through “jeitinho”) directly with the mobile phone manufacturer so that the consumer’s request and the final agreement could be secured. By initiating this cultural frame, the mediator refrained from framing the consumer’s request as a particular dispute regarding legal interpretation and chose to define the situation as a personalized deal granted by that specific respondent to that specific consumer, i.e., as a favor—thereby allocating the face of a person who is the beneficiary of a favor to the consumer and the face of benefactor to the respondent.

Thus, we can observe that even in a speech activity supposedly governed by law, as is the case with the conciliation hearing, people are not always oriented to laws and principles granted equally to all citizens, and therefore are not always claiming or allocating to another the face of an individual or of a citizen. In trying to reach an agreement, they build a hybrid type of activity which includes, in addition to the legal frame, the cultural frame of personalization, “jeitinho”, and favors. Rights can then be travestied as favors, bringing out social hierarchies in order to secure an agreement. Consumers can be transformed, from individuals or citizens into people who benefit from favors, in order to have their requests granted. This ratifies that Brazilian society is a relational one, as anthropological studies previously mentioned have pointed out.

Moreover, citizenship in the Brazilian hearing herein analyzed, seems to be placed as a social attribute. It is not yet a role (Goffman, 1961), i.e., a category to which people orient themselves in social encounters (Lemert, 1997), but rather it is constituted as a quality that has to be claimed in order to be recognized and supported. Citizenship in Brazil is truly a face.

References
Abritta, C. S. (2007). From the frame of the “rights” to the frame of “favor”: Negotiating positions in conflict resolution at conciliation hearings (Do enquadre do “Direito” ao enquadre do “favor”: A negociação de posicionamentos na resolução de conflitos em audiências de conciliação) (Master’s dissertation, Departamento de Letras, Universidade Federal de Juiz de Fora, Juiz de Fora, MG, Brazil).


DaMatta, R. (1986). What makes Brasil, Brazil? (O que faz o Brasil, Brazil?). Rio de Janeiro: Rocco.


